

(Board Meeting 6/30/16)

The Port Authority of New York and New Jersey
Board Meeting Transcripts
June 30, 2016

[Board Chair J. Degnan] We can move into the full Board meeting, which is now being called to order. Earlier today, the Committees on Finance, Capital Planning, Execution, and Asset Management, and Governance and Ethics met in public session. The Committee on Operations met in both public and executive session, and the World Trade Center Redevelopment Subcommittee met in executive session. Their reports will be filed with the Official Minutes of today's meetings. Commissioners also will meet later today in executive session to discuss the usual exempt matters. And with that, I'm pleased now to report that our Director of Rail Transit Mike Marino, and our Superintendent of Police, Director of Public Safety Mike Fedorko will be recognizing several employees who've recently provided exemplary service in assisting members of the public during separate incidents at the Port Authority and PATH facilities. Mikes? Good morning, Mike.

[M. Marino] Good morning, Sir. How are you?

[Board Chair J. Degnan] Good.

[M. Marino] Commissioners, I'm honored to recognize the staff from Summit Security under the direction of the Office of Chief Security Officer, PATH operations, and the Port Authority Police Department PATH Command. In the early morning of June 5th 2016, Security Operations Center operator Paula Santos was monitoring the surveillance system when she observed a man attempting to assault a woman on our PATH Christopher Street station platform. Miss Santos immediately reported the incident to the SOC supervisor Ebony Grant who notified PAPD and PATH operations staff. PATH communications agents Jacquetta George and communication supervisor Rhonda Hendy initiated the public address system ordering the subject to stop. In minutes, police officers Thomas Hassel and Oraan Zorbaron had arrested the attacker and the emergency medical service had arrived to help the woman. Through diligent investigative efforts, PAPD Detective Brian Compel was able to identify the suspect as the perpetrator of a previously unsolved assault. The outstanding performance by all personnel involved is a classic example of proactive and integrated security programs that deter the effects of criminal activity by utilizing the skills of civilian security specialists, PATH operations personnel, and law enforcement in a coordinated team effort. Security officers Santos and Grant, communication personnel George and Hendy, police officers Hassel and Zorbaron, and detective Compel are commended for their overall performance, outstanding performance, in response to this event. I'd like to ask Police officer Zorbaron, police officer Thomas Hassel, detective Compel could not be with us this morning, I'd also like to invite up Paula Santos, Rhonda Hendy, Ebony Grant, and Jacquetta George to accept some awards. >> Excellent. >> Thank you. >> Thank you very much. Great Job! >> Thank you. >> Thank you very much. >> Congratulations and thank you. >> Thank you very much.

[Board Chair J. Degnan] Mike, I'd just, while the recipients are still standing, I'd like to just add a comment on behalf of the Board and speaking for myself personally, what you are here for this

(Board Meeting 6/30/16)

morning, what you did in those series of events represents the best traditions of public service. It is, I presume, why you work for an agency like the Port Authority. I know it may be within your job description to have done what you did, but not everybody would have done it. It might have been easier for you not to put up with the hassle of intervening in the situation like that, simply hope that it went away but you chose to intervene. I'm proud of that and I'm grateful for your service. The inter-connectedness between those of you who first saw the incident and then tried to intervene through the public service system and the exemplary service of the Police Department represents an effective response to a serious issue, and I'm proud of you as employees of the Port Authority and I thank you for your service.

[M. Marino] Again, thank you. I'm honored to recognize PATH staff with their response to an incident at the Journal Square PATH station. On June 11th 2016, PATH Train Engineer Yenny Vasquez was entering track one in the PATH Journal Square station when a passenger appeared to throw herself onto the track right in front of her train. Miss Vasquez reacted quickly by applying the brake on her train and communicating the emergency to the PATH Control Center via proper procedure on the train's cab radio. Power was immediately shut off, and due to her quick response, Miss Vasquez's train stopped short of hitting the woman on the track. Subsequently, the woman was helped off the track by passengers, operations examiner Messela Williams responded and offloaded passengers from the train that was stopped due to this incident and moved them to another train away from the incident. The Port Authority police responded immediately and assisted in the rescue. Engineer Yenny Vasquez and operations examiner Messela Williams are commended for their outstanding performance in response to this event. And hopefully you're with us. Good job. Thank you. Very good job. Thank you very much.

[Board Chair J. Degnan] Let me just add on behalf of the Board, you saved a life that day. And you probably improved the lives of all the friends and family of that poor woman who without your intervention and action would have died. And I'm sure you can't be any prouder than you are today. I hope you appreciate that the rest of us are grateful for and thank you for your efforts, they were extraordinary. Thank you. >> Thank you, sir.

[Board Chair J. Degnan] Mike Fedorko, are you also making a presentation or...

