

(Board Meeting 6/28/18)

The Port Authority of New York and New Jersey
Board Meeting Transcripts
June 28, 2018

[Board Chair K. O'Toole] The Board Meeting of the Port Authority of New York and New Jersey and its component units is now called to order. On June 7th, the Committee on Security met in Executive session. On June 14th, the Audit Committee and Committees on Finance met in Executive session. Earlier today, the Committees on Finance and Capital Planning, Execution and Asset Management met in public session. Their reports will be filed with the official minutes of today's Board Meeting. The Commissioners also met in Executive session early today to discuss matters involving public safety or law enforcement, matters involving on-going negotiations or reviews of contracts or proposals, matters related to personnel and personnel procedures, and matters related to the purchase, sale or lease of real estate property where disclosure would affect the value thereof or the public interest. I will now request that our Executive Director to provide his monthly report. Rick.

[R. Cotton] Thank you, Mr. Chairman. In this month's report, I'd like to touch briefly on four items. First, I want to report to the Board that our facilities continue handling operations at record levels, at our airports, JFK and Newark Liberty both set new first quarter passenger record. Stewart, more than doubled its volumes over the same period. But I'm particularly pleased to report that in the teeth of extensive construction and redevelopment, LaGuardia handled more than 2,530,000 passengers during the month of April, the highest passenger count on record for an April at LaGuardia. And this was the second month in a row that LaGuardia experienced record passenger volume. Passenger volume in February was also the highest passenger count for a February in LaGuardia's history. And I want to say we appreciate the public's patience during the construction period. And it's also important that I express appreciation for the hard work for everyone at all the airports in handling this record volume, the Port Authority staff, Port Authority Police Department, airline staff, airline contractors, airline subcontractors, as well as our federal partners. And as I express gratitude to our airport workers, I obviously take note of the many workers that are here today. And I want to say that we remain steadfast in recommending to the Board an amended minimum wage policy to provide higher minimum wages at all of our airports, and I will have more to say about the minimum wage policy in a moment. At our Staten Island bridges, a new one-day eastbound traffic record was set for the combined Staten Island bridges carrying traffic from New Jersey to Staten Island on June 17th. This new record of more than 113,600 vehicles was a substantial increase over the old record which was also set on last year's Father's Day, Sunday. With the additional lanes on the new Goethals Bridge now opened, the bridge has significantly expanded capacity to handle higher traffic volumes. At the Port Authority Bus Terminal in midtown Manhattan, we continue to experience record high volumes consistently approaching 262,000 trips per day on a peak weekday. At PATH, ridership in May of 2018 was higher than any May on record and was more than 2.5% higher than the same period in 2017. The months of April and January were similarly record-breaking. This underlines the need for the additional car purchases you are considering today. At the Port, volumes of the port set monthly records in both April and May, the port experienced more than 5% increases in both months, most strikingly rail volume for intermodal facilities was up by 20% over last year and has been above 50,000 containers for three consecutive months now. That is a major initiative and priority of the Port and obviously the Port

(Board Meeting 6/28/18)

is making significant progress. Turning to my second item, the LaGuardia AirTrain. On Monday, Governor Cuomo signed legislation which was passed last week by the New York State Legislature that will allow the Port Authority to consider certain attractive alignments for the LaGuardia AirTrain that required legislative authorization prior to the upcoming environmental review process. The Port Authority has already conducted numerous meetings with local elected officials and community groups regarding potential AirTrain routes. The environmental review process will now get underway to review a number of different potential alignments and full community input will continue to be a key part of the process going forward. With respect to the PATH item, which I referred to very briefly a moment ago, I want to note and support in particular PATH's request for this authorization to purchase an additional 22 railcars. These are crucial to meeting the rail system's capacity needs. PATH has experienced unprecedented growth in recent years leaving multiple lines at or near capacity during peak travel times. These cars are important to increase PATH's capacity particularly on the Newark to World Trade Center route over the next four years. Finally, I want to note the increasing focus we are placing on community outreach and establishing offices in communities that are affected by our major construction projects. We are establishing formal community outreach offices to engage with communities who are impacted by our major projects. Port Authority is committed to closely engaging with these local communities. Here's a brief update, with respect to the Port Authority Bus Terminal, we have identified a location near the 9th Avenue entrance to the Bus Terminal which will be the site of a new office which we are targeting an opening in mid-August. The agency will use the space to provide information on the coming Bus Terminal project and to receive input. It will also serve as a workforce development center supporting local residents. At JFK, the Port Authority will open a community office in Queens near to the airport to engage with that community. Expected to open in late July, the JFK Community Outreach office will be regularly staffed by managers hired from the community to ensure that engagement efforts continue robustly throughout the life of this project. At Newark Liberty Airport, we plan two community outreach offices, one in the city of Elizabeth, and the other in the city of Newark. These are being planned in consultation with the Mayors of each of these cities. The agency is planning to open these offices in August. In coordination with the Council on Airport Opportunity, each office will be staffed and will serve to engage with our host communities with respect to the coming terminal project at Newark. The offices will also focus on providing information about potential business and employment opportunities. Finally, at LaGuardia, in early June, we launched a mobile outreach office that will allow the agency to have a presence in all areas affected by the LaGuardia Redevelopment project and by the coming AirTrain project. Our community engagement efforts there include funding a scholarship program at Vaughan College for Queens' residents, and we are working in coordination with the Council on Airport Opportunity and with local community organizations to establish a career center that will connect local community residents with airport jobs including job placement services, career counseling, and skills training. We are committed to moving our community consultation process up the curve. Mr. Chairman, that concludes my report.

[Board Chair K. O'Toole] Thank you, Mr. Executive Director. Any comments or questions with regard to that report? Okay, moving along, now we'll turn our attention to the minimum wage proposal for LaGuardia, JFK, and Newark Liberty International Airports. The proposed policy which was published following our March 22nd meeting was posted for public comment for a 60-day period. We received 733 comments on the proposal. There was a staff recommendation

(Board Meeting 6/28/18)

before us to extend the comment period for another additional 30 days in light of the complexity of the issues that were raised during the public comment period and a desire to ensure that we get the policy right. This supplemental comment period will focus on four newly raised issues to allow the Commissioners to make a well-reasoned and completely informed determination as to all aspects of the complex minimum wage issue. The four issues are tipped wages, benefits offset, street pricing, and small businesses. These issues are potentially significant and painfully complex. They raise difficult questions that warrant careful consideration. More importantly, many of the issues that were raised during the final days of the public comment period, and this Board needs to get these issues right before we take our final action. Some of the issues that were raised recently, one of the unions representing many of the covered workers asked for a change to the policy to require wheelchair assistance and Skycaps get the minimum wage without allowing employers to take a tip credit. Employers have commented that not providing the benefits offset will result in reductions in health or other benefits or require layoffs. A trade organization representing the airlines communicated its "strong" opposition to the rules arguing the Port Authority lacks the legal authority to adopt the policy, asserting the authority is preempted by various federal and state statutes including the Airline Deregulation Act. Other commenters have questioned our Authority to regulate wages off of an airport property and at the FDA and FAA regulations preempt any power the Port Authority has to regulate off airport food preparation businesses. Speaking on behalf of the Commissioners, we are committed to getting this right. We have spent a lot of time talking about the minimum wage over the last few months. If you look back at history, the first time this was raised is April 23, 2014. The Board is about 42 times over those years. In 41 of those 42 meetings, we have dedicated time in public comment to this very important issue with the exception to last August which is a special meeting that we had for an election of the Chair. Every meeting has been dedicated over last four years talking about the minimum wage. I think this Board has acted very responsibly. There are these four issues that are complex. They deal with constitutional issues, preemption issues, federal and state statutes, federal regulations, and we want to make sure the decision that we embrace, and the resolution is very clear that we will have a determination made no later than the September Board Meeting that when we make that determination, this Board working with this staff that we get it and withstands all types of scrutiny, policy scrutiny, constitutional scrutiny, judicial scrutiny, we're going to get it right. We need an extra 30 days to solicit some more input and then a final determination will be made no later than the September Board Meeting. Mr. Executive Director, want to add your voice?

[R. Cotton] Oh, I just like to comment, Mr. Chairman, on the staff recommendation both the prior recommended policy and on the current recommendation to add an additional 30-day policy. And I would frame that by two foundation comments. First, the staff remains steadfast in recommending an amended minimum wage policy that will provide appropriate compensation and higher compensation to our highly valued airport workers. Second, the staff is completely committed to providing the Board with a solid legal record on which to base its decision. And in connection with that commitment to provide the Board with the strongest possible legal record, the staff undertook a full review of the comments submitted during the prior comment period and the staff identified the four significant issues that you have just discussed, Mr. Chairman. Our strong recommendation is that the Port Authority should, in the interest of a full record, allow stakeholders and the public to comment on these four issues in an additional 30-day period. The staff and the Board will then be in a strong position to establish a new minimum wage policy.

