

(Board Meeting 9/28/17)

The Port Authority of New York and New Jersey
Board Meeting Transcripts
September 28, 2017

[Board Chair K. O'Toole] The Board Meeting of the Port Authority of New York and New Jersey and its component units is now called to order. The Committee on Finance met in Executive session on September 13th, 2017. In addition, earlier today, the Committee on Capital Planning, Execution and Asset Management met in public session. The Committees on Audit, Security and Finance met in Executive session. Their reports will be filed with the official minutes of today's Board Meeting. The Commissioners also met in executive earlier today to discuss matters involving ongoing negotiation or reviews of contracts or proposals and matters in which the release of information could impair our right to receive funds from the United States or other grantor. I would now call for a moment of silence in remembrance of the 16th Anniversary of the September 11 terrorist attacks on the World Trade Center and those who lost their lives on this terrible day, which included 84 friends and colleagues from the Port Authority. I'd also ask that we remember those who perished in the 1993 bombing of the World Trade Center. Thank you. I will now request our Executive Director Rick Cotton to provide his report. And after that, we'll have a number of initiatives for the Board's consideration. The first will provide for the development of a contractor and vendor past performance policy which Rick will provide an overview following his report. But let me just say Chairman's prerogative that I've worked alongside with Rick now for the better part of two months since August 3rd. I find him to be an extraordinary individual, amazingly dedicated, smart, principled, he is focused on getting our jobs on time, bringing efficiency, endorsing his global best practice which you'll hear quite a bit. I will tell you, the Board is very fortunate to have someone of Rick's caliber who has served enormous roles both in the public and private sector. And I am delighted to be working as his partner. Rick.

[R. Cotton] Thank you, Mr. Chairman, and I appreciate those comments. I want to begin by stressing the strong working relationship that we have developed over the last two months, and I do appreciate the spirit of partnership that you have brought to our work together. Over the past six weeks, you and I have together visited many of our facilities including our three major airports, the Port Authority Bus Terminal, PATH, our ports both in New Jersey and Brooklyn, and the George Washington Bridge, and the new George Washington Bridge Bus Terminal. Through these joint visits and many meetings and briefings, we have truly launched our partnership and gained valuable perspectives on the agency's operations. And very importantly, as our remarks indicate, we have attempted to convey from the outside to everyone inside and outside the agency our commitment to a culture of partnership and cooperation focused on getting things done. This is my first report to the Board and to the public as Executive Director. And because it is my first, it will be longer than what I would anticipate for subsequent reports, and I would ask indulgence. Before I turn to outlining my initial focal points as executive director, I want to call the Board's attention to several important recent developments at the agency that are truly worth noting. Earlier this month, the Port welcomed the largest cargo vessel to ever call on an East Coast port, the 14,400 TEU ship, The Theodore Roosevelt. This is the result of the Port Authority's forward looking \$1.6 billion investment to raise the roadway of the Bayonne Bridge to accommodate the larger container ships coming through the widened Panama Canal and keeping competitive our ports and with our ports the hundreds of thousands of regional jobs that they support. Two weeks ago, we announced an accelerated schedule to install a temporary pedestrian safety fence at the George Washington Bridge and South walkway. The fence is needed to end a tragic spate of suicides at the bridge, the installation began last week

(Board Meeting 9/28/17)

and will be completed on a rapid schedule by the end of this year. In addition, the Port Authority is responding to the hurricanes that gravely damaged other regions of the country. This week we have been readying a 70 plus person contingent of emergency management, aviation and port personnel, Port Authority Police Department and emergency management personnel to travel to Puerto Rico to assist in recovery efforts following the devastation from Hurricane Maria. An advance team departed early today. The rest of the deployment is scheduled to depart tomorrow. Earlier this month, the Office of Emergency Management sent a team of personnel to Texas and we'll be recognizing those personnel later this afternoon. Ten days ago, we announced John Bilich as the agency's new Chief Security Officer. John has been serving as Acting Chief Security Officer since the beginning of the year and we are pleased and proud to have promoted him. Given John's wide-ranging breadth of prior outside leadership experience in city and state police agencies and in leading prosecutorial office investigative units as well as his insider's understanding of the Port Authority, we could not imagine a better candidate. In August, at LaGuardia Airport, construction began on the Delta-led Redevelopment of the Eastern side of the airport. Together with the construction already underway at the western end of LaGuardia, the Port is literally now overseeing an active \$8 billion construction project of an entirely new world-class airport at LaGuardia top to bottom, soup to nuts. Our investments have leveraged a total amount of private sector, non-Port Authority capital of approximately \$6 billion at the airport. And lastly, I would note in terms of recent activity that our businesses are healthy, passenger and cargo volumes across the Port's operating units are at record or near record levels. Through the first half of 2017, our airports in total enjoyed more than 2% growth over last year's record levels and we are on track to reach a fifth consecutive year of record passenger volume. The agency's ports also remain on pace to set a volume record in 2017 through the first half of the year, the ports handled more than 4% higher volume than during the comparable period in 2015, our prior record year. And PATH continues to experience record ridership levels both during and now after the conclusion of its role across honoring New Jersey Transit passengers during the summer of hell. Turning to look at our priorities, as Executive Director, I believe the agency must unequivocally adopt the goal of bringing our transportation infrastructure up to world-class standards. We should consistently focus on international standards of quality and global best practices as the benchmark in all that we do. You and my colleagues in the agency will hear that theme from me again and again. We live in an interconnected global world, we compete against global competitors, this region deserves world-class transportation infrastructure. Against this framework, my initial focal points fall into three areas which I'll touch on briefly, our major capital projects, second, agency-wide imperatives, facility security, cyber security, emergency management, safety and integrity, third, initiatives in customer service technology, and the environment. Starting with our capital projects, the agency's 10-year Capital Plan adopted earlier this year clearly defines the capital projects and priorities for the agency which we will work very hard to achieve. For each of them, it is critical to establish a discipline of focus, management attention, clear accountability, and fiscal discipline, speed of execution, and I'll repeat that, speed of execution will be our priority in everything we do. Our priorities include the redevelopment of our three major airports, the ongoing construction of a whole new LaGuardia Airport, the redevelopment of Terminal A at Newark Airport, and executing the vision plan for John F Kennedy Airport both in its on airport and its access components. These projects must be executed with urgency. Just this past week the consumer rating firm JD Powers ranked our three airports at or near the bottom of their quality survey. This is simply unacceptable. Additionally, improving access to our airports must have a priority akin to our on-airport improvements. We need to move both the LaGuardia AirTrain and the extension of the PATH system to Newark Airport forward off the drawing Boards and into construction. The governors of both states have recognized the need of improving rail access, and my own strongly held view is that the need for improved rail access has not received the broad support it needs and requires and deserves. Improving airport access is not a choice, it is

(Board Meeting 9/28/17)

a necessity. Additionally, the agency is fully engaged in the replacement of the Port Authority Bus Terminal with the twin goals of expediting time to completion and maintaining strong lines of communication with elected officials from both the New York and New Jersey communities and the surrounding community as we move forward on our bus terminal planning. You will hear a brief update shortly on the feasibility of a build in place option. Last but not least, the Port Authority has budgeted \$2.7 billion to support debt service payments for Gateway, which represents a major bi-state commitment to getting the Portal North Bridge and the replacement Hudson River railroad tunnel built. The Gateway Funding Plan is under active development and is a major, major focus. Together with investments we are making in the Goethals, Bayonne, and George Washington bridges and PATH, we are making significant investments in these other Cross Hudson transportation capacity projects. But more is obviously needed. A focus on how to achieve needed expansion in Cross Hudson transportation capacity is a foundational role for this agency and is critically needed. We must continue our efforts to develop plans for meeting the mid-term and long term needs of the region. Turning to security, in addition to our capital initiatives, I want to briefly mention five cross-cutting issues that require the highest attention in today's world in my judgment, facility security, cyber security, emergency management, safety, and also integrity. In the areas of facility security, cyber security, emergency management, and safety, we will make significant internal changes to ensure the agency is taking a close look at our current practice and operations to make sure we are measuring up to global best practices. The agency will look closely at the changing nature of the threats of terrorism, of hacking, of more intense storms, and rising ocean levels. We will look at evolving best practice standards and we will look at the quality of the agency's implementation of the relevant standards across the agency's facilities. With respect to integrity, the Chairman, Vice Chairman, and I fundamentally agree that continuing to strengthen our posture on ethics and integrity issues is critical to continuing the process of restoring the reputation of the agency following Bridgegate. We have worked closely together on a set of resolutions which we will be discussing shortly, which will build upon the reform measures that have been put in place over the past three years. Our goal is simple, integrity must be the foundation of all that we do from the tone at the top to the policies we set to the training we provide and require staff throughout the agency. Ethics and integrity issues are of vital personal importance to me and I intend to devote major attention to setting this tone. Regarding integrity, it is one strike and you're out, no winks, no nods, square corners. Working with the Chair and Vice Chair, I am dedicated to driving that message from top to bottom in the agency. Turning briefly to customer service technology and the environment, I have asked each of our line directors to develop a list of priority initiatives in each of these three areas. The agency should be a leader, again, measured by global best practices. With respect to customer service, the Port Authority has a long history in tackling complex infrastructure challenges in terms of building facilities. The Port Authority must aspire as well to delivering world-class customer service. The public's impression when traveling through Port Authority facilities can be dramatically influenced for better or for worse by their customer service experience. World-class transportation organizations are not simply infrastructure builders. Some initial examples, elevators and escalators must be well maintained and repaired quickly when they malfunction. Management of taxi lines at our airports must be improved. Ease of connection to for-hire vehicles must also be improved. Access to service information and to better way finding must become priorities. Wi-Fi and cell service should be standard in all the agency's facilities. We will look across all our facilities and all of our operating units to improve customer focus as an operating mantra. Technology, the Port Authority needs to dramatically update and embrace the use of modern technology overall in order to better serve customers and to carry out our mission. For example, the agency must dramatically improve its websites and dramatically expand its use of apps on smartphones. We must identify the information that we know customers are looking for and provided in an easily accessed clear concise format whether that is PATH train schedules or airport, flight, and parking information or