[M. Fedorko] Thank you, Chairman. Chairman, Vice Chairman, Commissioners, Sergeant Rudy Fernandez is a graduate of Port Authority Police Academy, the 101st class and has been on the force since June 29th, 2001. After various assignments, he was assigned to the Port Authority Bus Terminal. On Wednesday, June 15th, Sergeant Fernandez received information from NYC 9/11 report of a 29-year-old male planning on committing suicide. He was straddled across the parapet of the seventh parking deck. Multiple units responded to the reported location, Sergeant Fernandez thought it would be difficult for a crowd of onlookers to congregate while the subject was planning to jump. Sergeant Fernandez redirected his response to the north wing of the fifth floor of the parking level. Upon arrival, he discovered the male sitting on the parapet ledge. Sergeant Fernandez notified the bus terminal police desk with the exact location of the subject who was planning to jump while engaging the subject into conversation, Sergeant Fernandez learned that the 29-year-old gentleman recently lost his 2-year-old daughter in an automobile collision and felt that he had no reason to live. After a brief conversation with the subject while

(Board Meeting 6/30/16)

using his training and experience, Sergeant Fernandez was able to convince the subject the value of life and the subject climbed down to safety. With this not being the first encounter for Sergeant Fernandez with an individual wanting to end his life, going back to October 2010, Sergeant Fernandez talked a suicidal Iraqi war veteran from jumping from the Outerbridge Crossing for his valiant efforts. In 2010, he was issued the Port Authority Police Department Police Officer of the Month Award. Commissioners, please join me in congratulating Sergeant Rudy Fernandez for his dedication to the Port Authority and the region that he serves and his continued exceptional service in ensuring the safety and well-being of the traveling public.

[Board Chair J. Degnan] Sergeant, I'd just like to add that not only are you clearly an exemplary representative of the Police Department acting in its best traditions, you're one hell of a good human being. Thank you. Okay, I'm now gonna ask the executive director Pat Foye to deliver his report. >> Pat.

[Exec. Dir. P. Foye] Thanks, Chairman. Commissioners, colleagues, and members of the public, I was gonna start with a report on the progress and challenges of overtime, but for couple of reasons, Chairman, I'm gonna save that for the July meeting and cover two things today. I want to talk about Liberty Park, and then I want to talk about cycling on the George Washington Bridge, which is important to some of us today. Yesterday, we quietly, by which I mean no speeches, opened Liberty Park at the World Trade Center site. This one-acre elevated linear park, like the High Line, in this case, on Liberty Street, sitting above the World Trade Center Vehicle Security Center will provide workers, local residents, visitors from around the world open green space from which they can overlook the 9/11 memorial plaza and museum. I invite each of you to visit. On recommending to the Board, today, placement of the Koenig's Sphere damaged on 9/11 in Liberty Park. I'm happy to report that the Greek Orthodox Church, the leadership of the Greek Orthodox Church has reported that they would welcome the Koenig's Sphere in the vicinity of the Greek Orthodox Church, St. Nicholas Church and National Shrine, which is in process of being built with church funds. In addition, in mid-August, the Westfield retail shops at World Trade Center will have their grand opening, beginning with the Italian food market Eataly in 4 World Trade Center in early August. As you all recall, the Port Authority divested its interest in the World Trade Center retail to Westfield, the Australian based global retail operator for a combined 1.4 billion plus in two transactions in 2012 and 2014. This accelerated the agency's move to divest itself of non-core, non-transportation related assets, return to our core mission, and allowed us to redeploy these funds into our transportation network needs. Liberty Park and soon the Westfield retail opening mark additional milestones for us in the completion of the World Trade Center site and restoring the site to the fabric of Lower Manhattan. In addition, I know that many of you who are here today have signed up to speak about bike access at the George Washington Bridge. Let me provide some brief factual background on the issue, as part of the George Washington Bridge Suspender Ropes Program authorized by this Board in March 2014, we evaluated a range of design options taking into account schedule and cost. The project does include planned ADA access improvements and approach sidewalk improvements to improve the experience for pedestrians, bicyclists, and ADA users at an estimated cost of up to 50 million dollars. After completion, both north and south sidewalks will be ADA compliant and include safety fencing. And we anticipate that both sidewalks will be open an operational providing pedestrian and ADA users access on south sidewalk, and bicyclists access on the north sidewalk, which currently requires navigating over several staircases. This will also eliminate

(Board Meeting 6/30/16)

conflicts between pedestrians and cyclists. This is an important project and we have met with many bicycle advocacy groups over the last several years for input on the design including tours of the facility with staff. Both before and after project authorization, we've reviewed these proposals, evaluating them for compliance for ADA access, cost, and feasibility. We appreciate particularly the input, support, and endorsement of groups such as New Jersey Bike and Walk Coalition. I believe Cyndi Steiner, from that group is here with us today. In addition to Transportation Alternatives, and the League of American Bicyclists, we also appreciate the statement issued on Tuesday by the New Jersey Bike and Walk Coalition and Transportation Alternatives expressing their support for our planned ADA improvements and also our plan to separate bike riders and pedestrians as part of the suspender ropes project. Finally, we also thank them for their suggestion to install a bike and pedestrian counter so that we can better maintain estimates for the number of users and on what days of the week and times they use the bridge. As the Coalition and Transportation Alternatives noted in their statement on Tuesday, that counter has already provided all of us useful data that monitor and track usage. Thanks, Chairman.

[Board Chair J. Degnan] Thanks, Pat. We're now gonna move onto the public comments session, but before that, I'd call upon Commissioner Cohen who has a few remarks he'd like to make.