(Board Meeting 6/28/18)

We recognize that this additional procedural step causes some delay, but we believe this additional step is both prudent and necessary for the Board. And I would note for the Board that the last time a minimum wage policy was formally before the Board, that Board in 2014 and 2015 took the prudent step of having two comment periods, and that is precisely what we are recommending to the Board today.

[Board Chair K. O'Toole] Thank you, Mr. Executive Director. Any Commissioners want to have a comment or question? Okay, we will vote on this item after we hear from the public. Moving on to the next issue, we are going to recognize the actions of five Port Authority Tunnel & Bridge Agents and three Port Authority Police Officers at the Lincoln Tunnel who took action in administering life-saving measures for an individual, a New Jersey Transit passenger who was suffering some great medical distress. And I presume that the individuals, the eight have actually saved a life, and it is heartwarming, it is fascinating to see what the police and our agents do every single day providing service. This I would suggest is above and beyond the service we expect, but on behalf of all the residents of New York and New Jersey and all of our customers, we thank you for this incredible, incredible service. Rick.

[R. Cotton] So let me provide some details on truly lifesaving actions of the eight individuals who we recognize today. On Tuesday, June 5th of this year, 3 Port Authority Police Department Officers at the Lincoln Tunnel and five Tunnel & Bridge Agents worked together to resuscitate a passenger on a New Jersey Transit Bus who had suffered a cardiac arrest. Through their fast actions, the Lincoln Tunnel staff saved the passenger's life by reestablishing a pulse and restoring breathing. The details were that at approximately 4:25 in the afternoon of June 5th, the Lincoln Tunnel Communications Desk received a report of a cardiac emergency on Boarded New Jersey Transit Bus just outside the New York portal of the North Tube. Police Officer Nicholas Armenti was the first on the scene as he was on post, and the bus driver pulled over and waved the officer over to advise him that a passenger was in cardiac arrest. With the assistance of a Good Samaritan citizen on the bus, police officer Armenti removed the unconscious and non-breathing passenger from the bus. Within moments, his colleagues police officers Krystal Armenti and Kevin McGimpsey also arrived at the scene and the officers began CPR. The three officers all took turns administering CPR. Senior Tunnel & Bridge Agent Richard Hallquist with Tunnel & Bridge Agents Christopher Kerrigan, Anthony Natole, Ricardo Pachon, and Anthony Puleo responded to the scene and assisted in the continuing attempts to revive the passenger. Agents Kerrigan and Natole used an automated external defibrillator on the patient and initiated assistant ventilation with the bag-valve-mask. After the second application, the patient regained his pulse and breathing. New York City EMS arrived shortly thereafter and the passenger was transported to a local hospital. It was through these quick actions and training and true teamwork of these police officers and Tunnel & Bridge Agents that the patient was successfully brought back to life and is now recovering at the hospital.

[applause]

[Board Chair K. O'Toole] So, Rick and Vice Chair, if you want join me as we present. Police officer Krystal Armenti, congratulations.

[Vice Chair J. Lynford] Police officer Nicholas Armenti. Congratulations. Are you brothers?

(Board Meeting 6/28/18)

[N. Armenti] No.

[Board Chair K. O'Toole] Congratulations.

[Board Chair K. O'Toole] Christopher Kerrigan.

[Board Chair K. O'Toole] Congratulations.

[Vice Chair J. Lynford] Anthony Natole.

[Commissioner] Nicholas Natole.

[R. Cotton] Anthony Puleo.

[Board Chair K. O'Toole] Ricardo Pachon, thank you very much. Want to get quick shot, you want to come on up?

[applause] Okay. We've got few seats up here if people want to take some seats. Ryan Marie, come on, Briana. I brought my daughter here today for a couple of reasons. I couldn't find a babysitter for my 18-year-old, so she had come to work and her friend Briana who are working with me in my law firm over the summer. And I thought today would be an appropriate day for my daughter and her friend, her blood sister since grammar school to come and see someone who has worked her entire life for the Port Authority who after 40 years is calling it quits, and somebody who has been a role model for all of our children, and I will say in context, I've been on this Board for a year now and served as the Chair for about 10 months, and I've worked virtually every day with Karen, Secretary, does not want to be called clerk to this Board. And I've worked over the last 30 years with many thousands of public employees and several hundred private employees, and she is just extraordinary in every sense of the word. A couple weeks ago, I got a phone call, a text actually from Karen, so she had to come see me in the law firm. And when you get text like saying you have to see you first thing in the morning you get a little concerned that the sense of urgency. So she came to my office, and she came very early and she said, "I want to tell you something." I said, "Yes." She said, "I'm retiring." And it just kind of takes your breath away, someone who has dedicated her entire life, when I say 40 years. She is very much an institution here. And I just asked her why, and she said, "It's time." We have her mom here, her son, her daughter here, and she wants to spend more time with them, and I presume the husband and a few other relatives. And something she said to me which I found to be extraordinary because Karen has been through all of the good times and bad times, the turbulent times here at the Port, and she said, "Things are really quiet and working out now." She says what this Board is doing with this Executive Director and this team in place, she said, "There is never going to be a better time." I thought that spoke volumes not only of Karen and her integrity, her experience, and her vantage point but also talked about the state of being where we are in the Port Authority. So when an extraordinary woman or person is going to leave after doing extraordinary things, I think it is incumbent upon the employer to show some of the extraordinary things back. So to that end, the Port Authority has a longstanding history of honoring distinguished and exceptional employees with an award. Now she may or may not

(Board Meeting 6/28/18)

know this is coming, but in March of 1957, the Board established an award, the Howard Coleman Award, distinguished service medal, the highest civilian award given by the Port Authority honoring of Former Chair Howard Coleman, this award is given to the Port Authority employees who perform the most outstanding service to the Port Authority and the region. Today, I would ask to this Board in of rare and almost unprecedented fashion bestow this prestigious award to Karen E. Eastman, the Secretary to Board of the Port Authority for her exemplary service that she has provided to his agency, her integrity, her dedication to a career as a public servant which has only served to benefit the Port Authority that serves this region, very important region. As many of you know, this will be Karen's last Board Meeting and she'll be retiring tomorrow. And after 40 years of Port Authority service over 16 which she served as our Corporate Officer and Secretary, she's a career public servant, she started, and I could say this now, 1978, I had just concluded my eighth grade, and I remember. And many say she's an institution and they say it lovingly, respectfully, glowingly. And, Karen, you are an institution and that's how we all feel about you. I've only known you for a year, I feel in many ways I've known you for my entire life because you represent the very best of who we are as human beings and the very best of who we are as public servants. They just don't make them like you anymore, and we are so fortunate to have you and have had you and we will rely upon you going forward. And while we are happy for you, Karen, and we have seen your dedication and loyalty, you know, it's going to be hard to replace you, and we have Linda is going to be the acting, she's here, Linda Handel, and we're going to have Jim as the Deputies in the acting, the two of them, and I say it respectfully, and they have said it to me and to Rick, both of them together couldn't possibly fill your shoes. And I mean that. So it is with great resignation but also some happiness that I say to you, "Job well done." Congratulations, and we ask for a motion that she be awarded the Coleman.

[Commissioners] So moved.

[Board Chair K. O'Toole] Second.

[Commissioners] Second.

[Board Chair K. O'Toole] All those in favor.

[Commissioners] Aye.

[Board Chair K. O'Toole] Congratulations.

[applause]

[Board Chair K. O'Toole] What we'd like to do is we're going to give the award, I'd ask the entire Board come down with, our Executive Director as well, besides the Coleman Award, you're also getting a very fancy resolution that your staff had signed by all of us today. And also we have a plaque that has been designed by staff with all of our names going to you on behalf of the Board, the Executive Director, and all the folks that you have served so well for the last 40 years. You can hold this. If everyone can join us down below that would be great.

(Board Meeting 6/28/18)

[Vice Chair J. Lynford] You should hold this.

[K. Eastman] Thank you.

[Vice Chair J. Lynford] We'll come down there.

[Board Chair K. O'Toole] On behalf of the Board, we present to you Coleman Medal, distinguished medal unprecedented for a secretary clerk, 40 years.

[Board Chair K. O'Toole] So again, a group photo.

[Board Chair K. O'Toole] Thank you.

[Board Chair K. O'Toole] Congratulations.

[applause]

[K. Eastman] Thanks so much.

[Vice Chair J. Lynford] I'll hug you after.

[Board Chair K. O'Toole] Before we hear from Karen, we have any of Board members and the Vice Chair who'd like to say a few words? Vice Chair.