(Board Meeting 9/28/17)

bridge and tunnel outages due to construction or accidents. And we must expand the use of modern technology simply to operate smartly and more efficiently. With respect to the environment and sustainability, lessening our environmental impact and building and operating in a sustainable manner are critical for this region and the next generation. Aside from these principle considerations, as a business matter, the Port Authority needs to take the initiative and become a leader in environmental sustainability. It is critical given the long-term nature of the assets we are building and operating. I will be seeking steps that we can take where we can achieve the dual goals of reducing our impact on the environment and lead from a business perspective. Finally, I have saved one of the agency's most important priorities to end on. Our Port Authority employees and all those who work at our facilities, without our employees and our workers at our facilities, we obviously cannot accomplish anything. We must assure that we maintain the high quality of our workforce across the organization both represented and non-represented. We must develop strategies to recruit the next generation. We recognize that we must address the large number of open and expired labor agreements. I am committed to work, to focus on these priorities. Thank you and I look forward to working with the Board and everyone on these matters. Mr. Chairman.

[Board Chair K. O'Toole] Thank you. Are there any comments or questions from the Commissioner on a very comprehensive but necessary report? If not, we can move ahead to the contractor vendor past performance policy. Rick.

[R. Cotton] So, Commissioners, you have before you a resolution which actually responds to the need for speed and quality in all of our efforts. When we hire outside contractors, a key component of the selection process should be the past performance of those contractors. Up to now that has not followed a consistent and disciplined path within our RFP and procurement processes. The resolution that you have before you would establish utilizing past performance by contractors on Port Authority projects as a key selection criteria. The past performance from a good The good past performance of a contractor should count strongly in favor at selection. The poor performance of a contractor should count strongly in putting a thumb on the scale against its selection. This is both important as an incentive to contractors and is important in terms of selecting those and rewarding those who have delivered for us. So I urge and commend positive action by the Board on that resolution.

[Board Chair K. O'Toole] Thanks. Any comments or questions? Okay, thank you very much, Rick. Moving forward, our General Counsel Mike Farbiarz will now present the next resolution for the Board's consideration which will cover the development of a comprehensive Port Authority Integrity Program some of which was touched upon by our executive director. And let me just say before Michael starts, you know, we talked about this about a month and a half ago, Rick and I got together and talked about what we thought was a very important starting block for us is having this Integrity program that we've talked about and seen in a negative or a positive last three years, we built upon. And I really anticipate that having something significant today, spoke to the Vice Chair Mr. Lynford and he wisely said to me, "Kevin, slow down." I took his wisdom. I said, "We want to get it right." And I really thank the Vice Chair and thank Commissioner Horwitz who knows the subject matter very, very well. We're talking about some really far reaching issues here whether it's a False Claims Act or whether it's the Code of Conduct which is significant and a couple other points dealing with training. We're going to do it right, we're going to get it done. And, Loretta, I think by October I think we'll have some of this put forward, but I want to thank you very much.

[Vice-Chair J.H. Lynford] I would like to say, Senator, that your name is not used in vain but it is used.

(Board Meeting 9/28/17)

[Sen. L. Weinberg]: I want them to hurry up.

[Board Chair K. O'Toole] Thank you, Loretta. Michael, it's all yours.

[M. Farbiarz] Good afternoon, Commissioners. I appear before you in connection with a proposed resolution that would make concrete and rapid improvements in the Port Authority's Integrity Program. Staff have been charged with ensuring that our integrity program is rigorous and demanding and meets or exceeds world-class standards.

[Integrity Policy, September 28, 2017] That's what the public expects of us and indeed it's what we expect from each other. Leading organizations build and maintain a culture of compliance in three fundamental ways, first, by articulating high, ethical standards, second of all by training people to meet those standards, and third, by holding people accountable should there be a lapse with respect to those standards. In each of those three areas, the proposed resolution that the Board has would make fundamental changes. And we can look perhaps at the slide at this point. As to ethical standards, and this is the first bullet point on the slide before you, it's critical as always to be leading from the front and a proposed resolution would require the Executive Director working in close consultation with the Governance and Ethics Committee to promulgate a Code of Ethics for Commissioners, a code that will cover fiduciary obligations, conflicts of interest and recusals, duty of confidentiality, interaction to the staff among other subjects. The proposed resolution would also require the promulgation of a Code of Ethics for vendors who work with the Port Authority and the revision of the currently existing Code of Ethics for employees. These various codes, under the proposed resolution that you have before you, will all be provided to the Board in the near term, in October and November of this year. And all of these codes, under the proposed resolution, will be made public so that everyone can see the standards that we're holding ourselves to. The proposed resolution would also require us to provide ethics and compliance training that meets world-class standards, training of all new employees, training that is interactive and vivid, training that makes ample use of information technology, and training that is tailored to individual job duties and responsibilities. The final piece of the proposed resolution, the final two bullets up there relate to accountability. First, as an initial matter, this is a matter of strengthening internal resources, of expediting the hiring of a top notch Chief of Ethics and Compliance to supplement the work that's already being done by the Inspector General, by the Chief of Human Capital, and by the Deputy Chief of Ethics and Compliance. It's also a matter, and this is the final bullet of what's in the resolution, it's also a matter of leveraging external resources toward accountability by promulgating a false claims policy that will incentivize individuals to come forward with information about fraudulent conduct, conduct that is intrinsically unethical and often has a financial cost for the agency. Taking this collection of steps as described in the proposed resolution would ensure that our Integrity program meets or exceeds best-in-class standards of rigor and accountability. I'm very pleased to put this Integrity program resolution in front of you and of course to answer any questions that you might have.

[Board Chair K. O'Toole] Any questions from the Commissioners? The timetable, Michael, just reiterate the timetable?

[M. Farbiarz] Yeah. The timetable for that promulgation of the various codes, the Commissioners' code, the expectation is they're working with the Governance and Ethics Committee, there will be a code for hopeful approval by the Board at its next meeting, employee and vendors' codes to come to the Board in November, the False Claims Policy to be put before the Board within 60 days of today, improvements in training, immediate.

(Board Meeting 9/28/17)

[Board Chair K. O'Toole] Any other comments? Michael, excellent job. Thank you very much. Moving along, our Chief of Human Capital Mary Lee Hannell will now review a policy for the Board's consideration that will promote the recruitment of veterans of the United States Armed Forces for all Port Authority positions. And I'll tell you how this just came about. I just had a random email and a phone call from an individual and asked about what we do for veterans in terms of creating opportunities for them. New York and New Jersey have specifically outlined preferential treatment or they value, in legislative words, opportunities for veterans, and it's a little bit murky or murkier for the Port, which I thought was kind of odd and outrageous. I think all of us have kind of bend around this concept that we value the service of our veterans whether it's our moms or dads and sisters and brothers, so I thought it's really important that we come out of the gate today and try to do anything we can to create, expand the opportunities for the veterans. And then Mary Lee was kind of telling, "You got to really balance that with other considerations to make sure that other segments those seeking opportunities are not going to get hurt." So that's you're opening. So it's all you.

[M.L. Hannell] Thank you very much. Good afternoon, Commissioners.