[Board V. Chair S. Cohen] Yeah, specifically in connection with the efforts by the Minimum Wage Working Group, which is chaired by Commissioner Pocino who unfortunately can't be here today. It was our expectation of working with an outside consultant that we were to have received a report of the Working Group, last week. And the expectation was that we would then be, as a Working Group, presenting those recommendations to the Board as a whole. Due to circumstances that we were unable to anticipate or control namely that the outside consulting firm needed some additional time to collect some data, we are in the unfortunate position of having to push this one month. I know that there are a lot of people who are assembled here today who have a particular interest in this matter, and that for many months there have been delays of various kinds before we got to this point. I can assure you on behalf of the Working Group and on behalf of the whole Board, we are absolutely mindful of that. I am as disappointed as anyone in the delays since I have publicly pressed for this to move forward as quickly as possible. As has Commissioner Pocino. And so I apologize to those who are expecting the report today. I assure you that it will take place or we would be in a position to make a recommendation of those findings next month. And again, I know it's not what anyone wants to hear, delay is nobody's friend in an issue like this. What I am not gonna do today, because we have, I think on a number of occasions, spent time as a Board expressing our positions on this issue. My position is well known as is I think just about everybody on this Board. And so there's no point in rehashing it. I have long felt that something needed to be done in this area and next month hopefully we will be in a position to begin joining the issue and again my apologies.

[Board Chair J. Degnan] At this point, we'll move on from the members of the public to make comments. We are asking you to limit your comments to three minutes. And with that, we'll start with Neile Weissman.

[Board Chair J. Degnan] Next person after Neile is Arthur Piccolo. So if at some point in two and half minutes, if you want to step forward, we'll save a little time.

(Board Meeting 6/30/16)

[Neile Weissman] Commissioner Degnan and Director Foye, Commissioners, the Regional Plan association, a longtime collaborator at the Port Authority just released a preview of its fourth regional plan. It identifies four benchmarks needed to fulfill a vision of a fair and thriving region, prosperity and opportunity, affordability, resilience, health, and livability, widening the paths on the GWB to support the growth of cycling across the region achievable for. You have copies of my remarks and on CompleteGeorge.org. Cycling attracts a millennial workforce to maintain our competitiveness. More cycling would allow Bergen County to grow a population in jobs without increasing congestion and spending on roads and mass transit. Completing the bike grids of two states will accelerate fill and enter a bike share to working class, minority communities, in Upper Manhattan and The Bronx, which are often the last to benefit from transportation improvements. RPA recommends that we reduce expenditures on housing and transportation from 51 percent of the average household income to 45 percent. Bike commuting saves \$1400 a year over mass transit and many more thousands over commuting by car. Biking the first and last miles to mass transit extends catchments over walking and reduces parking requirements, which frees up scarce land for commercial development and reduces the cost of residential housing. Every bike trip offsets the emissions of one car trip, which helps the region to reduce greenhouse emissions by 80 percent by 2050. Should extreme weather or the need to repair a rail tunnel disrupt primary modes of transport, which will happen on the L-Train for 18 months starting in 2019, cycling will allow residents to get to work. By enhancing rural economy, cycle tourism reduces the fiscal incentive to convert open space for development. Following London and Stockholm, RPA urges the creation of public part private super agency to plan and finance transportation infrastructure. Notably both cities have invested heavily in cycling infrastructure as the most cost effective means of moving people around. Since April, the Borough of Edgewater, the city of Yonkers, Manhattan Community Board 9, Bronx community Boards 4, 5, 7, and 8 representing 800,000 residents have called upon you to widen the paths. There are now 120 organizations and electives in support. Gateway and the new bus terminal are billions of dollars and decades away from impacting the 4th Regional Plan. But a wider GWB could be up and running by 2020 and for a fraction of the cost. Finally, if you're going to release data on GWB bike ped accounts, please release the raw data. Every time you guys see 300 users per hour, that's the ash toll threshold for widening them. Thank you.

[Board Chair J. Degnan] Thank you. Arthur Piccolo.

[Arthur Piccolo] Commissioners, this is the fourth consecutive month I have appeared before the Port Authority Board to make the case that the Oculus, the spectacular new structure at the World Trade Center be given a formal and a ceremonial name, the Alexander Hamilton Transit Hub. Great buildings deserve great names. What is different this month is that I'm speaking in Jersey City. Today, I walk through the Oculus, to get to PATH to come to New Jersey. And that is the point, today, coming to New Jersey where Alexander Hamilton had such an impact from arrival in America until his death. I have argued that one of the very important reasons among many reasons to name the Oculus in honor of Hamilton is that only Alexander Hamilton is the truly great American who is so closely associated with both New York and New Jersey as is the Port Authority Board spanning both states. Next week, those of us involved with Hamilton, specifically The Alexander Hamilton Awareness Society will present its very ambitious twice-yearly program of events at historic sites associated with Alexander Hamilton in both New York and New Jersey. Next week, for the first time and now each year, we will add Jersey City to the