[Vice Chair J. Lynford] I've had the privilege of working with Karen for only seven years since 2011. And I have witnessed over that time her, Personally, I've noticed her dedication, her tireless efforts, and most importantly, her thoughtful cooperation with all those she works with. I asked for some specific information this morning, I'd like to share with everyone here. Karen has served with 91 of the 153 Commissioners who ever served on the Port Authority Board, that's 60% which I think is an incredible statistic. She served with 10 Chairs, 8 Vice Chairs, and 12 Executive Directors out of 14. That is clearly a record that will never be surpassed, so very good. And we want to thank you for being a superb role model. We will miss you, but with our police force, we know where to find you. Thank you.

[Board Chair K. O'Toole] Any other comments or questions or statements? Dan?

[Comm. D. Horwitz] Chairman, I just want to say Karen that 40 years of public service is just extraordinary. And I just want to say very briefly that, you know, in these days which are somewhat turbulent and somewhat trying, I think it's really important for the public to understand what your career means in terms of giving to the public, 40 years is an extraordinary accomplishment. Now I've only worked with you for a year, it's been tremendous, and I'd die to get the time that we spent together, so congratulations.

[Board Chair K. O'Toole] Thank you. Mr. Executive Director.

[R. Cotton] Mr. Chairman, I worked now, Karen, with you for ten months, appreciate all the

(Board Meeting 6/28/18)

support that you've provided to me, and I've watched you work, I think the sentiment I would like to express is truly on behalf of your colleagues who without an exception have... Every time I've talked to them have expressed enormous appreciation for the collegial cooperative, supportive, detailed attention that you've provided to matters that are coming to the Board and that you wind up working with all elements of the organization, you have really been an example.

[Board Chair K. O'Toole] Thank you.

[Board Chair K. O'Toole] Yes, Ray.

[Comm. R. Pocino] Yes. I would. It has been. I don't mean oldest year-wise.

[Comm. R. Pocino] But I've been here the longest, 16 years ago, when I first met Karen when I became a Commissioner, she then was like 24 years, well, that's a long time. So now here it is 40. And, Karen, I just want to say thank you for all the things that you've helped me with, in terms of my duties and the due diligence here as the Port Authority, and I agree with all the comments that were made by everyone on this Board, so good luck to you, good health, and a long life. Thank you.

[Board Chair K. O'Toole] Thank you, Ray. Anybody else? Okay, moving along, we'll now provide an opportunity for members of the public to comment on Port Authority matters, this public comment period which may be limit to 30 minutes in total provides an opportunity for members of the public to present their views directly to the Board but does not provide for a dialogue. Members of the public wishing to be discuss a specific matter with the Port Authority staff are advised to contact our Public Affairs Department, and speakers are asked to comply with the fixed time today of two minutes. Mr. Weissman.

[N. Weissman] Chairman O'Toole, Director Rick Cotton, Commissioners, good afternoon. You have copies of extended remarks. Everyone likes praise to be told that others like you and agree with what you're doing, by the same token no one likes to be scolded or told that they're doing wrong, both apply to the Port Authority's plans for the GWB paths. Apparently the agency feared its plans wouldn't survive scrutiny because it never subjected them to disclosure and feedback normally accorded high use transportation projects. The sessions you did hold were for select audiences, scripted to omit critical data, and stage managed to preempt criticism and the voicing of alternative narratives. Whether through lack of funding, inadequate process or both, the result is so compromised that the \$180 million you say will be spent will be wasted. All users will have to walk and the opportunity to expand Trans-Hudson capacity will be lost for generations. In May, in one of the series of endorsements that the agency has used to defend its plans, the heads of three organizations laddered the agency with the plaque. They did so despite their own past statements, constituents' objections, and their organization's official positions. In 2013, New Jersey bike walk haul for paths were 20 times their current capacity. In 2013 and in 2016, New York Cycle Club's Board called for paths compliant with national standards and so of its ten of its past presidents. In November, transportation alternatives joined a chorus of supporters and allies and added AASHTO-compliant GWB paths to its list of regional transport infrastructure recommendations. Well, the agency basks and praise, it ignores the honest criticism of hundreds

(Board Meeting 6/28/18)

of organizations' communities comprising millions of residents invest to a proper safe and long live facility. On the other hand, if the agency gets this path thing right, a plaque with all their names would stretch across the room. Thank you.

[Board Chair K. O'Toole] Thank you. Carlos Cesar. I may have not gotten the name correctly. Are you Justin?

[Justin Pascone] Yes.

[Board Chair K. O'Toole] Come on, you're next.

[Justin Pascone] Good afternoon, my name is Justin Pascone, and I'm the Director of Policy and Research for the New York Building Congress. Thank you for allowing me the time to speak this afternoon on the Port Authority's vital proposal to build a new rail connection to LaGuardia Airport. The Building Congress is a nearly 100-year old organization working to encourage the growth and success of New York City's building industry and the vibrancy of the city at large. We represent more than 550 constituent organizations employing over a quarter million professionals and trades people. The Building Congress probably supports the Port Authority's transformative proposal to build the LaGuardia AirTrain. As New York's population and tourism industry continues to grow, getting to and from the region's airports is one of the most crucial economic and infrastructure challenges. Traffic congestion is crippling our commercial districts impacting every corner of our city. New York's need for new and better options for public transportation, particularly given the rapid pace of development and the negative impact poor transportation options have on our economy notably for businesses and leisure travel. A new report from the Building Congress demonstrates that while the number of visitors to New York City has swelled to 62 million people in 2017 estimate investments in New York City's infrastructure fell to keep pace. One of our key recommendations from that report is to improve access to transportation and includes building a direct link to the LaGuardia. Dedicated airport, rail service has worked in Newark and JFK and has shifted millions of travelers and employees off roadways and onto trains that have delivered them directly to the terminal. We believe now is the time to act, and we congratulate the Port Authority on this initiative and look forward to working with you to make this rail link a reality.

[Justin Pascone] Thank you.

[Board Chair K. O'Toole] Thank you, Justin. Next one is Murray Bodin, but I think he's out of state. Murray, not here. Patrick Jane. Next one up is Rafael Ortega after Patrick, and then Beverly Thompson.

[Patrick Jean] Good afternoon, Commissioners. My name is Patrick Jane, and I work as a driver for Sky Chefs at JFK in an airline catering industry. I'm here to support the \$19 minimum wage increase. The increase to \$19 would allow me to create real changes in my life that will keep me from living from paycheck to paycheck, it will make it much more likely that I'll stay in the airport and build a long-term career at JFK. I want to thank the Port Authority for recognizing the importance of the airline catering workers for including us in the new policy, but I have to wonder when we will finally get the increase, our families are counting on this raise. How long

(Board Meeting 6/28/18)

do we have to wait? Thank you.

[Patrick Jean] Have a great day.

[Board Chair K. O'Toole] Thank you. Rafael Ortega followed by Beverly Thompson.

[applause]

[Rafael Ortega] My name is Rafael Ortega, I work at Gate Gourmet. I work at Newark. I want to thank the Port Authority for including us, I like the catering, the working, in the new wage policy. The workers there are very important to the airport. Our work results in more timely flights and a more secure airport. And so they will reap benefits from the policy.

[Rafael Ortega] Thank you very much.

[Board Chair K. O'Toole] Thank you very much. Beverly Thompson followed by Henry Pacheco. Terrific.

[Beverly Thompson] Good morning, Commissioners. My name is Beverly Thompson. I work for OTG management. From many years, OTG is a concession company that operates on. Excuse me, operates all of the foods and beverages in Newark Terminal C. I'm here today in support of the \$19 an hour minimum wage. For all airport workers, speaking as someone who has worked at Newark, it's great to hear that the Port Authority is finally creating a constant wage across all the airports and making sure Newark airport workers will soon be making the similar wages as workers at LaGuardia and JFK. But when will it happen? I have personally been coming to this meeting for years. Right now, I'm kind of on upset side because it don't seem like you all getting ready to give us the wages that we were promised, but I have one thing to say, this is my granddaughter, she's special need, and we do need the wages, the \$19, and one more thing, the Word of God says, "You have not, because you ask not." We're asking.

[Board Chair K. O'Toole] Thank you.

[applause] Henry Pacheco. Followed by Lindell Lawrence.

[Henry Pacheco] Hello, good afternoon. My name is Henry Pacheco. I work at JFK Airport for OTG as a receiver in the warehouse. I worked at the airport for five years. I'm here to support the new wage policy for airport workers. Hundreds of airport workers joined me in submitting comments in support of the wage policy. This shows you how much this will mean to the people of New York and New Jersey who rely on the airport job to support themselves and their families. This new policy will benefit individuals, our families, our communities, and New York and New Jersey's Airports. We appreciate the support of the Commissioners in passing the initial resolution. But it's time for it to happen. Please enact this policy as soon as possible. Thank you.