[Expanded Veterans Opportunities Board of Commissioners, September 28, 2017] I'm here today with a resolution for your consideration regarding an Expanded Veterans Opportunity program. Veterans' skills and experiences, as the Chairman said, are highly valued at the Port Authority and the agency already has in place a number of veterans' policies and practices when recruiting and hiring specifically, for police officer positions. For instance, veterans have a modified age limit for entrance into the Port Authority Police Academy, wherein a veteran candidate can deduct up to six years of active service from their age, so it increases the potential age limit for a veteran from 35 for the average population to 41 for veterans. This is also compatible with policies that exist in both New York and New Jersey. We also waive education components where veterans who have served a minimum of two whole years of continuous active duty away from the requirement of 60 college credits. In addition, for veterans, we waive all application fees to the Port Authority Police recruitment, and we've also conducted extensive and targeted recruitment efforts to encourage veterans to apply for Port Authority police officer positions, reaching out to veterans' organizations and attending major military events including the joint base at US military facilities in New Jersey that combined McGuire Air Force Base, the US Army Fort Dix and the US Naval Air Engineering Station at Lakehurst. I'm happy to report that because of some of these practices and policies, we've been highly successful rather in attracting military veterans to the Port Authority Police Department. The percentage of veterans in the most recent recruitment pool was actually 11%. This is especially remarkable when you consider that 3.7% of the residents of the states of New York and New Jersey are actually veterans, and this is reported by the US Department of Veterans Affairs. So we've done quite well in that police recruitment effort. Beyond the police department, the work experience of veterans gained through military service is also very applicable to other areas of the organization. They're well suited for positions in operations and maintenance, technology, security, and many other management jobs. Examples include conductor at PATH, train engineer, security analyst, tunnel and bridge agent, toll collector, and the list goes on. That's just a few positions. With this in mind, we're expanding efforts to promote recruitment of veterans of the United States Armed Forces for all Port Authority positions with that, specific actions to be taken include Could you advance that? There we go.

[Recommendations] Retention of a dedicated diversity recruiter for veteran employment. We will be entering into agreements with staffing firms that actually specialize in referring qualified veterans. They provide training and they match up with specific opportunities that we have in

(Board Meeting 9/28/17)

the Port Authority and help that re-entry into a civilian workforce. And we also will be working with a number of nonprofit organizations that are committed to training veterans with skills that they need. It is quite a transition, and these nonprofit agencies help ensure that that candidate when they come in with the skills actually can acclimate very quickly to the Port Authority environment. These new initiatives will build upon other efforts that are already in place with veterans. Existing features on our recruitment web page include testimonials.

[Veterans Testimonials] Today, we have a number of veterans, you see that's actually from our web page. We have a number of veterans who are already employed, so there's a testimonial page about what they did in the military, what they're doing currently here at the Port Authority. We also use what we call a Skills Translator Tool,

[Skills Translator] the language in the military is very different from the Port Authority, so we help try and translate to help a potential applicant understand where they might fit in with their skill sets. These new initiatives will complement existing resources and support for veterans already employed at the Port Authority, including a new employee research group for veterans, which actually will launch their kickoff just before Veterans Day this year. This employee research group will play an integral part in identifying recruitment and engagement strategies for veterans across the entire agency. All of these efforts build upon and complement the Port Authority's longstanding commitment and efforts to attract a wide and diverse talent pool that reflects the public that we serve. Initiatives to attract, hire, retain, and develop military vets enable us to recognize their service to our country and ensure that the Port Authority has a skilled and dedicated workforce, the one it needs to continue serving the bi-state region well into the future. Commissioners, pending your questions, I ask that you approve this legislation, nice try. Resolution to expand veterans' opportunities in the Port Authority.

[Board Chair K. O'Toole] Thank you very much, Mary Lee. Any questions or comments from the Commissioners?

[Comm. R. Pocino] Mr. Chairman. I have a comment.

[Board Chair K. O'Toole] Yes. I know Mary Lee was speaking of direct hires in terms of the Port Authority mostly, but I thought it's worth mentioning that the Building and Construction Trades Councils in both New York and New Jersey have an extensive program called the Helmets to Hardhats and Port Authority construction has afforded them the opportunity for many, many jobs over the past few years and will continue to do so. So even though it's not direct hire Port Authority money, it's a great initiative on behalf of both states construction unions and worthwhile mentioning.

[Board Chair K. O'Toole] Thank you very much. And Gary was leaning over my ear and telling me a similar story. So if you can work with Gary and Ray, that will be terrific.

[M.L. Hannell] Sure.

[Board Chair K. O'Toole] Any other comments or questions? Thank you very much, Mary Lee.

[M.L. Hannell] Thank you.

[Board Chair K. O'Toole] Okay, our next order of business is a presentation by Steve Plate, our Chief of Major Capital Projects will provide an update on the status of the planning efforts for the replacement of the Port Authority Bus Terminal. Steve.

(Board Meeting 9/28/17)

[S. Plate] Thank you, Chair, and thank you, Commissioners. The Port Authority staff has worked diligently to demonstrate the need for a new bus terminal to service commuter

[Port Authority Bus Terminal Replacement Program Build-In-Place Option] and intercity transportation in the region. The Port Authority bus terminal built in 1950 is obsolete according to modern day standards, serving approximately 260,000 passengers on an average week day. This exceeds our original forecast by over 12%. The bus terminal will be unable to meet the 330,000 daily passengers anticipated by 2040. Such operational shortfalls require the Port Authority to replace and modernize this critical facility to support a resilient Trans-Hudson network for its customers and for the region. We were asked at the April public Board Meeting to provide an update on the feasibility of a build-in-place option for the Port Authority Bus Terminal. It was also recommended last October by an independent panel associated with the international design and deliverability competition that we consider the build-in-place option. Today, I would like to share the results of the analysis conducted by a team composed of key Port Authority staff from multiple departments including Tunnel, Bridges, and Terminals, Engineering, Procurement, and major capital projects as well as our consultants Thornton Tomasetti, a renowned structural firm and WSP Parsons Brinckerhoff, a leading transportation consulting firm. Based upon the analyses conducted by the team, it is concluded that the build-in-place option is potentially viable from a construction and operational perspective. The teams established that the structural concept developed for this study demonstrates the viability of this plan, while construction phasing maintains critical bus operations as well as vital pedestrian egress and access. The construction will be staged with a top-down approach that would first add a new fifth and sixth floor as well as replace the existing floors with a state-of-the-art facility. In summary, the build-in-place option is feasible and warrants further consideration during the environmental process along with the other viable options. The environmental process will include substantial public communication, involvement, and opportunities for significant review and comment. Moving forward, we'll focus on a robust outreach program being conducted on a regular basis.

[Port Authority Bus Terminal Replacement Program - Action Plan] Requests for proposals concerning environmental analyses and architectural engineering services were released just this past Monday, September 25th. A program management solicitation will follow shortly thereafter. Upon selection of a firm, we will initiate a comprehensive environmental process which will adhere to applicable federal, state, and local regulations, including the National Environmental Policy Review procedures. Furthermore, we will concurrently initiate an assessment of an intermediate bus staging and storage facility needed to maintain current service. Development of an execution strategy consistent with the Port Authority Capital Plan will also be an integral part of this effort. Commissioners, we greatly appreciate all your support for the Port Authority Bus Terminal Replacement project. We will continue to keep you well informed during this thorough and transparent process.

[Board Chair K. O'Toole] Two quick question, Steve. Thank you very much. I understand this is one of several viable options with regard to any of the Port's history, has something like this been done before under the Port Authority?

[S. Plate] Yes, actually within the Port Authority and outside the Port Authority, it's been done at the World Trade Center and at the bus terminal itself. They had a top-down construction on the existing facility for parking purposes as well as over a children's hospital in Philadelphia, as well as just on our own FDR Drive, The Hospital for Special Surgery, so it's been done, it's proven, it's not state of the art, been there, done that.

(Board Meeting 9/28/17)

[Board Chair K. O'Toole] Thank you, Steve. Any comments or questions from the Commissioners? Anybody? Thank you, Steve.

[S. Plate] Thank you, sir.

[Board Chair K. O'Toole] Okay, moving along, we are pleased to report that our Chief Security Officer John Bilich who is now the permanent Chief Security Officer.

[Board Chair K. O'Toole] Congratulations, John.

[J. Bilich] Thank you, sir. We'll be recognizing four of our valued Port Authority staff members who have really set an example by taking the time to go down to Houston after Hurricane Harvey and I think it's Ira Forman, Mike Germano, Mike Cantone, and Harry Smith, is it, did I get it?

[J. Bilich] That's right.

[Board Chair K. O'Toole] So when this was put together, I made a promise to myself when they volunteered that I would call them every single day, which I did. And after the first two days, I called them, they were still in the trucks driving down to Texas.

[J. Bilich] That's right.

[Board Chair K. O'Toole] Which I found kind of hard to believe, but I want to thank you for giving up your time, your family time, personal time, I know it's an extraordinary trip because you told me it was an extraordinary trip, but what you did is you have shown the kind of heart we have here in the Port Authority when there are people in need regardless of where the Port Authority has to respond. So having said that, John, can you call them up, and it's all you.

[J. Bilich] Thank you, sir. I'm pleased to recognize the four members of the Port Authorities Emergency Management Team. They were deployed with New York State Incident Management Team on September 1st to Houston in support of Hurricane Harvey emergency relief operations. As everyone knows, the hurricane season has been particularly active with many storms and have demonstrated dramatic intensity. Thanks, guys.