(Board Meeting 6/30/16)

celebrations. Here is what Alexander Hamilton famously said about Jersey City "One day, a great city will rise on the west banks of the Hudson River." Hamilton's vision for Jersey City is in the process of being fulfilled. Hamilton played an essential role in Jersey City's early success, writing its charter, laying out the street pattern, and giving streets names, but most all, using his vast influence to promote the potential of Jersey City. And had Hamilton not been killed in 1804 in New Jersey at the age of just 47, Jersey City would have benefited far more from his tremendous interest in the city. What is more important about Alexander Hamilton's role in Jersey City is the fact that it is just one place among many in New Jersey that Hamilton's impact was felt and still is. So my overall point is, there is nobody in the history of the United States that relates so well and as had such a powerful influence in the two states that represent, are represented by this Board. And the Oculus, where I was this morning, was filled with thousands of people traveling between New York and New Jersey and others there just to see it. This is a great structure, we are wasting a valuable opportunity to finally honor this great individual who is yet to have a powerful structure named in his honor. America's greatest immigrant and gentleman, Commissioners, I hope you will agree soon to name the Oculus, The Alexander Hamilton Transit Hub. Thank you.

[Board Chair J. Degnan] Thank you. Rosalyn Austin. Margaret Donovan.

[Margaret Donovan] Good afternoon, gentlemen. All of my appearances before you for the past six years can be summed up in one word "Why." Why do you disrespect the role of the public that supports you? The Board is top heavy with lawyers. Presumably, at least one of you has read New York's Open Meeting Law. And the eight narrowly defined reasons to enter into an executive session and shut the public out of the decision making progress. You know that your by-laws require you to act consistent with the two states' transparency laws and the consistent is not an ambiguous term. But you demonstrated again yesterday when you announced that you're going to jam the truly iconic not ersatz Koenig's Sphere into tiny Liberty Park that you are actually the same old arrogant, opaque, elitist Port Authority. You can't separate yourselves from the character of passports because you're just like them. More than what you do, I object to the way you do it. You are a public corporation. You know you are not self-supporting, that the public supports you, but you seem to have a warped understanding of your role. Some of you look down your noses at us and even spend public comment time catching up on your email. But all the mistakes this agency has made over the past 15 years which have put such an enormous burden on the region were made at your marathon executive sessions. The times you may meet in a legitimate executive session are minuscule, but you don't care. Your warped interpretation of the open meetings laws is simple, decide in secret any preordained outcome you can't control and then refuse to answer questions or be accountable. The inspirational Koenig's Sphere should have been enshrined on this site years ago, the decision to banish it into defiance of public opinion, a strongly united front of 9/11 families and even the community Board shines a spotlight on what is so wrong with this agency. Why wasn't the decision to kick the Sphere across the street made in an open session? Why don't we know what the pros and cons were and on whose say so it was decided? I guess, for the same reason, the public was deprived of the rooftop deck we loved and lost, who signed off on that decision or the one that decided that people should pay \$34 a piece just for an elevator ride to the disappointing restaurant at the top of 1 World Trade Center? Why are we always asking "why"? Most of the decisions you make in secret are not your call, maybe people would agree or maybe we wouldn't, but at least we would

(Board Meeting 6/30/16)

know why the public was being overruled again. What qualified this matter for top-secret status? This is our World Trade Center, it belongs to the people, it is not yours alone and it certainly doesn't belong to Michael Bloomberg. Please...Thank you. Please explain why the sighting of the Sphere was not conducted in public? The Sphere belongs on Ground Zero. That's where its eternal flame should be paying tribute to all that was lost. Thank you.

[Board Chair J. Degnan] Ian Mikusko. Ian Mikusko in the audience. We'll move on to Andrea Johnson. Is Andrea Johnson in the audience? Kevin Wisniewski. Is Kevin Wisniewski in the audience? Linda Valdez. Christine Berthet. Christine, are you here?

[Christine Berthet] Gentlemen. So first of all, good morning, my name is Christine Berthet I'm the Co-Chair of Transportation of Community Board 4 where the Port Authority Terminal will be rebuilt. We applaud your decision to facilitate a meeting between contestants of the design competition and community Board amongst other civic originations. But in order to make this exchange productive, we really ask that the August 8th deadline for competitors to submit their design be extended by one or two months. The competitors had essentially two months to put together a proposal for a \$10 billion project arguably more complicated than rebuilding the World Trade Center. This is just not enough. You should all ask your wives if they can redesign your house in two months. It could be as little as two weeks between the community input and the competition deadline. There will simply not be sufficient time to integrate the community input into their result. So in order to further demonstrate your commitment to treat the community as a partner, it is critical that you move the competition deadline. Thank you so much.

[Board Chair J. Degnan] Thank you. Delores Rubin.