[Board Chair K. O'Toole] Thank you. Lindell Lawrence.

[applause] Followed by Fernando Garcia.

(Board Meeting 6/28/18)

[Lindell Lawrence] Good afternoon. My name is Lindell Lawrence, and I work at United Airlines Catering Operations at Newark airport for three and a half years. I currently make \$16 an hour. I'm a driver which means I drive a lift truck to deliver meals to United Airplanes. I also unload and dispose the waste from international flights. My job is highly important. If we don't cater planes, the planes don't take off. Yet for a long time, our coworkers and I have been left behind. I live with my mother in the small apartment in Elizabeth, New Jersey. What we rent is almost half my mom's fee. When you add the other basic expenses, I don't have much left. So even though I work for airline that makes billions in profits, I can't save for a vacation or education, for a lot of workers at United Catering and that means they either juggle two jobs or they're always on the lookout for something that pays better. And that means they're tired or distracted at work. And that makes everybody's job harder, and it means the airport doesn't run as smoothly as it should. I'm proud that, as workers, we all have come together and fought for this new policy, but we were expecting here today to celebrate a major step forward for the airports and for airport workers, and still we find out there's a delay. I don't know what is going on, but we need you to pass this policy now, and we can't wait any longer. Thank you.

[Board Chair K. O'Toole] Fernando Garcia followed by Ashley Asie.

[Fernando Garcia] Good afternoon, my name is Fernando Garcia. I work at Newark airport as a driver for United Airlines Catering Operations, where we have workers over 40 countries from around the world. I have worked for 11 years. I make \$16, \$17 per hour. Driver like me, we have a lot of responsibility. When we leave the catering kitchen we have to solve any problem that comes up. We work with flight crew to make sure they have everything they need. We must all be on time so flights can takeoff. We must operate trucks softly to ensure the security of the airport. Independent and experience is very important in my job. For us catering worker who worked directly for United, the new minimum wage policy will be a lot benefit not just because we will be able to support our family but also because we have more experienced workers in airport in Newark. But we need this to happen now. We have been pushing for this for too long and cannot wait any longer. We urge to pass this policy as soon as possible. We are counting on you. Today you'll write a line of history in the worker family when you approve the new raise. Today we need the opportunity, worker like me, to bring to my house more food, more security, more opportunity to my family. Remember, I count on you, we count on you. Thank you.

[Board Chair K. O'Toole] Thank you. Ashley.

[applause] Followed by Yocasta Reynoso.

[Ashley Asie] Good afternoon. Thank you for the time. My name's Ashley Asie, I work at OTG management in New York airport. I've been there for four years' now as a server and a bartender. Customer service is a very important part of my job and what I do in airport concessions. I take pride in my job. I take pride in what I do, and I know that it's a very important service that I provide every day and in an environment as stressful as the airport with so many moving parts, it is not always an easy thing to do. The \$19 wage policy will help us to provide better service. I'm pretty sure we all know when we're making money, we're happy. When we're happy, we work better for you, this will only benefit everyone. The policy, it just helps everyone all around. If the

(Board Meeting 6/28/18)

way we live our lives and what we need to move forward is not an important thing to move forward, it just becomes problematic. What we need is a better standard of life, a better way to move forward. And passing this \$19 policy is not the end all be all, but it's a good start. You know, I urge you to move forward pass this policy because as you see in history when you look back, people are always confused, how do they work like that? How did that work? Be on the right side of history, you know, pass this policy, show us that you care about what we're doing and how we're trying to move forward. It's only the right thing to do. Thank you.

[Board Chair K. O'Toole] Thank you. Yocasta.

[Yocasta Reynoso] Good afternoon, Commissioners. My name is Yocasta Reynoso, I am a Union Representative for a Local 1102 from the RWDSU. We represent almost over 1,000 employees on the Newark Airport and the JFK Airport. I know that the Port Authority has done the right thing by proposing the minimum wage increase and we understand there are some complications in putting this into effect. However, we waited long enough. How long more do we have to wait? I can't express how thankful all these workers were when they heard of the news of the new minimum increase. I am asking you on behalf of the other 1,000 workers that we represent, all these workers that work day and night on these 24 hours facility, preparing food in cold and hot kitchen for the airlines. We're asking that you expedite this approval of the new minimum increase by September 1, and we hope that you take this into consideration.

[Yocasta Reynoso] Thank you.

[Board Chair K. O'Toole] Thank You. Franz Vieux.

[applause] Thank you. Bella Ortiz. Tom Rowland. Followed by Felice Farber.

[Tom Rowland] Good afternoon, Commissioners. My name's Tom Roland, I'm the Secretary Treasurer of Local 1102 of the RWDSU. I'm also standing here before you, we bring us back about 3 months ago when you endorsed this \$19 wage, the impact that had in the shop was immediate. We have been following the turnover ratio of people leaving, coming, and leaving these positions, we've seen a slowdown with the idea of this \$19 per hour in wages coming into place, people are staying, people that were leaving are now staying. I know one of the concerns that you have that was brought up had to do with benefits being offset by the wages. We feel that that \$19 should be the minimum wage that the employees earn. And I know I speak for my brothers and sisters in the room, we will make ourselves available to discuss additional benefits on top of the \$19 any time you're available.

[Tom Rowland] Thank you.

[Board Chair K. O'Toole] Thank you. Felice Farber.

[applause] Followed by Joseph Dominiczak.

[Felice Farber] Good afternoon, I'm Felice Farber, Senior Director of Policy and External Affairs for the General Contractors Association of New York. We are grateful for the opportunity to be

(Board Meeting 6/28/18)

here today to lend our full support to the LaGuardia AirTrain proposal. It is certainly a project that is long overdue and one that is critically important to keeping our region economically competitive and environmentally sustainable. The GCA represents nearly 300 heavy civil contracting firms that have built virtually every piece of critical civil infrastructure in the New York and New Jersey metropolitan region for the past 110 years. These companies employ over 25,000 professional and union trade workers who construct and rehabilitate our roads, bridges, parks, schools, water and transit systems. Our members built the Port's Holland and Lincoln Tunnels, the Bayonne, Goethals Outerbridge crossing, GW Bridges, and even the hugely successful AirTrain project. Right now they and their subcontractors are busily working on the massive LaGuardia revisioning project and today all our members are looking forward to helping you make convenient transit access to the airport a reality. But it isn't worthy to note at this point and in the course of taking such terrific ideas and making them tangible, our member companies take on enormous tasks, they come with equally enormous risks, ones that are frequently overlooked when projects are finished and congratulations are passed out. But the reality is that taking a project from paper rendering or even a detailed blueprint to completion is a long and complicated road, determining actual build ability, hiring a highly skilled and qualified workforce, ensuring a safe working environment, sequencing construction elements, handling mammoth material logistics, securing interim financing, hiring subcontractors, and MWBEs, assuming extraordinary levels of liability, and working with the community, making payroll are things that we euphemistically refer to as turning concepts into concrete and all that and more is at the heart of what our members do each day. The bottom line is that our success is your success, and we very much look forward to working with you in the coming weeks and months to ensure that this project will achieve similar if not greater success than the JFK's AirTrain.

[Felice Farber] Thank you.

[Board Chair K. O'Toole] Thank you very much. Joseph Dominiczak.

[Joseph Dominiczak] Good afternoon. I'm Joseph Dominiczak, General President of the Railway Independent Transit Union. I'm here with my fellow labor leaders from PATH speaking on behalf of PATH's 1,000 represented employees. The employees' selfless dedication and hard work rebuilt and restore this railroad after the devastation of September 11th, after the furious Superstorm Sandy, after countless blizzards, nor'easters, and presently incompetent vendors that have disrupted PATH's service. PATH will be one of the very few railroads in a country that will meet the federal mandate to have positive train control installed and operational by the end of 2018. In July and August of 2017, PATH kept this region moving and because of our efforts, countless commuters avoided the Summer of Hell that was forecast during the major Penn Station track and signal repairs. I point out these accomplishments by our members not because you're unaware of them but to highlight the sacrifices it took to accomplish them. The long workdays, the weekends, and holidays away from families, seven-day work weeks became the norm because that's what it took to get the job done. Our members have always put the safe and reliable transportation of our customers first, but our members want to know when will they be recognized for the hard work and dedication. As you're aware they have been working for seven years without a contract, eight years without a raise. When will our members be able to stop trying to make ends meet on wages from 2010? We applauded this body when they passed a resolution to expedite the approval process, when the parties reach an agreement. Unfortunately,

(Board Meeting 6/28/18)

agreements on PATH are no closer to reality. In fact, negotiations have regressed since you passed that resolution. Another PATH union has entered mediation due to the lack of progress and four other unions have reached an impasse and are in the process of seeking release in a National Mediation Board. During these seven years of bargaining, a period in which PATH experienced unprecedented increase in ridership and revenue, this carrier has yet to put a contract proposal in writing to any of the 10 PATH unions. What they have put in writing are proposals to systematically dismantle our mental healthcare.