[Board Chair K. O'Toole] Ira, you still talk to each other? Moving on, you know, obviously we've all witnessed the devastation in Puerto Rico and other countries, it really tears at you. You know, I got a phone call a couple days ago from State Senator Teresa Ruiz from New Jersey who said, "We have to do something, this is just so beyond what we've ever experienced and we've all seen in Jersey, New York, the Irene and Sandy, I mean the absolute devastation in Puerto Rico and the Virgin Islands, it just breaks your heart. There's absolutely no electricity, there's no supplies. So, Rick, we had a conversation with some the top staff here and a couple things we're looking to do, and Rick if you can just outline, one, we are establishing stations across the Port Authority facilities for donations, which have been emailed to all of the employees which would be collected at one point in time and shipped. I think is it through the grace of JetBlue if I'm not mistaken?

[R. Cotton] They will go down on either JetBlue flights or Delta flights.

[Board Chair K. O'Toole] There's also a program of putting up for a voluntary program if the

(Board Meeting 9/28/17)

employees want to donate, which will be outlined at some point from, I guess an email will be sent to all the employees.

[R. Cotton] Correct.

[Board Chair K. O'Toole] With their voluntary check off. And beyond that, there's also a large scope, 75 members have been either volunteered or were asked to go to Puerto Rico, four of whom left this morning, Rick?

[R. Cotton] Five left this morning at 6:00am on a Delta flight and seventy-one will depart, scheduled to depart tomorrow on a JetBlue flight.

[Board Chair K. O'Toole] And we don't know how long they're going to be there, but I will tell you what these folks are going to do, they'll been given their own sleeping bag, their own water, their own, you know, ready to eat meals or self-contained because there is nothing they can count on down there and they don't want to be considered a burden. But it is an extraordinary effort and it doesn't stop there. I'm hoping that with Senator Ruiz does her collection and what we do here in the Port, what we do in New York, we can get some of the folks in the corporate world to help move some of these materials down at low cost. It's the thing we have to do as human beings, we have to. And, Rick, if you can just keep us abreast of what we could do to help expedite this, we have to call, you know, whomever, we have to chip in to pay for the gas or airfare, I think we'll be more than happy to do that.

[R. Cotton] Will do, Mr. Chairman.

[Board Chair K. O'Toole] Thank you. Anybody else? Any comment or question on those particular items?

[Board Chair K. O'Toole] Okay, moving along. Thank you. We will now provide the members of the public to comment on any matters of the Port Authority. The public comment period which may be limited to 30 minutes in total provides an opportunity for the members of the public to present their views directly to the Board. We invite the dialogue. We ask you to come up and direct us respectfully. You are limited, just because there are so many, to three minutes. And we invite that. The first, someone who is not unfamiliar to us, Senator Loretta Weinberg, majority leader in the New Jersey Senate. Senator Weinberg, we welcome you.

[Sen. L. Weinberg] Thank you very much and good afternoon. I do have some formal remarks prepared, but I have to deviate because, first of all, I'm impressed. I don't usually start out on such a positive note with the Port Authority, but I am impressed today with your new Executive Director, we have not had a chance to meet and I look forward to having that opportunity as we continue on what I hope are good relationships between both our states and the goals that we share. And I actually was very happy with your opening remarks as the new Executive Director where you talked about airports, the Bus Terminal and Gateway. So your priorities seem like they are straight. So I appreciate that. Second, well, and equally important is your emphasis along with the new Chair, my former colleague Kevin O'Toole, the emphasis on integrity and ethics. And I would be remiss if I did not say a special thank you to the former Chair John Degnan who worked very hard at a very difficult time to put this agency back on the road to integrity and ethics. And to see what you've done so far in your planning, I know, Mr. Lynford, your job might be to slow Kevin O'Toole down and my job is going to be to keep him very quickly working as fast as he can. So together maybe we will reach the right balance.

(Board Meeting 9/28/17)

[Board Chair K. O'Toole] I'm the only guy elected.

[Sen. L. Weinberg] And lastly but equally important is seeing the new diversity on the Board of Commissioners. The diversity lends itself to the kind of work you're doing. I spent too many months here looking, you know, I don't want to insult anybody, but I will Looking at all the same kind of people sitting up there, and it is very different today, and I appreciate both Governors in their steps forward there. And just we heard the report on the hiring of veterans. I happen to know Chairman O'Toole's dad who is a veteran of the Korean War, the same war that my husband and my brother were both veterans of. So I know that kind of diversity helps you establish new and good programs. And so, you know, I took up a lot of time saying thank you, but it's been a long time coming, and I'm very appreciative. And certainly, last but not least, the moving forward of the new bus terminal. I appreciated Mr. Plate's presentation here on the build-in-place. It sounds like a very viable alternative, it sounds like it might be something after we ask enough questions about it that we could embrace because the obvious not having to taking property or having a bigger impact on the neighborhood and all the other things. So if it can be built in place, if it can accommodate what we need as a 50% increase in capacity by the year 2040, if it can accomplish those things, I think we in New Jersey would be happy to embrace it, so we're looking forward to seeing the development of all the alternatives and certainly of learning that this is a viable alternative. And I was also very happy to hear Mr. Plate talk about other places where this has been done because my initial reaction was "That's impossible, keep a bus terminal operating for 240,000 passengers each day and actually do this," but apparently, you can. So I'm not going to go through my formal remarks even though Mark will probably be disappointed. But really, as I said, I just want to say thank you for what appears to be steps forward and to let you know that I am certainly, my partners in the legislature, our Senate President Steve Sweeney, my partner who is usually here with me but was otherwise had a scheduling conflict, Senator Bob Gordon and I are ready to do anything and everything to show New Jersey's support as we move along in a new respectful relationship with all of you. Thank you.

[Board Chair K. O'Toole] Thank you, Senator Weinberg. Next public speaker Marie Wausnock. Marie? Okay. Thanks, Karen. Next one is Yvonne Garrett Moore.

[Yvonne Garrett Moore] Good morning, Commissioners. How are you? Good afternoon now, my goodness. Yvonne Garrett Moore, Moore Vision Public Relations and Planning, Newark, New Jersey. In 2011, I was before the Commissioners and I presented a concept called Newark Airport City, bringing to the Commissioners an understanding of how we can maximize the economic potential in and around Newark International Airport. Executive Director Cotton, I apologize that I didn't greet you at the last meeting. It was so much information to try to get in a short period, but I do appreciate you being here and continuing the legacy and leadership here at Port Authority. In 2011, I made a presentation to the Commissioners about this Newark Airport City concept. After the meeting, Christopher Ward came to me and he said, "Yvonne, this is a valuable, viable concept." He said, "I want you to go get the book Aerotropolis." Did just that. I went and got the book, studied it, the author is Dr. John Kasarda. In 2011, we've been working to understand this Aerotropolis concept, creating greater connectivity between the airport and the communities that it serves. Few months ago, we've been in dialogue about bringing Dr. Kasarda to our community. He travels around the world, there are Aerotropolises in South America, there are Aerotropolises in Denver, there Aerotropolises in Texas, so we need to look at these best practices to understand how to best develop in and around our airport communities. The stumbling block that we ran up against is that there's no funding for this type of discussion between the Port Authority and the community. We need the Commissioners to set aside resources that will help us to understand best practices that will allocate funds to be

(Board Meeting 9/28/17)

able to address continuing education and professional development. We want to grow and we grow through knowledge, and so we need to have that knowledge base available to us and resources available within the agency to be able to facilitate discussions like bringing a world renowned expert into our community to talk about best practices. Dr. Kasarda agreed to come October 16th. I had to email him last night after having a conversation with Port Authority to say, "Dr. Kasarda, I'm sorry, but we don't have the funds to bring you to our port." I'm embarrassed because this is a world expert, he's a professor and he's sought after by the world community to bring best practices, to bring the academic understanding of economic growth and development. So I really need you all to appropriate funding to address educational needs and particularly to help us accomplish this dialogue with Dr. Kasarda to have him, and JIT has agreed to participate, the city of Newark has agreed to participate as well as Newark Economic Development Corporation, as well as Port Authority, it's just that we don't want to tie the hands of our executives to help best facilitating the community because they're not the resources to do that.

[Yvonne Garrett Moore] So thank you...

[Board Chair K. O'Toole] Thank you.

[Yvonne Garrett Moore] For hearing me and thank you for appropriating the funds needed for continuing education advancement.

[Yvonne Garrett Moore] Thanks so very much. Thank you.

[Board Chair K. O'Toole] Thank you very much. Thanks. Robert DePauw. Robert? Okay. Neile Weissman?