[Delores Rubin] Good morning, gentlemen. Oh, excuse me. I'm sorry there is a woman at the table. My name is Delores Rubin. You're not familiar with me. I have succeeded Christine Berthet as the Chair of Community Board 4. I'm also here to speak on the Port Authority potential expansion. Christine's words are very important. We cannot make a decision that's just as significant as potentially redesigning the very structure that is the busiest bus terminal in the world and the largest in this country by just having folks have a chance to look at it over few months. Also, choosing this time period, these are the summer months. We don't have members of our community nor elected officials available to go ahead and in an appropriate way to determine whether this makes sense. There are parameters that you need to use in order to figure out if this is right for your commuters. But you must remember, the Port Authority sits in a residential zone. That means there are thousands of people that live and work in the area. We are neighbors, we're neighbors to the Port Authority Bus Terminal. If you're not aware, Community Board 4 along with our elected officials held a town hall earlier this year. Over 200 members of our community crammed a church that is right in the zone which potentially could be taken away to expand the bus terminal. The reason why so many people in the community showed up is because they are concerned about their homes and their businesses, yet they recognize the importance of this bus terminal. No one denies that that bus terminal needs a refresher. We know that it needs help in order to accommodate the increase of bus traffic that will occur in the tri-state area. It also need to refresher to better service those that are coming in now and also to potentially serve those in the community. The folks that came to this meeting wanted to learn

(Board Meeting 6/30/16)

more and they want to be part of the process. One thing we can tell you for sure, I'm encouraged in hearing that this Board is open to listening to other community groups concerning the bike lanes and concerning what has been happening throughout the entire process in the World Trade Center. This Board should also be willing to work with the Community Board to learn what are the concerns and issues about expanding this particular bus terminal. There may be other alternatives that may have not been thought of, we are a very thoughtful, we are a very educated Community Board, we are a resource, and we can be a partner in this process. There is no reason to go ahead and rush it. It needs to be done correctly. I thank you for your time.

[Board Chair J. Degnan] Thank you. Richard Hughes.

[Richard Hughes] Good afternoon, Commissioners. Couple of years ago, I had high hopes for this agency. I really thought there was a sea-change taking place. I really thought that new Commissioners coming on Board, the new Chairman was going to change things, there seemed to be a commitment to transparency. I thought we were seeing the dawning of a new day. And then yesterday, I learned that the Koenig's Sphere, which is an icon of 9/11 is going to be placed in a little elevated park, hardly anybody is going to visit. It's a nice park, it's a nice design, it'll be sought out by New Yorkers having their lunch break, but the visitors to Ground Zero aren't likely to go up there and see the Sphere. Four years ago, Pat Foye said that it belonged to the Memorial Plaza. And I thought, "Hurray! Finally, we get something right." Pat was absolutely right. That's where it belonged, that's where it should be. The Port Authority lost so many people on 9/11. It seemed the perfect place for it. The Koenig's Sphere was the one thing that did survive 9/11, dented, battered but it survived. What else survived? All those people died. It seemed like such a fitting place for it to be to remind us of what happened and why, and we weren't gonna forget. And instead, it's being sent up to some nice little park, one acre, good lunch break place for a few office workers, instead of being where it should be. I don't know what happened but it seems so indicative of the fact that nothing has changed. Nothing has changed in this agency. We're still doing everything in secret. You still don't seem to understand. This agency belongs to the public, it's a public agency. You work for us, the public. We don't work for you. You carry on as if you're the Soviet Politburo. I mean, that all died. You remember, the Soviet Union died in 1989. You carry on with the same kind of contempt for the public and the public will and the public input. Something has to change. You don't conduct your meetings in the open. You didn't ask for any comment or where the Sphere should go. You don't seem to care about anything the public says. This is our agency. People here show up month after month after month asking for some answers, nothing ever comes through. Pat, you were absolutely right, the Koenig's Sphere belongs on the Memorial Plaza. I don't know what happens since we don't have open meetings, we don't really know what's going on, but that's where it belongs. And I hope you will reconsider before it's too late. It's than better going into a hanger at JFK which is where it was originally headed, so, you know, it's better than nothing. But it's like the whole project, for fifteen years, something that could have been great, something that could have been important just became a mediocre mishmash. So it's just one more lost opportunity and it's got to stop. The sphere belongs in the Memorial Plaza. Put it there. Live up to one commitment. You may. Thank you.

[Board Chair J. Degnan] Ian Mikusko. Ian Mikusko, are you here? This is the second time. Okay.

(Board Meeting 6/30/16)

[Board Chair J. Degnan] Thank you.

[Ian Mikusko] Hello, good morning. Thank you for giving me another chance.

[Board Chair J. Degnan] No problem.

[Ian Mikusko] My name is Ian Mikusko. I'm with the Airport group, the policy and research arm of UNITE HERE, which is the labor union for airport concessions workers, UNITE HERE represents around 5,000 workers at the Port Authority airports including concessions workers in Terminal 5 at JFK. We're here again this month because we believe that JetBlue is still considering AIRMALL as the Terminal 5 concessions manager. In fact, we think they may have been short listed for that business. And we have said from beginning of this process, month after month that AIRMALL is a terrible choice for JetBlue, JFK, and the Port Authority. I want to emphasize here that every other company that is competing for this business opportunity has a good track record in terms of treatment of workers. On the other hand, our experience with AIRMALL is different, surveys by UNITE HERE show that low wages are prevalent under AIRMALL's concessions programs which it manages at BWI airport of Baltimore area. For the life of me, I don't understand why JetBlue is still considering this company. And we have made countless attempts to communicate our concerns to JetBlue. We've called for meeting with JetBlue's leadership, we've heard nothing back from the company, so we ask the Port Authority, if JetBlue makes the mistake of choosing AIRMALL or recommending AIRMALL the Port Authority to sign off on, we hope that the Port Authority does the right thing and refuses to sign off on AIRMALL's lease, and instead insist on the selection of a company whose values align with New York and New Jersey. Thank you.