[Board Chair K. O'Toole] I'll summarize the rest there, sir.

[Joseph Dominiczak] Yes, I'll conclude by, it's our request to have a meeting with Chairman O'Toole and Executive Director Cotton. I know this request was denied on the Port Authority's side, but negotiations are nowhere near the same stage on the PATH side. So we request our follow up in an email to the Executive Director and we request a meeting on this.

[Board Chair K. O'Toole] Appreciate it, you'll get a response.

[Joseph Dominiczak] Thank you.

[Board Chair K. O'Toole] Thank you. Next one is Joseph Kellerman, 17 done, 17 to go.

[Joseph Kellerman] Good afternoon, my name is Josh Kellerman. I'm the Director of Public Policy for the Retail, Wholesale, and Department Store Union, RWDSU. We represent over 100,000 workers primarily in retail food processing and other low wage sectors including thousands of concessions and catering workers in New York City's airports through our affiliate Local 1102. I want to thank the Commissioners of the Port Authority for seeking to raise the wage for all airport workers, recognizing that it is not enough to just invest in our airport infrastructure, we must also invest in our workforce in order to build the first class airports that our city and our visitors deserve. I also want to express my disappointment that today will not be a celebration of that raise that these hard working airport employees were promised but rather a delay likely until late September of the vote. Our workers have already waited years for this raise, and honestly it feels like we need a victory right now given everything else that happened just this week if not this year in the last couple of years. Waiting several more months means several more months in which they cannot afford a medical bill or healthy food or rent and utilities. Waiting several more months means several more months in which we are not building the first class airport the visitors to our city expect and deserve. One way to assure that the commission moves forward on a clear timeline is by scheduling an ad hoc Board Meeting in August that would specifically be used to finalize this issue. We understand the need to get this right for the reasons stated today, but we also expect that there will be no further delays.

[Joseph Kellerman] Thank you.

[Board Chair K. O'Toole] Thank you. Ahmad Williams. Ahmad Williams followed by David Cotton.

[Ahmad Williams] Hello, my name is Ahmad Williams, and I'm a cabin cleaner at Newark

(Board Meeting 6/28/18)

International Airport. And I'm here on behalf of the 32BJ for the \$19 raise. I'm kind of new to this fight, but most of all what I've seen in my life can be posed to this very moment of the \$19 raise. Although I feel like today with a setback, I feel like you guys ultimately will make the right decision. I'm everywhere fighting on behalf for greater good for my city and the people around my city for great things. But I've seen a lot of things growing up in a city of Newark, but most of all I've seen working mothers work all their lives and not even have enough money to bury themselves or their children. I sing songs growing up that I wanted to pay my bills, that I wanted to pay my bills, but that's how we work for to pay our bills, not to live, not to be able to. I sing very few songs that said I want to go on a vacation after I retire. I sing very few songs that said I want to send my children to college with this money, this \$19 raise, I want to send my children to college. So I'm standing here today on a better life for my children. So with the \$19 raise, I want to send my children to college, I don't want to work all my life just to die, and I have to leave my children money to bury me or themselves. And with that being said, we work and we work, but I got to the airport and I've seen this one thing that the people had been there for a lifetime, they are so dedicated to this company. They make sure that the new people that come in don't betray this company. They make sure that you're on your toes day in and day out. And there's people that say they couldn't stand here when they told me that the raise was pushed back, it was like, "It's over." I said, "It's not," because I'm going to go and I'm going to speak on behalf of everybody that lost hope. So with that, I thank you for this time.

[Board Chair K. O'Toole] Thank you.

[applause] David Cotton. David Cotton followed by Andrea Bundi. Mr. Cotton.

[David Cotton] Good afternoon. My name is David Cotton. I'm the Chief Executive Officer of Flying Food Group, LLC which is airline catering company that has operations both at JFK and Newark Airports. Flying Food respectfully but strongly objects to the proposed minimum wage rule because of the impact that we are afraid is going to have on our employees even though I understand that the proposed rules are well intended. We provide meals and beverages catering services to airlines that fly out of both JFK and Newark Airports. None of our facilities are actually at the airport, but they're close to the airport. We have been able to pay our employees wages that we believe are fair but also reflects the economics of the airline catering business where the profits margins are very, very tight due in large part to the very aggressive competition that Flying Food group has from international catering companies that operate in United States, but they are headquartered outside the United States. Flying Food group is the only major catering company that is the United States owned and operated. Our base in Chicago, our headquarters is, but our primary operations are in the New York area, LA, and San Francisco areas. Flying Food group employees are approximately 1,350 employees at the JFK and Newark, 900 at JFK and 450 at Newark, 93% or 830 of our employees at JFK are from Queens and Brooklyn. They live in Queens and Brooklyn. Over 90% of our former employees are from either Newark or Elizabeth. Up to 80% of the jobs that we have, approximately 1,000 near JFK and Newark will very likely be eliminated if the wage rates are pushed up to the proposed level of \$19 an hour. The reason is because we will be forced to relocate, we'll have to outsource the meals that we have to low wage areas, it's not something we want to do, but the economic reality is that that's the only way that probably we're going to be able to maintain the service and the business that we have at the JFK and Newark Airports. Thank you.

(Board Meeting 6/28/18)

[Audience] Shame on you! Shame on you! Shame on you! Shame on you!

[Board Chair K. O'Toole] Let's have some. First of all, everybody is entitled to their opinion. We respect everybody's opinion. Let's treat everybody with some dignity and respect whether you agree or disagree. I ask that from everybody. We need to take a brief detour from the agenda to go to an item to vote so we don't have a quorum issue. I apologize for this. The next item authorized, the Port Authority continued participation as a member. I'm sorry, it's the. That's the first one. As a member of the TRANSCOM and not-for-profit coalition of regional transportation operations which includes Port Authority membership and TRANSCOM's Board of Trustees at an aggregate amount of approximately \$7 million inclusive of all membership and operations, maintenances for access to TRANSCOM systems which support regional mobility. Part of making a motion, I ask the Corporate Secretary to note any Commissioner recusals.

[K. Eastman] Commissioner Pocino has recused.

[Board Chair K. O'Toole] Any Commissioners have any questions or comments? Motion, please.

[Commissioners] So moved.

[Board Chair K. O'Toole] Second. Roll call, please.

[K. Eastman] Chairman O'Toole?

[Board Chair K. O'Toole] Yes.

[K. Eastman] Vice Chairman Lynford?

[Vice Chair J. Lynford] Yes.

[K. Eastman] Commissioner Bagger?

[Comm. R. Bagger] Yes.

[K. Eastman] Commissioner Eve?

[Comm. L. Eve] Yeah.

[K. Eastman] Commissioner Horwitz?

[Comm. D. Horwitz] Yes.

[K. Eastman] Commissioner McCabe?

[Comm. K. McCabe] Yes.

(Board Meeting 6/28/18)

[K. Eastman] Commissioner McDonald?

[Comm. G. McDonald] Yes.

[K. Eastman] Commissioner Pocino has recused.

[Board Chair K. O'Toole] Next item authorizes PATH continued. Peter, that's the next one we're doing?

[P. Simon] Yeah.

[Board Chair K. O'Toole] Participation of a member of TRANSCOM which includes PATH membership of TRANSCOM Board of Trustees, an aggregate amount of approximately one million inclusive of all membership and operations of maintenances and access to TRANSCOM systems which support regional mobility. Part of making a motion, I ask the Corporate Secretary to note any Commissioner recusals.

[K. Eastman] Commissioner Pocino has recused.

[Board Chair K. O'Toole] Recused?

[K. Eastman] Yeah.

[Board Chair K. O'Toole] Okay, any Commissioners have any comments or questions? Motion, please.

[Commissioners] So moved.

[Board Chair K. O'Toole] Second.

[Commissioners] Second.

[Board Chair K. O'Toole] Roll call, please.

[K. Eastman] Chairman O'Toole?

[Board Chair K. O'Toole] Yes.

[K. Eastman] Vice Chairman Lynford?

[Vice Chair J. Lynford] Yes.

[K. Eastman] Commissioner Bagger?

[Comm. R. Bagger] Yes.

(Board Meeting 6/28/18)

[K. Eastman] Commissioner Eve?

[Comm. L. Eve] Yes.

[K. Eastman] Commissioner Horwitz?

[Comm. D. Horwitz] Yes.

[K. Eastman] Commissioner McCabe?