[Neile Weissman] Chairman O'Toole, Director Cotton, Commissioners, thank you for the opportunity to speak in favor of wider George Washington Bridge paths. Since many of you have just joined the Board, I'll review why this is important. At stake are enhancements to tourism, public health, property taxes, sustainability and resilience annually worth hundreds of millions of dollars. You have copies of extended remarks and online at CompleteGeorge.org. The GWB is the sole bikeable connector between North Jersey and New York City, and it is the nexus of the 1,650 mile tri-state trail network just announced by Regional Plan Association. The agency's current GWB plan was hatched in 2013 without prior public input. Today, 180 organizations, businesses, and communities are aware and have asked for more. Critically, the Board authorized a plan without a traffic count. We now know that we can use as double the safe threshold to justify widening and it's been growing at 10% per year, which is unheard of for a failed facility, one which users would avoid if they had another option and for good reason. Between 2010 and 2016, the PAPD reported 39 collisions involving bicycles, one of the Port facilities poses the risk of bodily injury in the normal course of use and it will only get worse. Incremental gains in capacity from separating pedestrians will be overwhelmed by growing demand and plans to add gathering places at each entrance poses new threats to user safety. In New York, these are at the bottom of grated ramps which means cyclists will have to descend at speed to exit and accelerate to climb. In New Jersey, cyclists coming down Hudson terrace will need to make fast left turns into oncoming traffic, and in both cases, they'll be forced through areas in which crowds have been encouraged to form. It doesn't have to be this way. If you dispense with the gathering areas and simply feed cyclists onto directed bikeways, you'll maintain a safe orderly flow. And if you widen the main paths to national standards, you ensure user safety, you satisfy federal mandates to grow biking and walking, you insulate the agency from liability, and you create more Trans-Hudson capacity in case we lose a rail tunnel before

(Board Meeting 9/28/17)

Gateway gets done. Look, the agency, you guys could be commended for acting decisively to stem the flooded bridge suicide attempts, but why stop there? Why not apply the same urgency to protect the safety of all bridge users? I urge you to leverage the opportunity of the re-cabling to do this now and to do this right. I mean, this only comes along once a century. And please figure out a way to integrate the permanent suicide barrier in a way that it doesn't ruin its use for generations.

[Neile Weissman] Thank you.

[Board Chair K. O'Toole] Thank you very much. Dennis O'Donnell.

[Dennis O'Donnell] Good afternoon, Commissioners. Dennis O'Donnell. I, like Mr. Weissman, am here address safety concerns on the George Washington Bridge bicycle path, perhaps from a different perspective. I'm a bankruptcy attorney at a large firm not far from here, and I'm also an avid runner. I train, you know, throughout the metropolitan area and early on the morning of May 27, 2017, I was returning from a long run out into Bergen County, coming back across the George Washington Bridge when I was hit by a cyclist on the bridges shared pedestrian cyclists pathway and knocked to the ground. In addition to sustaining assorted cuts and bruises, my arm was broken in a way that required surgery and may result in long-term impairment of the use of my elbow. More importantly, I suffered these injuries because quite simply there is not adequate space for large numbers of cyclists and pedestrians to safely coexist on the bridge's shared pedestrian-cyclist pathway. I have since learned that I was not the first to be injured in this way on the George Washington Bridge nor does it appear that I will be the last. According to the Port Authority's bicycle master plan, as Mr. Weissman just indicated, 39 cyclists-related accidents were reported on or in the vicinity of the George Washington Bridge between 2010 and 2016. Indeed, as, you know, the bicycle master plan goes on to concede the majority of the reported bicycle crashes on all Port Authority properties or facilities between 2016 occurred on the GWB path which the report concedes is consistent with expectations based on ridership. Based on my own experience and what appears to be a long-standing public record about unsafe conditions on the bridge's pedestrian-cycle pathway, I am here today to urge the authority to act promptly to remedy these conditions. The Port Authority, I understand, again, from the bicycle master plan has agreed to take action with respect to this problem. However, the measures it has committed to undertake fall well below national standards and will not be fully implemented until 2024, which means that the conditions that caused my injury continue to exist today and will continue to do so for up to an additional seven years. Such a state of affairs is simply unacceptable. The Port Authority must act now. It must find the funds to bring the bicycle-pedestrian pathway into compliance with national standards as soon as possible or otherwise adopt stopgap measures to address these safety concerns on a temporary basis. If it does not, many more pedestrians and cyclists will be injured or worse before the currently proposed upgrade to the pathway can be completed. Thank you, Commissioners, unless you have any questions.

[Board Chair K. O'Toole] Thank you very much. This is a note, you know, the Executive Director and I went out there on the GW and looked at not only the fencing issue but the bike issue and were briefed extensively and your concerns are heard and we're still looking into it. Arthur Piccolo.

[Arthur Piccolo] Mr. Chairman, you mentioned this is the portion where the Board has a dialogue with the public. I started in March 2016, attended 12 consecutive meetings and listened to hundreds of speakers, not once in those 12 sessions did I ever see a member of the Board interact with one of the speakers who have come here with ideas, suggestions, proposals, they

(Board Meeting 9/28/17)

sit here, many of them left the room, if it's a dialogue, I think when people come up here and speak to you, you should, when appropriate, ask them questions, respond to what they're saying. The specific reason I'm here, I came for 12 consecutive meetings with a symbolic simple idea and I stopped coming to the old Board because I was getting no response at all. I see we have a new Board, I was always curious that here in the 21st century we had a Board, Port Authority with no women on it and no people of color, I see that's been addressed somewhat. The Port Authority, we have the single most important and impressive public building of the 21st century, certainly the most expensive, the new building, the Transit Center which is colloquial called the Oculus. The only name officially associated with it is Westfield. That building is a public building. That is not the Westfield Shopping Mall, it's a public building. It deserves, like all great buildings in this country, a name appropriate that makes us proud of that building. There is no one in all of American history, no one, who is more associated with both New York and New Jersey than Alexander Hamilton, no one. There has never been in our history, although there are things named in his honor, nothing of a magnitude that deserves to have his name attached to it. Previous generations of the Port Authority named the George Washington Bridge in honor of George Washington, the Lincoln Tunnel in honor of Lincoln, two other transportation structures. In many ways, Alexander Hamilton is the equal in terms of the survival and the development of this country to those great Americans. And with a simple one sentence symbolic resolution, all right, that would just take the majority of you that you could rescind at a future time, we could finally give this building a name which it deserves, a proud name, the Alexander Hamilton Transit Hub, all right? And I think it's time that that was given serious consideration. You may do other much more important things over the next few years, but I believe if you do this one symbolic act, you will be more remembered for that than anything else. I hope you'll consider that.

[Board Chair K. O'Toole] Thank you very much. And Peter, my chief of staff is going to meet with you, maybe we'll set up a meeting, you and I can have a one on one next couple of weeks. Question? Yes.

[Comm. G. McDonald] Have you seen the play Hamilton?

[Arthur Piccolo] Of course, I've seen the play.

[Comm. G. McDonald] Okay. There's dialogue.

[Arthur Piccolo] And that you have another point, sir, that the founder who is motivating young people and everyone in the 21st century is Alexander Hamilton.

[Board Chair K. O'Toole] Thank you very much. Peter, you follow up with him. Thank you. Margaret Donovan.

[Margaret Donovan] Good afternoon, Commissioners, and welcome. Your tributes to Chairman Degnan at your August meeting were certainly fitting. Mr. Degnan is obviously a fine man. And as the records editorial Board wrote on August 2nd, he was the right leader at the right time for the Port Authority. We were pleased that they included the Twin Towers Alliance remarks in their assessment. On August 1st, we were asked for a comment on the resignations and the next day a portion of Richard Hughes's response appeared in the records editorial online and in print, "The Twin Towers Alliance isn't wrong when it suggested the PA 'still an opaque, secretive, wasteful, and arrogant agency that continues to roll over for the governors.'" So you don't have to take our word for it. We hope you will stop for just a minute to ask yourselves why was that included in a very complimentary piece because it's true. We have spent the past

(Board Meeting 9/28/17)

seven years looking out for the public interest when it comes to the Port Authority and we know what's what. The so called Port Authority culture is frequently blamed for all that is going wrong with this once great agency, but it is really the Board of Commissioners' culture that is to blame or more precisely it's the gubernatorial culture that has perverted it and that long predates Bridgegate. Back in 2014, the expert opinion was unanimous. The Port Authority needed to be independent of the Governor's control and the much vaunted special panel agreed. Governance recommendation number one three years ago was to hire a CEO based on a national search and governance recommendation number two was to continue reforms to promote a culture of transparency and ethical conduct at the Port Authority. The fact that the CEO search is in limbo is a scandal or it should be. And the lack of information on what is going on with that effort behind the scenes shows us how that culture of transparency is doing. Where is the report? There are no offsets when it comes to transparency, either you are transparent or you aren't. You don't get points for disclosing 1 thing or 10 things so that you can then spend the points to hide something that actually matters. Since half of you are new to the Board, I would like to recommend that you see the '70s movie "Becket" with Richard Burton as Thomas Becket and Peter O'Toole as Henry II because the Port Authority needs a Thomas Becket or better yet 12 Becketts. The closest anyone came to that role on this Board was Commissioner Lipper and we know how much Governor Cuomo II appreciated his efforts. Anyway, it didn't seem the Board could get over the hump to the next level, but what I've heard here today has been very encouraging. So I plan to share some concrete observations as soon as possible with Executive Director Cotton and Mr. Farbiarz for your consideration. Thank you.