[Board Chair J. Degnan] Thank you. >> Laura Silver. Laura Silver. Nope? Gertrudis Lopez. Okay, we're good.

[speaking in foreign language]

[Gertrudis Lopez] Good morning. My name is Gertrudis Lopez. I work at Newark International Liberty Airport. I work for United Airlines for a subcontracted cooperate flight.

[speaking in foreign language]

[translator] I have been coming to these Port meetings for the last year and half advocating for my co-workers. And with pain in my eyes, I'm asking you to do something and nothing has been done.

[speaking in foreign language]

[translator] Gertrudis is a little bit nervous, she said the last time that she was here, as she was expressing herself, she saw a few Board members laugh. It is completely disrespectful to have a person like Gertrudis who's been leading this movement, this women works an overnight shift and is militant every month in these meetings. And to have you Members of the Board sit there

(Board Meeting 6/30/16)

and laugh at this hardworking woman, that's the one that cleans your planes like many other of these workers that push your wheelchairs, that clean your terminals is completely uncalled for and disrespectful.

[translator] We'll wrap it up by saying that last week, she met with the Secretary of Labor, Mr. Perez, and he sat there and listened to her preoccupations and those of the workers. So she deserves that kind of respect.

[translator] So he also cited that airport workers are the ones that keep our airports functioning nationwide, they keep our airports clean, I guess he added to what I just said.

[Board Chair J. Degnan] You have to wrap it up now, please.

[translator] Okay.

[speaking in foreign language]

[translator] Thank you. Have a good day.

[Board Chair J. Degnan] I was here at the last meeting, I've been here at every meeting when the 32BJ and UNITE people have spoken. I've never seen a member the Board laugh. You are entitled to respect, our respect, and our attention. If you perceived it otherwise, I'm sorry for that. But it certainly doesn't reflect my attitude or I think the attitude of my colleagues. We respect your right to address these issues and I think we've listened attentively month after month after month after month. Murray Bodin.

[Murray Bodin] Good morning. My name is Murray Bodin. I was born June 11, 1933. I put that in so that they tag it in case they look for me. I got here this morning about 7 o'clock because I wanted to walk around, I spent half an hour right on the dock looking at the ferries going back and forth and the people going to work just to get a feel for what goes on here. Over the course of the next two hours, I talked to probably 50 people to find out whether or not what I was doing resonated and how other people felt about it. Well, pretty good. In contrast to Tuesday when I was at the New Jersey Turnpike and got into a little problem because I indicated their traffic engineers were sort of not telling them the truth, I used stronger language. I contrast that to the Port Authority where I've raised some questions about the traffic engineers and a meeting will be scheduled with the correct people for me to sit down with them and go over whether or not they're using the best, safest information for the Port Authority. Next, a week from Wednesday, my granddaughter who just graduated Albany is going to Dickinson College to play basketball. She is the star of the Albany team where she came from, she's gonna come down spend three days with us, we're going to the theatre on Tuesday night, on Wednesday we're going to World Trade Center. We're gonna go up, we're gonna walk on that new park that you've created, a year ago when my grandson was here, we did pretty much the same thing, only the park wasn't there. So we look forward to that. Biking on a bridge, my daughter-in-law lives in north New Jersey, she bikes to work and she crosses that bridge. She finds it's much better than trying to park in New York City. The perception that I have of numerous people who have talked to me this morning, if I were doing something really, really bad why are you all saying hello to me? I mean,

(Board Meeting 6/30/16)

this is like 50 people saying hello, oh, where were you? We knew you were gonna come this morning. And I do say a lot of controversial things. But the overlord, I don't know if I'm talking to the same group that these people are talking to because my reaction with you is, this is not the World Trade Center Board of three, four's ago, 'cause I've been here then. The cooperation I'm getting is excellent. You're listening. I don't get it. I have... Jim, come on. Come here, Jim. I mean, we've been doing this for at least five years. And you're doing an excellent job.

[Board Chair J. Degnan] You've got about 10 seconds more, Murray. Thank you. Thank you, Murray.

[Murray Bodin] I just want to say thank you to all of you for all the people around here for doing an excellent job.

[Board Chair J. Degnan] Thank you. >> Thank you. Sarah Sirpas. Sarah Sirpas? If you're not here, we'll move on to Michael Birk. Is Michael Birk in the audience? Let me know you're here so I can hold up, otherwise we're gonna move on. Michael Birk's not here so we're gonna move on to Cyndi Steiner.