[Comm. K. McCabe] Yes.

[K. Eastman] Commissioner McDonald?

[Comm. G. McDonald] Yes.

[K. Eastman] And Commissioner Pocino has recused.

[Board Chair K. O'Toole] Madam Secretary, there is only two we have to take care of? We're good? Okay. Get back to the public portion. I apologize for that detour, Andrea Bundy, please.

[Audience] Absent.

[Board Chair K. O'Toole] I'm sorry, Absent? Okay, thank you. Angie Parson. Angie. Come on up. Followed by Carol Corte.

[Angie Parson] Good afternoon, everyone. Hi, my name is Angie Parson. I'm a cleaner at JFK Airport. And I'm here to support the \$19 raise for everyone for Newark and New York workers. A little story about me, this is the end of the month. I've been at JFK for five years. The end of the month is hard for me because at the end of month, I have to work 80 hours in a 40 hour week to pay the rent. I thought it was going to be a victory, but as of today because of the push back, I have to work 81 hours this week. So I'm just asking you all to do the right thing, make it swift because we deserve it. My card says I'm a cleaner, but at the airport when I'm in those bathrooms, I'm more than a cleaner. Lost and found, childcare, I have children coming at. Their parents lose them because the children don't lose the parent, the parents lose them. I have to walk around with them, with those little scrap until I find a parent or a cop to put them in a right place. I have elderly people who can't wash their hands, I help them wash their hands, some soil on themselves, and yes, I help them because it's embarrassing if they go back out in the public. So like I said, my title says cleaner, but I'm more than a cleaner at JFK. God forbid, I don't have to be a police officer who have to sniff out a bomb and thing, bags do get left in there and then we have to turn into police officers. And that's just that we're not to put any police officer down but this is just that, you know, this is what we do all day there, we do a lot of jobs. And with all those jobs that we do, \$13, it's not worth, you know, it's horrible. I mean I'm pretty sure everybody in this room flies, everybody used the airport once in a while. And if there is no soap or tissue in that bathroom, it's a problem. So I thank you and let's just make this swift, please. Thank you.

(Board Meeting 6/28/18)

[Board Chair K. O'Toole] Thank you very much, Carol Corte. Brenda Wilson. After Brenda, there is a Raquel Leonol.

[Brenda Wilson] Good afternoon, Commissioners. I would like to know why there's a delay in our \$19 wage because I have so many bills to pay, every year the bills go up. That includes the water bill, electric bill, gas bill, life health insurance, food, transportation, rent, and much more, more.

[Brenda Wilson] Thank you very much.

[Board Chair K. O'Toole] Thank you very much. Raquel? Raquel?

[Translator] I'm going to translate for her.

[Board Chair K. O'Toole] Okay, fine.

[Translator] Good afternoon, my name is Raquel de Jesus, I work at JFK for 18 years. I'm very upset with the airlines because I see how their wages continue to increase and mine have stayed the same. I really hope you take all of this into consideration when you vote because I have to pay my bills, I have to pay for food, and I have to pay medication. Again, I'm asking you to please take this into consideration. I'm not upset with you, I'm upset with the airlines who have kept delaying this. Thank you very much.

[Board Chair K. O'Toole] Thank you. Donna Hampton? After Donna, we'll have Manuel Mendez.

[Donna Hampton] Good afternoon, Commissioners. My name is Donna Hampton. I'm the security officer at JFK for 12 years. I'd first like to thank you all for your hard work. It's so refreshing to see a new panel up there that's really listening to our stories of world. In support of the \$19 per hour, I also like to add on, we need healthcare, we'd also like to have the opportunity to get a pension, I know some workers have no paid vacation. Doing security work, you're on your feet for eight hours a day and you wear many different caps. I'd like to close with leaving opposing question. Where is it acceptable in these United States of America for a worker to give 20 years of service and still make \$8 an hour, while the highest paid CEO of an airline is raking in \$8,000 per hour? I'd like an answer to that. Donna Hampton] Thank you.

[Board Chair K. O'Toole] Thank you.

[applause]

[Board Chair K. O'Toole] Manuel Mendez? No? Okay, thank you for that. Jason Styles? Is Jason here? Followed by Maritza Collado.

[Jason Styles] Good evening, Commissioners. My name is Jason Styles. I'm from Brooklyn, New York. I work at JFK Airport, it's been actually two years now. Four years ago, I lost my wife to

(Board Meeting 6/28/18)

cancer, so I'm raising my son 10 years old by myself. This is hard. Excuse me, I'm a little nervous.

[Board Chair K. O'Toole] Don't be nervous.

[Jason Styles] It's hard raising my son because he used to play football, and ever since my wife lost her life, he was like, "Can I still play football?" And I was like, "I can't afford it." You know, like right now I have my son in down south to live with my grandfather, and he is 80 years old. And the reason I did that because I can't work and take care of him in summertime. We need this \$19 an hour. I've seen many workers working two jobs and don't have no place to live because some sleep on stairs, AirTrain. After this, I just hope that you all can see this and approve this that we all need it.

[Jason Styles] Thank you.

[Board Chair K. O'Toole] Thank you for your comments. Maritza Collado? Maritza? Followed by Desmond Grant.

[Maritza Collado] Good afternoon, my name is Maritza, I work really hard, I work at LaGuardia and I'm here also to ask for the \$19 an hour wage increase. This is important for me and my family and many families. At one point, I had to work two jobs to make ends meet and it was affecting my health. We deserve just pay, the airlines make a lot of money, they make more money than we do. They have the means to help me and to help my family, they charge for everything including for baggage fees, they should be able to help us and pay for this. I have two seconds. Basically we deserve to be paid justly. I'm a humble worker. We just deserve to be paid fair wages.

[Maritza Collado] Thank you.

[Board Chair K. O'Toole] Thank you. Thank you. Desmond Grant? Desmond Grant? Not here? Okay, Zakiyy Medina? Followed by Vladimir Cleurjune. Yes. How we doing?

[Zakiyy Medina] How are you doing, Commissioners? Good afternoon. Just want to start off saying that I don't have a lot of time but what I can tell you is that it's pretty obvious that a lot of workers here are very disappointed in the delay with their wages I don't know a lot about policies, but what I do know is that we have thousands of workers that are out here right now in support of the wage increase. Now it is true, these airlines make about billions of dollars every year, and without these workers here, representing themselves today, these airlines will not be functioning the way they do. So it is very important that we do get these wage increase because as you can see, these workers here, they have families, they have bills to pay, they have debt, many people will go to college and it's only fair that they get what they deserve. They work hard. I see them work hard. I work at the Newark Airport myself as a baggage handler, and it's very hard. I make \$10.45 to be honest with you. And go home to my grandmother and having to pay \$1,250 rent, that's terrible. Not only because the cost of living is going up but because the economy and inflation as well. So we have thousands of workers once again that's working hard 40, 80 hours, sometimes even more to pay their bills, take care of their children, and take care of

(Board Meeting 6/28/18)

their responsibilities, but yet they don't have the means to do that. So I believe it's up to you guys with the power to make that change happen. So that's all I have to say.

[Zakiyy Medina] Thank you very much.

[Board Chair K. O'Toole] Thank you very much.

[Board Chair K. O'Toole] Vladimir Cleurjune? Followed by Freddy Brioso.

[Vladimir Cleurjune] Good afternoon, Commissioners. I'd like to apologize in advance I'm a bit under weather. I was here last March when you guys announced a proposal for \$19 an hour, and it was a pretty big morale booster. I worked in the airport about 10 years, and up until about 2014, I think that was the first time, you know, airport workers had seen any major change. This is all in terms of wages. As long as this has been afforded to me, I've always had to do overtime, you know, just avoid bit living paycheck to paycheck. And, you know, \$19 an hour is important because it's going to help quell the high turnover rates and that's going to ensure that there's been a customer service provided, you know, by workers that are just more seasoned. You know, I know a lot of you gentlemen, lady, and everyone's had the opportunity to go to school, you know, that's something I've tried to do in the past and this is kind of hard to juggle at, and I work in full time. You know, bags have been dropped from LaGuardia and Queens borough, you know, and pursued at. And, you know, it's kind of odd, you know, as adult not making a salary that, you know, I guess reflects your age. It's kind of hard to be broke at 30. And I don't even have a car. You know, it's a difficult thing to deal with. And what I do is. All right, you know, I hope that you guys make the right decision. I know you get some blowbacks from airlines, but I hope you guys make a swift decision.

[Vladimir Cleurjune] Thank You.

[Board Chair K. O'Toole] Thank You. Freddy Brioso? Is Freddy here? And then one last, Charlene Talarico after that.