[Board Chair K. O'Toole] Thank you very much for your comments. Richard Hughes.

[Richard Hughes] Good afternoon, Commissioners.

[

[Board Chair K. O'Toole] Good afternoon.

[Richard Hughes] Wonderful to see so many new faces, new leadership. We at the Twin Towers Alliance are long-term critics of the Board of the Port Authority and it would be wonderful if we could be put out of business. I've heard some very encouraging things here today and I hope they will be acted on. And if you truly are committed to the things Mr. Cotton has said and the things Mr. O'Toole has said and some of the others have said, if you're truly committed to that, well, I won't have to be coming to these meetings in the future and I can go on to other things in my life. I hope that takes place. I've been coming, forgive me if I'm a little cynical, I've been coming here for many years and speaking at many meetings and I've heard hundreds and hundreds of speakers, and I've heard a great deal of words from Commissioners and from the Board. I have seen improvement. That's what Since we are on a positive note here today, I don't want to be a downer. I have seen a lot of improvement on the Board and in this agency, it's just not enough, but maybe we'll get there. I think Chairman Degnan was a great improvement over Chairman Samson and maybe, Mr. O'Toole, you'll be a great improvement over Degnan, and that takes nothing away from Mr. Degnan. I happen to like Mr. Degnan. I don't think he liked me. We frequently had some sharp exchanges. He once prevented me from speaking. A member of the press went up to him afterwards and said to him, "That's not the way we conduct Board Meetings here, Mr. Degnan." He was new to the job. Early on, we had some very sharp words because I had the effrontery to mock Mr. Foye's 10-year Capital Plan because it included nothing for the Port Authority Bus Terminal. But then I discovered later on it wasn't too long before everybody was talking about we need to spend money at the Port Authority Bus Terminal, so maybe my bad manners actually produced something good. I would hope that in

(Board Meeting 9/28/17)

the future I will be here complimenting you and not criticizing you. When I said in that editorial about John Degnan that the Twin Towers Alliance isn't wrong or the editorial said, "The Twin Towers Alliance isn't wrong when it suggests that the Port Authority is still an opaque, secretive, wasteful, and arrogant agency that continues to roll over for the governors." I hope you'll think about what I said there because it was true, not all true, but it was true enough that it needs to be addressed. Opaque, let's go with transparency. Mr. Degnan talked about transparency a lot. We brought that up many years ago and it's nice at least it was talked about. But it would be nice if this agency were transparent. It would be nice if it was open instead of secretive, frugal instead of wasteful, and a little bit humble instead of arrogant. After all, you do work for us, we don't work for you. Thank you.

[Board Chair K. O'Toole] Thank you very much. Kate Slevin. Kate? Okay. Murray Bodin. Bodin. Sorry about that.

[Murray Bodin] In 1917, United States passed the Jones Act, 100 years ago... That's where shipping goes back and forth and American ships in one sort or another. In 2007, the iPhone was released and it kind of changed things. This description of how it changed is in the Thomas Friedman's book, Thank You for Being Late, it should be required reading for all of you so you understand what's going on. This morning the government announced that they were going to suspend the Jones Act for 10 days, an act that was created 100 years ago, they're going to suspend for 10 day so things could go to Puerto Rico quicker. Sarah Huckabee Sanders announced it this morning on Twitter. Not a news release, not an email, on Twitter. To show you how much the world has changed. Likewise, I was here at the Committee meeting when the money was approved for the box on the 34th Street so that the Gateway Tunnel can be built now. Buses belong in New Jersey at Secaucus and not coming through a tunnel to New York. You cannot add more buses to a tunnel that is already at capacity, so you're talking about building a bus garage but neglecting the fact that the buses have to get here, go back again, come again in the afternoon, and start. The 7th Avenue line can easily be extended to Secaucus. But you have to think in new ways. I've been here for a while and it is time I really quit because I'm getting older and I'm forgetting stuff and I'm embarrassed at the mistakes I make. But you have an opportunity to recognize that the world has changed, you go around New York City, you see bike lanes all over, they've cut out one lane of traffic and now they have one lane for traffic and one lane for bikes. Yes, there needs to be some bus capacity in Manhattan, but most of the buses from New Jersey belong in New Jersey, get out of the train, and come on a trip. Come on. I have a hearing problem. And I know 20 seconds is up. Just hold up before I get there. I really hope this is the last time I come here. I don't want to do it anymore. I'm here to encourage you to think about the future and how much it's changed, and it is time that it's implemented. Steve is great. I love the way he fixed that, the World Trade Center, I followed him very closely, he's a great As a human being, he's a really decent human being as well and I appreciate him. Thank you.

[Board Chair K. O'Toole] Thank you very much. Delicia Jenkins.

[Delicia Jenkins] Good afternoon, Commissioners. Good afternoon. My name is Delicia Jenkins and I have worked at JFK Airport Terminal 1 for five years. As an airport employee, a cook for HMSHost at PZA, I know the stress of the airport environment, I also know the effort and care airport workers put in every day because we are proud of the work we do. New York airport workers will receive \$15 an hour due to the minimum wage policy that was passed. While this is still not enough for my coworkers and I, it is still a start for us. \$15 is important for me and my family because it will provide us with the ability to pay our bills, meet our rent, and to have enough to get through the month. My brothers and sisters in Newark Airport deserve the same

(Board Meeting 9/28/17)

minimum wage. They do the same work as me and they also go through similar struggles. Rent in New Jersey is going up, grocery and bills, everyone deserves a better shot and living a good life, at achieving the American Dream, I want to know that Newark workers will get the same shot. Commissioners, I ask that you pass the \$15 minimal wage for Newark Airport workers, please take what I ask into great consideration.

[Delicia Jenkins] Thank you.

[Board Chair K. O'Toole] Thank you very much. Rita Azcona.

[speaking in Spanish]

[Rita Azcona] Good afternoon, I'm going to be speaking in Spanish, but I have a translator because my English is not very good.

[speaking in Spanish] Good afternoon, my name is Rita Azcona, I work at Terminal A in Newark Airport. I'm here today because my coworkers and I are worried for our future with the renovation of Terminal A.

[speaking in Spanish] The Port Authority will select a company for Terminal A, you have four options. At the moment of making your decision, please keep in mind the company that will have the best interests in mind for the workers not just for the passengers.

[speaking in Spanish]

[Translator] Keep in mind, That the best interest of New Jersey residents is kept for the future of Newark Airport. Thank you.

[Board Chair K. O'Toole] Thank you very much.

[Rita Azcona] Thank you.

[Board Chair K. O'Toole] Thank you. Danielle Small. Okay. Marcela Jimenez.

[Marcela Jimenez] Good afternoon, Commissioners. My name is Marcela Jimenez and I am a researcher for UNITE HERE Local 100. The Redevelopment of Newark International Terminal A is exciting, right? It'll bring many benefits for New York and New Jersey, and UNITE HERE Local 100, the union for concessions and airport catering workers at the Port Authority airports wholeheartedly supports the project and the anticipated job creation that will come with it. Our members at Newark Airport are excited to continue serving airport passengers in a new and improved terminal. UNITE HERE Local 100 is seeking to work with potential concessions management companies to develop an orderly process for the existing Terminal A concessions workers to ensure that they retain their jobs and that airport standards are maintained, we are open to working with the short listed companies and have already reached out to them. Included in the short listed companies is Fraport USA, formerly AIRMALL. Workers came to the Port Authority for years asking to not approve them for JFK Terminal 4 concessions management. We will update the Port Authority on our views of the other three Newark bidders as the process moves forward. On a side note, I'd like to thank Executive Director Cotton for mentioning and appreciating the workers at the Port Authority and we look forward to working with you and the rest of the Commissioners moving forward. Thank you.

(Board Meeting 9/28/17)

[Board Chair K. O'Toole] Thank you very much. Charlene Talarico.