[Cyndi Steiner] Murray's getting in the way back there. I'm Cyndi Steiner Executive Director of New Jersey Bike and Walk Coalition. Our organization would like to thank the officials who have committed to making the George Washington Bridge more bike and ped friendly including Chairman John Degnan, Vice Chairman Scott Rechler, and the rest of the Board of Commissioners, Port Authority Executive Director Pat Foye, Cedrick Fulton who is Director of Tunnels, Bridges, and Terminals and Robert Durando the General Manager of the George Washington Bridge. Our organization commends the Authority for responding to our request back in February of 2013 to keep the bike and ped path open during the 10-year Suspender Rope Replacement Project, thereby accommodating the 380,000 bike riders who traverse the bridge every year for recreation and transportation purposes. Thank you also for hearing our request for the installation of a state-of-the-art bike and ped counter on the bridge. This counter will provide the Authority with additional guidance in accommodating active transportation on the bridge and it further demonstrates the agency's commitment to providing transportation options. The counts from 2015 clearly show the continuing need to accommodate bicyclists and pedestrians who use the bridge for both recreation and as a means to reach their workplaces on both sides of the river. We are eager to work with the Authority in finding permanent ways to accommodate increasing volumes of riders. And then just real quickly, I apologize I have this third hand but apparently yesterday there were police officers ticketing bike riders for not having bells on their bikes. I don't know if it was NYPD or if it was Port Authority Police. We appreciate the Authority's attempt to increase safety of riders, but it would be helpful if we had the opportunity to communicate that out to our riders first that that's the rule that they have to have a bell. So if we could pass that on, that would be great. Thank you for your time.

[Board Chair J. Degnan] Thank you. I understand that Rosalyn Austin, who I called on earlier, was not in the room but would like to speak. Excuse me.

[Rosalyn Austin] Hi, my name is Rosalyn Austin and I work for areas on Newark Airport. We are members of the UNITE Local HERE 100. We are currently in negotiations with arrears. I'm

(Board Meeting 6/30/16)

grateful to have the opportunity to bargain for good raises and benefits and have the security of the union job. Arrears has been able to provide my co-workers and I good wages and benefits. I want to continue to have a good job at the airport. I'm worried that if JetBlue picks AIRMALL for Terminal 5, it sets a bad example that could eventually effect all the Port Authority airports including Newark. Thank you.

[Board Chair J. Degnan] Thank you. I guess not. Then the last speaker is Minister Ronald Tuff.

[Rev. Ronald Tuff] I'd just like to correct it for the records Reverend Ronald Tuff. I'm gonna ask SEIU 32BJ please stand while I'm talking. Good morning. My name is Rev. Ronald Tuff. I'm the Pastor of First Bethel Baptist Church in Irvington, New Jersey. I'm here to give you a wakeup call and it's time for you to wake up and listen to the pleas of the airport workers who are suffering because of your inaction. Every day that you fail to live up to your promise to vote... for the long and delayed wages and benefits for airport workers' families, they suffer and their children will go hungry. Commissioner Foye, you made mention to a plan that you guys are gonna vote on in July. And it was a little hazy so I'm asking you right now, are you going to vote in July on a plan for the wage increase for the airport workers.

[Exec. Dir. P. Foye] I don't get to vote, but I'll refer to my colleagues on the Board.

[Rev. Ronald Tuff] Yes, sir.

[Board Chair J. Degnan] We don't answer questions during the session so please go on with your remarks. Commissioner Cohen has said that he expects that a report will be rendered before the July meeting and that this Subcommittee, the Working Committee of the Board will make a set of recommendations based on that report in July.

[Rev. Ronald Tuff] Most of you had said that you would vote in favor of higher wages for airport workers. So why delay. Justice delayed is justice denied. Wake up, wake up and see the injustice that is happening through your inaction. Wake up and live up to your promise to deliver justice for airport workers. Vote now for higher wages, vote now for airport workers, vote now, vote now, vote now, vote now, vote now. >> Vote now. Vote now. Vote now. Vote now. Vote now. Vote now. Vote now.

[Rev. Ronald Tuff] Commissioner Foye, we have set up a meeting in your office next week. We will be there with bells on. And hopefully in July, we can come and as you heard, other unions and other speakers talk about justice denied and in coming to meeting after meeting. So hopefully, July will be the last time that we can come and the wages can have a livable wage. Vote now. >> Thank you.

[Board Chair J. Degnan] Thank you. >> Vote now. Vote now.

[Board Chair J. Degnan] We have several other times on today's agenda for which the respective Committee chairs will be asked to provide a brief report prior to the matter of being considered by the Board. I'll now ask Commissioner Bagger as Chair of the Committee on Finance to

(Board Meeting 6/30/16)

[K. Eastman] No recusals.

[Board Chair J. Degnan] Any of the Commissioners have any questions or comments about this item? if not, I'll take a motion on it. >> So moved. >> Second. I'll now as the Corporate Secretary to conduct the roll call vote.

[K. Eastman] Chairman Degnan. >> Yes. >> Vice Chairman Cohen. >> Yes. >> Commissioner Bagger. >> Yes. >> Commissioner Fascitelli. >> Yes. >> Commissioner James. >> Yes. >> Commissioner Laufenburg. >> Yes. >> Commissioner Lipper. >> Yes. >> Commissioner Lynford. >> Yes. >> Commissioner Schuber. >> Yes. >> Commissioner Steiner. >> Yes.

[Board Chair J. Degnan] Votes are in order, the item is approved. The next item which was discussed in Committee earlier today authorizes at lease with Starbucks at the Journal Square Transportation Center for a 10-year term and a total rental of about 1.4 million dollars. Prior to making to a motion on this item, I'd ask the Secretary to note any recusals.