[Freddy Brioso] I've been working at JFK for more than 15 years. With the salary that does not allow us to really fully be able to support our families. It makes us sick as human beings when we can't fully afford rent or to pay for education for our children or for food. However, we know that the airlines have it in their power to charge whatever they'd like for their fares and to earn a significant amount of money. They have the Capital whereas the workers like me continue to be sick, continue to be upset about not being able to afford what we need to afford. We ask that you please take a position of justice here for the airport workers.

[Freddy Brioso] Thank you.

[Board Chair K. O'Toole] Thank you. Last speaker, Charlene Talarico?

[Charlene Talarico] Good afternoon. This is my ninth appearance before this Board since being assaulted by Diannae Ehler, now the Director of TB&T on August 4th, 2016. My previous appearances were in an effort to seek justice and assistance for the hostile abusive environment I

(Board Meeting 6/28/18)

was forced to endure at the Lincoln Tunnel, including the assault and injury I suffered at the hands of the then-general manager of the facility Diannae Ehler. No hardworking dedicated employee should ever have to endure what I experienced. I hope my continued pursuit of the truth and justice helps to ensure this never happens to another Port Authority employee. In March, shortly after the new initiative, it all rides on integrity was introduced. I shared many examples of my personal experiences during my pursuit of the truth where integrity was seriously lacking. Today, I'm here on a different mission. I want to thank Chairman O'Toole who was kind enough to show me courtesy and respect by meeting with me to discuss my situation. Without Chairman O'Toole, I believe I would have continued to be ignored. After meeting with Chairman O'Toole and Debra Torres, the Chief of Ethics and Compliance, I now think it's possible that things can change. I believe with the Chairman O'Toole, Executive Director Cotton, and Debra Torres working in unison, the initiative it all rides in integrity has a great chance of succeeding. I look forward to when it does. Chairman O'Toole, Mr. Cotton, Miss Torres, thank you for your efforts on my behalf and your efforts to have the Port Authority be the best it can be. I look forward to the solution, a solution that will allow us to move forward in a positive light and put this situation behind us. Thank you again, enjoy your day.

[Board Chair K. O'Toole] Thank you very much. We'll now proceed with the voting items before the Board today for consideration. Each of the respective Committee chairs will provide a brief report prior to the matter being considered. The first item for consideration is a resolution regarding the proposed airport minimum wage policy and staff recommendations to extend the public comment period for an additional 30 days and for the Board to take final action on the matter no later than September Board Meeting. Prior to making a motion, I would ask the Corporate Secretary to note any Commissioner recusals.

[K. Eastman] No recusals.

[Board Chair K. O'Toole] Any comments or questions from the Commissioners? Motion, please.

[Commissioners] So moved.

[Board Chair K. O'Toole] Second.

[Commissioners] Second.

[Board Chair K. O'Toole] Corporate Secretary for roll call.

[K. Eastman] Chairman O'Toole?

[Board Chair K. O'Toole] Yes.

[K. Eastman] Vice Chairman Lynford?

[Vice Chair J. Lynford] Yes.

[K. Eastman] Commissioner Bagger?

(Board Meeting 6/28/18)

[Comm. R. Bagger] Yes.

[K. Eastman] Commissioner Eve?

[Comm. L. Eve] Yeah.

[K. Eastman] Commissioner Horwitz?

[Comm. D. Horwitz] Yes.

[K. Eastman] Commissioner McDonald?

[Comm. G. McDonald] Yes.

[Board Chair K. O'Toole] Commissioner Pocino?

[Comm. R. Pocino] Yes.

[Board Chair K. O'Toole] Votes are in order, item is approved. As Chair of the Committee on Operations, I will now present for consideration an item that authorizes 5-year extension of a lease agreement with the New Jersey Transit bus operations for approximately 14 acres of property located in North Bergen New Jersey for use as Lincoln Tunnel park and ride lot. Under the terms of the extension, New Jersey Transit will pay the Port Authority \$4.8 million over the five-year term and continue to be responsible for operating and maintenance costs associated with the lot. Prior to making a motion, I ask the Corporate Secretary to note any Commissioner recusals.

[K. Eastman] No recusals.

[Board Chair K. O'Toole] Comments or questions from Commissioners? Motion, please.

[Commissioners] So moved.

[Board Chair K. O'Toole] Second.

[Commissioner] Second.

[Board Chair K. O'Toole] Roll call.

[K. Eastman] Chairman O'Toole?

[Board Chair K. O'Toole] Yes.

[K. Eastman] Vice Chairman Lynford?

(Board Meeting 6/28/18)

[Vice Chair J. Lynford] Yes.

[K. Eastman] Commissioner Bagger?

[Comm. R. Bagger] Yes.

[K. Eastman] Commissioner Eve?

[Comm. L. Eve] Yeah.

[K. Eastman] Commissioner Horwitz?

[Comm. D. Horwitz] Yes.

[K. Eastman] Commissioner McDonald?

[K. Eastman] Commissioner Pocino?

[Comm. R. Pocino] Yes.

[Comm. G. McDonald] I didn't say yes.

[Board Chair K. O'Toole] Yes.

[Board Chair K. O'Toole] Karen.

[K. Eastman] Yes.

[Board Chair K. O'Toole] Vice Chairman Lynford, as Chair of the Committee on Capital Planning, Execution and Asset Management and the World Trade Center Redevelopment subcommittee, you will now provide your report on certain items before the Board for consideration.

[Vice Chair J. Lynford] Thank you, Mr. Chairman. As Chair of the Committee on Capital Planning, Execution and Asset Management and the World Trade Center Redevelopment subcommittee, I will now report on five items under the respective Committees' purview. The first item which was discussed in Committee earlier today authorizes a \$52 million project to implement an open road cashless tolling system at the Outerbridge Crossing and the Goethals Bridge and upon implementation of cashless tolling due the practical impossibility of continuing the Port Authority Carpool Plan, directed discontinuation of that plan at the Outerbridge Crossing and Goethals Bridge. Prior to making a motion on this item, I would ask the Corporate Secretary to note any Commissioner recusals on this matter.

[K. Eastman] No recusals.

[Vice Chair J. Lynford] Thank you. Do any of the Commissioners have any questions or

(Board Meeting 6/28/18)

comments on this item? If not, I will request a motion on this item.

[Commissioners] Moved.

[Vice Chair J. Lynford] May I have a second?

[Commissioners] Second.

[Vice Chair J. Lynford] I will now request the Corporate Secretary to call the roll for voting on this item.

[K. Eastman] Chairman O'Toole?

[Board Chair K. O'Toole] Yes.

[K. Eastman] Vice Chairman Lynford?

[Vice Chair J. Lynford] Yes.

[K. Eastman] Commissioner Bagger?

[Comm. R. Bagger] Yes.

[K. Eastman] Commissioner Eve?

[Comm. L. Eve] Yes.

[K. Eastman] Commissioner Horwitz?

[Comm. D. Horwitz] Yes.

[K. Eastman] Commissioner McDonald?

[Comm. G. McDonald] Yes.

[K. Eastman] Commissioner Pocino?

[Comm. R. Pocino] Yes.

[Vice Chair J. Lynford] As the votes are in order, the item is approved. The next item, which was also discussed in Committee earlier today, authorizes the exercise of a contract option to purchase 22 new railcars for the PATH rail system from Kawasaki Rail Car. Under the negotiated agreement, Kawasaki will design, fabricate, test, and deliver the new railcars at a price of \$2,380,000 per railcar. This item also authorizes a \$1.1 million increase to an existing agreement with the joint venture of LTK Engineering Services/Parsons transportation group, professional management services in support of the project. The total project cost for this

(Board Meeting 6/28/18)

initiative is \$66 million including the aforementioned costs and agency allocations. Prior to making a motion on this item, I would ask the Corporate Secretary to note any Commissioner recusals on this matter.

[K. Eastman] No recusals.

[Vice Chair J. Lynford] Thank you. Do any of the Commissioners have any questions or comments on this item? I'll now request a motion, then a second on this time.

[Commissioners] Moved.

[Commissioners] Second.

[Vice Chair J. Lynford] I will now request the Corporate Secretary to call the roll for voting on this item.

[K. Eastman] Chairman O'Toole?

[Board Chair K. O'Toole] Yes.

[K. Eastman] Vice Chairman Lynford?

[Vice Chair J. Lynford] Yes.

[K. Eastman] Commissioner Bagger?

[Comm. R. Bagger] Yes.

[K. Eastman] Commissioner Eve?

[Comm. L. Eve] Yes.

[K. Eastman] Commissioner Horwitz?

[Comm. D. Horwitz] Yes.

[K. Eastman] Commissioner McDonald?

[Comm. G. McDonald] Yes.

[K. Eastman] Commissioner Pocino?

[Comm. R. Pocino] Yes.