[Charlene Talarico] Good afternoon. On August 4, 2016, I was assaulted and physically injured by Diannae Ehler, now the Director of TB&T. There are criminal charges pending against her. Since Diannae Ehler assaulted me, the Port Authority has done everything in their power to discredit me and cover up this matter starting with Captain Emilio Gonzales of the Lincoln Tunnel command who refused to help me and whose reports are not truthful. Today, I would like to read two letters, the first from the Weehawken prosecutor, the second from the Hudson County Prosecutor's Office Internal Affairs Unit regarding the actions of Detective Mark Gaunt of the Port Authority Inspector General's Office. According to NewJersey.com, Detective Gaunt has made over \$100,000 in overtime. Remember that as I read these letters. "The first from the Weehawken Municipal Court, Pursuant to a directive from the Hudson County Prosecutor's Office, I am providing you a summary of our discussion on or about February 17, 2017 when we discussed the email from Detective Gaunt of the Office of the Inspector General in response to your letter to them dated February 7th. In summary, they stated that your medical exam was not videotaped, that the area that was videotaped was a PA emergency intake room and the person you were talking with was an administrative assistant and not a doctor. If you should have any questions, you may reach me at... Sincerely, Lauren Oliveri, Municipal Prosecutor." The next is from the office of the Hudson County prosecutor, "Dear Miss Talarico, this office has concluded its investigation into your complaint regarding Detective Mark Gaunt of the Port Authority Police Department. In your complaint, you alleged that Detective Gaunt lied to the Weehawken municipal prosecutor about the circumstances of your medical treatment at the Port Authority medical facility. The internal affairs unit has determined that Detective Gaunt did communicate via an email to the Weehawken municipal prosecutor that it was not a doctor who was seen on the video interacting with you. Detective Gaunt subsequently informed the municipal prosecutor that it was in fact a doctor that you had seen on the video. That was after I sent my letter of course. However, after careful review it has been determined that his actions do not rise to a criminal level. Therefore, this complaint has been sent to the Port Authority Police Integrity Unit for administrative review. Any questions concerning your complaint should be directed to that department under the command of Detective Lieutenant Tim McGovern. Respectfully, Lieutenant Matthew Guzowski. Over a \$100,000 in overtime, disgraceful. Is he grossly incompetent? Did he purposely lie on his own? Or was he ordered to lie? Regardless, he should be held accountable for his actions. Lieutenant McGovern never returns my calls or my emails. I will continue to pursue the truth regardless of how long it takes, where I have to go, what I'm forced to do or endure until the truth in this matter prevails. Thank you for your time.

[Board Chair K. O'Toole] Thank you very much. And that concludes our list of speakers. So moving along here, we will now proceed with the voting of items before the Board today for consideration which each of the respective Committee Chairs will provide a brief report prior to the matter being considered by the Board. The first item deals with Runway Project at JFK International Airport. Commissioner Vice Chair Lynford is Chair of the Committee on Capital Planning, Execution and Asset Management will now provide his report.

[Vice-Chair J.H. Lynford] Thank you, Chairman O'Toole. As Chair of the Committee on Capital Planning, Execution and Asset Management, I will now report on an item that was discussed in Committee earlier today and authorizes a \$215 million project for the rehabilitation of runway 13 left, 31 right and certain taxiway modifications to support aircraft delay reductions at John F Kennedy International Airport. The item also authorizes the award of a contract to construct the project. Prior to making a motion on this item, I would ask the Corporate Secretary to note any Commissioner recusals on this matter. Karen?

(Board Meeting 9/28/17)

[K. Eastman] Yeah, there are no recusals.

[Vice-Chair J.H. Lynford] Thank you. Do any of the Commissioners have any questions or comments on this item? I will now request a motion on this.

[Commissioner] So moved.

[Vice-Chair J.H. Lynford] Thank you.

[Commissioner] Second.

[Vice-Chair J.H. Lynford] Having received a motion and a second, I will request the Corporate Secretary to call the roll for voting on this item.

[K.Eastman] Chairman O'Toole.

[Board Chair K. O'Toole] Yes.

[K.Eastman] Vice Chairman Lynford.

[Vice-Chair J.H. Lynford] Yes.

[K. Eastman] Commissioner Bagger.

[Comm. R. Bagger] Yes.

[K. Eastman] Commissioner Eve.

[Comm. L. Eve] Yes.

[K. Eastman] Commissioner Horwitz.

[Comm. D. Horwitz] Yes.

[K. Eastman] Commissioner LaBarbera.

[Comm. G. LaBarbera] Yes.

[K. Eastman] Commissioner McDonald.

[Comm. G. McDonald] Yes.

[K. Eastman] Commissioner Pocino.

[Comm. R. Pocino] Yes.

[K. Eastman] Commissioner Rosado.

[Comm. R. Rosado] Yes.

[K. Eastman] Commissioner Turner.

(Board Meeting 9/28/17)

[Comm. C. Turner] Yes.

[Vice-Chair J.H. Lynford] As the votes are in order, the item is approved. Guess I return it to you.

[Board Chair K. O'Toole] You do. As Chair of the Committee on Operations, I will now request a vote on an item discussed early in this meeting that will provide for the development of a rigorous past performance policy for contractors and vendors. Any Commissioners have any question or comment on the item? If not, I request a motion.

[Commissioner] So moved.

[Board Chair K. O'Toole] Second?

[Commissioner] Second.

[Board Chair K. O'Toole] Corporate Secretary, please call for roll.

[K. Eastman] Okay, there are no recusals on this either, just as a point of reference.

[Board Chair K. O'Toole] You didn't write that down.

[K. Eastman] Chairman O'Toole.

[Board Chair K. O'Toole] Yes.

[K. Eastman] Vice Chairman Lynford.

[Vice-Chair J.H. Lynford] Yes.

[K. Eastman] Commissioner Bagger.

[Comm. R. Bagger] Yes.

[K. Eastman] Commissioner Eve.

[Comm. L. Eve] Yes.

[K. Eastman] Commissioner Horwitz.

[Comm. D. Horwitz] Yes.

[K. Eastman] Commissioner LaBarbera.

[Comm. G. LaBarbera] Yes.

[K. Eastman] Commissioner McDonald.

[Comm. G. McDonald] Yes.

(Board Meeting 9/28/17)

[K. Eastman] Commissioner Pocino.

[Comm. R. Pocino] Yes.

[K. Eastman] Commissioner Rosado.

[Comm. R. Rosado] Yes.

[K. Eastman] Commissioner Turner.

[Comm. C. Turner] Yes.

[Board Chair K. O'Toole] Next item pertains to an integrity policy that was also presented to the Board earlier. Commissioner Turner in Chair of the Governance and Ethics Committee will not provide her report.

[Comm. C. Turner] As Chair of the Committee on Governance and Ethics, I will now report on an item discussed earlier in the Board Meeting that authorizes the development of integrity programs for Commissioners, staff, and vendor Code of Ethics including a False Claims Policy. Prior to making the motion on this item, I would ask the Corporate Secretary to note any Commissioner recusals on this matter.

[K. Eastman] There are no recusals.

[Comm. C. Turner] Do any of the Commissioners have any questions or comments on this issue? I will now request a motion on this item.

[Commissioner] Moved.

[Commissioner] So moved.

[Comm. C. Turner] Can I have a second on this motion?

[Commissioner] Second.

[Comm. C. Turner] I will now request the Corporate Secretary to call the roll for voting on this item.

[K. Eastman] Chairman O'Toole.

[Board Chair K. O'Toole] Yes.

[K. Eastman] Vice Chairman Lynford.

[Vice-Chair J.H. Lynford] Yes.

[K. Eastman] Commissioner Bagger.

[Comm. R. Bagger] Yes.

[K. Eastman] Commissioner Eve.

(Board Meeting 9/28/17)

[Comm. L. Eve] Yes.

[K. Eastman] Commissioner Horwitz.

[Comm. D. Horwitz] Yes.

[K. Eastman] Commissioner LaBarbera.

[Comm. G. LaBarbera] Yes.

[K. Eastman] Commissioner McDonald.

[Comm. G. McDonald] Yes.

[K. Eastman] Commissioner Pocino.

[Comm. R. Pocino] Yes.

[K. Eastman] Commissioner Rosado.

[Comm. R. Rosado] Yes.

[K. Eastman] Commissioner Turner.

[Comm. C. Turner] Yes.

[Comm. C. Turner] As the votes are in the order, the item is approved.

[Board Chair K. O'Toole] Thank you. As Chair of the Committee on Operations, I will now request to vote on an item that would provide for expanding veteran opportunities at the Port Authority as discussed earlier. Prior to making a motion, I'd ask the Corporate Secretary to note any Commissioner recusals.

[K. Eastman] No recusals.

[Board Chair K. O'Toole] Any Commissioners have any questions or comments? I request a motion.

[Commissioner] So moved.

[Board Chair K. O'Toole] Second?

[Commissioner] Second.

[Board Chair K. O'Toole] Corporate Secretary, please call the roll.

[K. Eastman] Chairman O'Toole.

[Board Chair K. O'Toole] Yes.

(Board Meeting 9/28/17)

[K. Eastman] Vice Chairman Lynford.

[Comm. J.H. Lynford] Yes.

[K. Eastman] Commissioner Bagger.

[Comm. R. Bagger] Yes.

[K. Eastman] Commissioner Eve.

[Comm. L. Eve] Yes.

[K. Eastman] Commissioner Horwitz.

[Comm. D. Horwitz] Yes.

[K. Eastman] Commissioner LaBarbera.

[Comm. G. LaBarbera] Yes.

[K. Eastman] Commissioner McDonald.

[Comm. G. McDonald] Yes.

[K. Eastman] Commissioner Pocino.

[Comm. R. Pocino] Yes.

[K. Eastman] Commissioner Rosado.

[Comm. R. Rosado] Yes.

[K. Eastman] Commissioner Turner.

[Comm. C. Turner] Yes.