[K. Eastman] Vice Chairman Cohen is recused.

[Board Chair J. Degnan] Any of the Commissioners have any comments or questions? If not, is there a motion? >> So moved. >> Second. Karen, would you call the roll?

[K. Eastman] Chairman Degnan. >> Yes. >> Vice Chairman Cohen. >> Recused. >> Commissioner Bagger. >> Yes. >> Commissioner Fascitelli. >> Yes. >> Commissioner James. >> Yes. >> Commissioner Laufenburg. >> Yes. >> Commissioner Lipper. >> Yes. >> Commissioner Lynford. >> Yes. >> Commissioner Schuber. >> Yes. >> Commissioner Steiner. >> Yes. >> The votes are in order, the item is approved. As Vice Chair of the Committee on Capital Planning, Execution, and Asset Management, I bring to the Board's attention the first item which authorizes a 170 million dollar project as we heard earlier today for the replacement of the toll collection system at the bridge and tunnel facilities. Are there any recusals on this?

[K. Eastman] No recusals.

[Board Chair J. Degnan] Is there any questions or comments by the Commissioners? If not, is there is a motion? >> So moved. >> Second. Karen, would you take the roll please?

[K. Eastman] Chairman Degnan. >> Yes. >> Vice Chairman Cohen. >> Yes. >> Commissioner Bagger. >> Yes. >> Commissioner Fascitelli. >> Yes. >> Commissioner James. >> Yes. >> Commissioner Laufenburg. >> Yes. >> Commissioner Lipper. >> Yes. >> Commissioner Lynford. >> Yes. >> Commissioner Schuber. >> Yes. >> Commissioner Steiner. >> Yes.

[Board Chair J. Degnan] Votes are in order, the item is approved. The next item authorizes 1.84 million dollars in additional funds and related contract actions to complete the Shore Power Facility project at the Brooklyn Cruise terminal located at Pier 12. Are there any recusals on this?

[K. Eastman] No recusals.

(Board Meeting 6/30/16)

[Board Chair J. Degnan] Any of the Commissioners have any questions or comments? If not, is there a motion? >> So moved. >> Second. Karen, would you take the roll please.

[K. Eastman] Chairman Degnan. >> Yes. >> Vice Chairman Cohen. >> Yes. >> Commissioner Bagger. >> Yes. >> Commissioner Fascitelli. >> Yes. >> Commissioner James. >> Yes. >> Commissioner Laufenburg. >> Yes. >> Commissioner Lipper. >> Yes. >> Commissioner Lynford. >> Yes. >> Commissioner Schuber. >> Yes. >> Commissioner Steiner. >> Yes.

[Board Chair J. Degnan] Yes, I could see the look on your face. As the votes are in order, the item is approved. Someone is wondering why it's coming to the Board. I will now provide a report on the World Trade Center Redevelopment Subcommittee with the advancement of an item that authorizes an amendment of agreements with affiliates of the Durst Organization to support the lease up on 1 World Trade Center with a pre-built program that the Board has previously addressed and approved in earlier phases. Are there any recusals?

[K. Eastman] No recusals.

[Board Chair J. Degnan] Any of the Commissioners have any comments or questions? If not, is there a motion? >> So moved. >> Second. >> Second. >> Karen, would you take the roll please?

[K. Eastman] Chairman Degnan. >> Yes. >> Vice Chairman Cohen. >> Yes. >> Commissioner Bagger. >> Yes. >> Commissioner Fascitelli. >> Yes. >> Commissioner James. >> Yes. >> Commissioner Laufenburg. >> Yes. >> Commissioner Lipper. >> Yes. >> Commissioner Lynford. >> Yes. >> Commissioner Schuber. >> Yes. >> Commissioner Steiner. >> Yes

[Board Chair J. Degnan] Votes are in order and the item is approved. I'll now we ask Commissioner Lipper as Chair of the Committee on Governance and Ethics to provide his report.

[Comm. K. Lipper] Thank you, Chairman Degnan. As Chair of the Committee on Governance and Ethics, I wish to put forth to the Board for consideration, a resolution that was reviewed with the Committee at its public meeting earlier today, which codifies the role and responsibility of the General Counsel with respect to the review of contracts and agreements that were approved by the Board or a Committee of the Board. Are there any recusals?

[K. Eastman] No recusals.

[Comm. K. Lipper] I will now request a motion for this. >> Moved. >> Second.

[Comm. K. Lipper] Thank you. Any discussion? Any objections?

[Board Chair J. Degnan] I think Karen's gonna take a roll call vote on this.

[K. Eastman] Chairman Degnan. >> Yes. >> Vice Chairman Cohen. >> Yes. >> Commissioner Bagger. >> Yes. >> Commissioner Fascitelli. >> Yes. >> Commissioner James. >> Yes. >> Commissioner Laufenburg. >> Yes. >> Commissioner Lipper. >> Yes. >> Commissioner

(Board Meeting 6/30/16)

Lynford. >> Yes. >> Commissioner Schuber. >> Yes. >> Commissioner Steiner. >> Yes

[Board Chair J. Degnan] That completes the agenda. The motion is approved to adjourn the meeting. And the meeting is adjourned. Thank you.