[Vice Chair J. Lynford] As the votes are in order, the item is approved. The next item authorizes a \$68 million project to replace Superstorm Sandy damaged tracks and associated infrastructure

(Board Meeting 6/28/18)

and services at PATH's Newark to World Trade Center rail line. Prior to making a motion on this item, I would ask the Corporate Secretary to note any Commissioner recusals on this matter.

[K. Eastman] No recusals.

[Vice Chair J. Lynford] Thank you. Do any of the Commissioners have any questions or comments on this item? I'll now request a motion and a second.

[Commissioners] So moved.

[Commissioners] Second.

[Vice Chair J. Lynford] I will now request the Corporate Secretary to call the roll for voting on this item.

[K. Eastman] Chairman O'Toole?

[Board Chair K. O'Toole] Yes.

[K. Eastman] Vice Chairman Lynford?

[Vice Chair J. Lynford] Yes.

[K. Eastman] Commissioner Bagger?

[Comm. R. Bagger] Yes.

[K. Eastman] Commissioner Eve?

[Comm. L. Eve] Yes.

[K. Eastman] Commissioner Horwitz?

[Comm. D. Horwitz] Yes.

[K. Eastman] Commissioner McDonald?

[Comm. G. McDonald] Yes.

[K. Eastman] Commissioner Pocino?

[Comm. R. Pocino] Yes.

[Vice Chair J. Lynford] As the votes are in order, the item is approved. The next item authorizes the expenditure of \$1.4 million in planning to support the future rehabilitation of runway 4R/22L at Newark Liberty International Airport and to apply for passenger facility charge funding to

(Board Meeting 6/28/18)

cover eligible planning costs. Prior to making a motion on this item, I would ask the Corporate Secretary to note any Commissioner recusals on this matter?

[K. Eastman] No recusals.

[Vice Chair J. Lynford] Thank you. Do any of the Commissioners have any questions or comments on this item? I will now request a motion and second.

[Commissioners] Moved.

[Commissioners] Second.

[Vice Chair J. Lynford] I will now request the Corporate Secretary to call the roll for voting on this item.

[K. Eastman] Chairman O'Toole?

[Board Chair K. O'Toole] Yes.

[K. Eastman] Vice Chairman Lynford?

[Vice Chair J. Lynford] Yes.

[K. Eastman] Commissioner Bagger?

[Comm. R. Bagger] Yes.

[K. Eastman] Commissioner Eve?

[Comm. L. Eve] Yes.

[K. Eastman] Commissioner Horwitz?

[Comm. D. Horwitz] Yes.

[K. Eastman] Commissioner McDonald?

[Comm. G. McDonald] Yes.

[K. Eastman] Commissioner Pocino?

[Comm. R. Pocino] Yes.

[Vice Chair J. Lynford] As the votes are in order, this item is approved. The next item authorizes certain energy conservation improvements at the World Trade Center as part of the Port Authority's multi-facility guaranteed energy savings program at a maximum price of \$8 million.

(Board Meeting 6/28/18)

The cost of this program is fully offset by future energy savings. Prior to making a motion on this item, I would ask the Corporate Secretary to note any Commissioner recusals on this matter.

[K. Eastman] No recusals.

[Vice Chair J. Lynford] Thank you. Do any of the Commissioners have any questions or comments on this item? I will now request a motion and a second on this item.

[Commissioners] Moved.

[Commissioners] Second.

[Vice Chair J. Lynford] Thank you, I will now request the Corporate Secretary to call the roll for voting on this item.

[K. Eastman] Chairman O'Toole?

[Board Chair K. O'Toole] Yes.

[K. Eastman] Vice Chairman Lynford?

[Vice Chair J. Lynford] Yes.

[K. Eastman] Commissioner Bagger?

[Comm. R. Bagger] Yes.

[K. Eastman] Commissioner Eve?

[Comm. L. Eve] Yes.

[K. Eastman] Commissioner Horwitz?

[Comm. D. Horwitz] Yes.

[K. Eastman] Commissioner McDonald?

[Comm. G. McDonald] Yes.

[K. Eastman] Commissioner Pocino?

[Comm. R. Pocino] Yes.

[Vice Chair J. Lynford] As the votes are in order, the item is approved. And I turn it back to you, Mr. Chairman.

(Board Meeting 6/28/18)

[Board Chair K. O'Toole] Thank you very much, Commissioner Bagger, as Chair of the Committee on Finance, will now provide his report on items before the Board for consideration.

[Comm. R. Bagger] Great. Thank you, Mr. Chairman. As the Chair of the Committee on Finance, I wish to recommend a resolution for adoption concerning the Gateway Program. As you know, our 10-year Capital Plan includes \$2.7 billion for the Gateway Program and in October 2016, the Board authorized a Port Authority commitment to repay up to \$284 million in low cost federal loans relating to the replacement of the Portal North Bridge. In light of New Jersey Transit's increase in pledged appropriations to the Portal North Bridge project, the Port Authority's commitment for the Portal North Bridge is no longer required. So this resolution would reallocate the Port Authority's prior Portal North Bridge project commitment to the Hudson Tunnel Project. The 2.7 billion included in our 10-year Capital Plan that is relates to the Gateway Program support remains unchanged. So as a result of this resolution today, we are increasing, however, our commitment to the New Hudson Tunnel Project to \$2.7 billion. So to New Jersey Transit's actions on the Portal North Bridge in this resolution today relating to the Hudson Tunnel Project both financing plans will be strengthened. So this is very positive for the Gateway Program. Prior to making a motion, I would ask the Corporate Secretary to note any Commissioner recusals on this matter.

[K. Eastman] No recusals.

[Comm. R. Bagger] Any questions or comments from the Board?

[Commissioner] No.

[Comm. R. Bagger] May we have a motion?

[Commissioners] So moved.

[Comm. R. Bagger] Is there second?

[Commissioners] Second.

[Comm. R. Bagger] And roll call, please.

[K. Eastman] Chairman O'Toole?

[Board Chair K. O'Toole] Yes.

[K. Eastman] Vice Chairman Lynford?

[Vice Chair J. Lynford] Yes.

[K. Eastman] Commissioner Bagger?

[Comm. R. Bagger] Yes.

(Board Meeting 6/28/18)

[K. Eastman] Commissioner Eve?

[Comm. L. Eve] Yeah.

[K. Eastman] Commissioner Horwitz?

[Comm. D Horwitz] Yes.

[K. Eastman] Commissioner McDonald?

[Comm. G. McDonald] Yes.

[K. Eastman] Commissioner Pocino

[Comm. R. Pocino] Yes.

[Comm. R. Bagger] And that item is approved.

[Board Chair K. O'Toole] All finished?

[Comm. R. Bagger] Yeah.

[Board Chair K. O'Toole] Commissioner Horwitz as Vice Chair of the Audit Committee will now provide a report on the Audit Committee's consideration.

[Comm. D. Horwitz] Thank you, Mr. Chairman. As Vice Chair of the Audit Committee, I wish to recommend a resolution authorizing their attention of the agency's external auditors for 2018. This will be a vote of the Audit Committee members only. By way of background, KPMG LLP will select the 2011 on the basis of the competitive process which provided the subject to annual retention is determined by the Audit Committee, such services maybe extended through 2016. The agreement includes options, also includes options to extend such services for up to two additional one-year periods at the Port Authority's discretion. The Audit Committee consistent with its responsibilities under the By-Laws and its Committee charter and after due review of KPMG's qualifications and performance to date has determined to retain KPMG LLP as an independent auditor for the audit year ending, December 31, 2018. I also wish to know that with the 2018 audit engagement, certain nonfinancial statement based services that were previously provided by KPMG including contractually required audit services will be carved out of the contract. These services will now be competitively solicited for minority and women-owned business enterprises and further of the Port Authority's MWBE goals. Prior to making this motion on this item, I would ask the Secretary to note any Commissioner recusals on the matter.

[K. Eastman] No recusals.

[Comm. D. Horwitz] Do any Commissioners have any comments or questions? I will now request a motion from a Committee member who has not recused on this item.

(Board Meeting 6/28/18)

[Commissioners] So moved.

[Commissioners] Second.

[Comm. D. Horwitz] I will now request the Corporate Secretary to call the roll for the Committee members present for voting on the item.

[K. Eastman] Commissioner Horwitz?

[Comm. D. Horwitz] Yes.

[K. Eastman] Commissioner Bagger?

[Comm. R. Bagger] Yes.

[K. Eastman] Commissioner McDonald?

[Comm. G. McDonald] Yes.

[Comm. D. Horwitz] As the votes are in order, the item is approved.

[Board Chair K. O'Toole] No further business, motion to adjourn. Can I hear a second or favor?

[Commissioners] Second.

[Board Chair K. O'Toole] The meeting is adjourned. Thank you.