[Board Chair K. O'Toole] Item is approved. Commissioner Lynford is Chair of the Committee on Capital Planning, Execution and Asset Management, the World Trade Center Redevelopment. He will now provide a report on two other items before the Board for consideration.

[Vice-Chair J.H. Lynford] Thank you, Mr. Chairman. As Chair of the Committee on Capital Planning, Execution and Asset Management and the World Trade Center Redevelopment Subcommittee, I will now report on certain items under the respective Committees' purview. The first item authorizes a \$30.7 million project to rehabilitate the runway deck varying courses at LaGuardia Airport as well as the award of a contract to construct a portion of the project. Prior to making a motion on this item, I would ask the Corporate Secretary to note any Commissioner recusals on this matter.

[K. Eastman] There are no recusals.

[Vice-Chair J.H. Lynford] Thank you. Do any of the Commissioners have any questions or

(Board Meeting 9/28/17)

comments on this item? Hearing none, I will request a motion on this item.

[Commissioner] So moved.

[Vice-Chair J.H. Lynford] You guys are pretty good. Can I have a second on the motion?

[Commissioner] Second.

[Commissioner] Second.

[Vice-Chair J.H. Lynford] Thank you, you guys and girls, women, ladies, whatever, I'm sorry. Sorry, Loretta.

[Sen. L. Weinberg] Superheroes.

[Board Chair K. O'Toole] Still feeling positive, Loretta?

[Vice-Chair J.H. Lynford] I will now request the Corporate Secretary to call the roll for voting on this item.

[K. Eastman] Chairman O'Toole.

[Board Chair K. O'Toole] Yes.

[K. Eastman] Vice Chairman Lynford.

[Vice-Chair J.H. Lynford] Yes.

[K. Eastman] Commissioner Bagger.

[Comm. R. Bagger] Yes.

[K. Eastman] Commissioner Eve.

[Comm. L. Eve] Yes.

[K. Eastman] Commissioner Horwitz.

[Comm. D. Horwitz] Yes.

[K. Eastman] Commissioner LaBarbera.

[Comm. G. LaBarbera] Yes.

[K. Eastman] Commissioner McDonald.

[Comm. G. McDonald] Yes.

[K. Eastman] Commissioner Pocino.

[Comm. R. Pocino] Yes.

(Board Meeting 9/28/17)

[K. Eastman] Commissioner Rosado.

[Comm. R. Rosado] Yes.

[K. Eastman] Commissioner Turner.

[Comm. C. Turner] Yes.

[Vice-Chair J.H. Lynford] As the votes are in order, the item is approved.

[Board Chair K. O'Toole] Thank you, Vice Chair. As Chair of the Committee on Operations, I will now submit an item which authorizes an agreement with the operating subsidiary of Prologis, yes.

[Vice-Chair J.H. Lynford] I have one more.

[K. Eastman] He has one more.

[Board Chair K. O'Toole] I'm sorry.

[Vice-Chair J.H. Lynford] It's all right.

[Board Chair K. O'Toole] Slow me down, slow me down.

[Vice-Chair J.H. Lynford] Loretta scared you, it's okay. See, Loretta, you got him moving ahead and I got to stop the train every once in a while.

[Vice-Chair J.H. Lynford] The next item authorizes an \$8.5 million contract for the fabrication and installation of an at grade flood mitigation and resiliency improvements to protect Port Authority transportation assets at the World Trade Center site between the West and Greenwich streets. Prior to making a motion on this item, I would ask the Corporate Secretary to note any Commissioner recusals on this matter.

[K. Eastman] There are no recusals.

[Vice-Chair J.H. Lynford] Thank you.

[Vice-Chair J.H. Lynford] Do any of the Commissioners have any questions or comments on this item? I will now request a motion on this item.

[Commissioner] So moved.

[Commissioner] So moved.

[Vice-Chair J.H. Lynford] Thank you. May I have a second on the motion?

[Commissioner] Second.

[Commissioner] Second.

[Vice-Chair J.H. Lynford] Thank you. I will now request the Corporate Secretary to call the roll

(Board Meeting 9/28/17)

for voting on this item.

[K. Eastman] Chairman O'Toole.

[Board Chair K. O'Toole] Yes.

[K. Eastman] Vice Chairman Lynford.

[Vice-Chair J.H. Lynford] Yes.

[K. Eastman] Commissioner Bagger.

[Comm. R. Bagger] Yes.

[K. Eastman] Commissioner Eve.

[Comm. L. Eve] Yes.

[K. Eastman] Commissioner Horwitz.

[Comm. D. Horwitz] Yes.

[K. Eastman] Commissioner LaBarbera.

[Comm. G. LaBarbera] Yes.

[K. Eastman] Commissioner McDonald.

[Comm. G. McDonald] Yes.

[K. Eastman] Commissioner Pocino.

[Comm. R. Pocino] Yes.

[K. Eastman] Commissioner Rosado.

[Comm. R. Rosado] Yes.

[K. Eastman] Commissioner Turner.

[Comm. C. Turner] Yes.

[Vice-Chair J.H. Lynford] As the votes are in order, the item is approved and I turn it back to our best, Chairman.

[Board Chair K. O'Toole] Thank you very much. As Chair of the Committee on Operations, I will now submit an item which authorized an agreement with an operating subsidiary of Prologis, Inc. to allow for Prologis to construct, operate, maintain, and repair a new water mainline underneath certain Port Authority owned property, the Elizabeth Port Authority Marine Terminal in connection with Prologis adjacent Elizabeth Seaport Business Park. Prior to making a motion, I ask the Corporate Secretary are there any Commissioner recusals?

(Board Meeting 9/28/17)

[K. Eastman] No recusals.

[Board Chair K. O'Toole] Any comments or questions? I ask for a motion.

[Commissioner] So moved.

[Board Chair K. O'Toole] Second?

[Commissioner] Second.

[Board Chair K. O'Toole] Roll call.

[K. Eastman] Chairman O'Toole.

[Board Chair K. O'Toole] Yes.

[K. Eastman] Vice Chairman Lynford.

[Vice-Chair J.H. Lynford] Yes.

[K. Eastman] Commissioner Bagger.

[Comm. R. Bagger] Yes.

[K. Eastman] Commissioner Eve.

[Comm. L. Eve] Yes.

[K. Eastman] Commissioner Horwitz.

[Comm. D. Horwitz] Yes.

[K. Eastman] Commissioner LaBarbera.

[Comm. G. LaBarbera] Yes.

[K. Eastman] Commissioner McDonald.

[Comm. G. McDonald] Yes.

[K. Eastman] Commissioner Pocino.

[Comm. R. Pocino] Yes.

[K. Eastman] Commissioner Rosado.

[Comm. R. Rosado] Yes.

[K. Eastman] Commissioner Turner.

(Board Meeting 9/28/17)

[Comm. C. Turner] Yes.

[Board Chair K. O'Toole] Item passed. I will now ask Commissioner Bagger as Chair of the Committee on Finance to provide his report.

[Comm. R. Bagger] Thank you. As Chair of the Committee on Finance, I wish to recommend to the Committee for consideration a resolution authorizing the purchase of public liability insurance coverage for all facilities of the Port Authority and its component units. Committee met in executive session earlier today to discuss those programs and this resolution because they relate to negotiations for purchasing the contracts for insurance. This is a vote of the Finance Committee only as this matter has been delegated to the Committee by the full Board. Prior to making a motion on this item, I'd ask the Corporate Secretary to note any Commissioner recusals.

[K. Eastman] There are no recusals.

[Comm. R. Bagger] Can I have motion from a member of the Committee to approve.

[Commissioner] So moved.

[Comm. R. Bagger] Is there a second?

[Commissioner] Yes, second.

[Comm. R. Bagger] Any discussion on the renewal of the insurance? If not, I'd request the Corporate Secretary to call the roll of the Committee for the voting on this item.

[K. Eastman] Commissioner Bagger.

[Comm. R. Bagger] Yes.

[K. Eastman] Commissioner Eve.

[Comm. L. Eve] Yes.

[K. Eastman] Commissioner Horwitz.

[Comm. D. Horwitz] Yes.

[K. Eastman] Commissioner McDonald.

[Comm. G. McDonald] Yes.

[Comm. R. Bagger] So the votes are in order, the item...

[Comm. G. McDonald] You're right, you're not done.

[Comm. G. McDonald] I wasn't on the...

[Comm. R. Bagger] Pocino.

(Board Meeting 9/28/17)

[Comm. R. Bagger] Commissioner Pocino. Yeah, Pocino.

[Commissioner] Yes.

[Comm. R. Pocino] Yes. The votes are in order, so the item is approved, yes. Back to you.

[Board Chair K. O'Toole] Thank you very much. There being no further business, I move to adjourn the meeting. Any motion?

[Commissioners] So moved.

[Board Chair K. O'Toole] Second?

[Commissioners] Second.

[Board Chair K. O'Toole] All in favor say aye.

[Commissioners] Aye.

[Board Chair K. O'Toole] Meeting's adjourned. Thank you.

[Comm. G. LaBarbera] Thank you.