Torres Rojas, Genara

From: Andrea Bernstein [mailto:abernstein@wnyc.org]
Sent: Tuesday, October 21, 2014 2:29 PM
To: Valens, Chris; Duffy, Daniel
Subject: FOIL REQUEST

October 21, 2014

Daniel Duffy
FOI Administrator
Port Authority of New York and New Jersey
225 Park Avenue South
New York, NY 10003

Dear Mr. Duffy,

Under the Freedom of Information Law of the State of New York and the Open Public Records Act of the State of New Jersey, I hereby request any and all records of bills submitted, and records of payments made to outside attorneys for Port Authority staff, past or present, as the result of lane closures of the George Washington Bridge in September 2013 from September, 2014 through the present date.

I request the records whether they exist in paper or electronic form, in "written or printed book, document, drawing, map, plan, photograph, microfilm, data processed or imaged processed document, information stored or maintained electronically or by sound recording or in a similar device, or any copy thereof, that has been made, generated, maintained, received in the course of transacting official business and kept on file."

There is nothing in this request "would constitute an unwarranted invasion of personal privacy or an individual or individuals." Indeed, similar records have already been deemed releasable under OPRA, and have been released, by the New Jersey Attorney General's office. Information that would reveal personal information about the employee represented was redacted by the AG, and I expect that you would redact it too. However, that does not mean that the entire record is exempt from release, as the NJ AG has determined.

Moreover, as there is a substantial sum of tollpayer and/or taxpayer dollars involved, release of these records is a matter of public record and interest.

This request is made pursuant to the resolution by the Board of Commissioners of the Port Authority of New York and New Jersey approved on 3/29/2012 and the Port Authority by-laws, which state that the Port Authority shall abide by a freedom of information code consistent with the freedom of information laws of New York and New Jersey.

As I am a journalist and working on deadline, I would prefer that you release any records in electronic form in the most timely manner possible.

Moreover, if any portion of the documents releasable under this request shall be redacted, you must supply reasons under the Port Authority code and/or FOIL for the specific redaction.

Sincerely

Andrea Bernstein (by electronic signature)

Andrea Bernstein, Senior Editor, Politics & Policy

W N Y C New York Public Radio

☎ *+1 646 829 4457 (office)*
☎ *+1 917 653 0014 (cell)*
✉ *160 Varick Street, New York, 10013*

abernstein@wnyc.org

@AndreaWNYC

THE PORT AUTHORITY OF NY & NJ

FOI Administrator

October 28, 2014

Ms. Andrea Bernstein
WNYC New York Public Radio
160 Varick Street
New York, NY 10013

Re: Freedom of Information Reference No. 15417

Dear Ms. Bernstein:

This is in response to your October 21, 2014 request, which has been processed under the Port Authority's Freedom of Information Code (the "Code"), for copies of any and all records of bills submitted, and records of payments made to outside attorneys for Port Authority staff, past or present, as the result of lane closures of the George Washington Bridge in September 2013 from September, 2014 through the date of the request.

Material responsive to your request and available under the Code can be found on the Port Authority's website at http://www.panynj.gov/corporate-information/foi/15417-O.pdf. Paper copies of the available records are available upon request.

Certain portions of the material responsive to your request are exempt from disclosure pursuant to exemptions (1) and (4) of the Code.

Please refer to the above FOI reference number in any future correspondence relating to your request.

Very truly yours,

Daniel D. Duffy
FOI Administrator

225 Park Avenue South, 17th FL
New York, NY 10003
T: 212 435 3642 F: 212 435 7555

McKenna, DuPont, Higgins & Stone P.C.
PO Box 610
229 Broad Street
Red Bank, New Jersey 07701

Ph:(732) 741-6681

Oct 09, 2014

File #:
Inv #: 61289

RE: Exemption (1)

DATE	DESCRIPTION	HOURS	AMOUNT	LAWYER
Jul-09-2014		0.40	140.00	EW
Aug-22-2014	Exemption (1)	5.00	1,750.00	EW
	TOTAL HOURS AND FEES:	5.40	$1,890.00	

Total Fees, Disbursements	**$1,890.00**
Previous Balance	$0.00
20% discount	-$378.00
Balance Due Now	**$1,512.00**

WALDER HAYDEN P.A.
5 Becker Farm Road • Roseland, New Jersey 07068 • 973-992-5300

OCTOBER 07 2014

FILE NO.:

Exemption (1)

BILL# 68843

FOR PROFESSIONAL SERVICES RENDERED:
RE:
Exemption (1)
LEGAL FEES:

SEPT 24 14 JPW	1.50	1,087.50
SEPT 26 14 JPW	3.20	2,320.00
SEPT 26 14 SGW	6.50	2,600.00
SEPT 29 14 JPW	1.00	725.00

Exemption (1)

LAWYER SUMMARY

JUSTIN P. WALDER	JPW	5.70	725.00	4,132.50
STEVEN G. WALDER	SGW	6.50	400.00	2,600.00
		TOTAL HOURS:		12.20
		TOTAL FEES:		6,732.50
				$6,732.50
		LESS 20% PROFESSIONAL COURTESY:		$1,346.50
		BALANCE DUE:		$5,386.00

0001

KOSTELANETZ & FINK, LLP
7 WORLD TRADE CENTER
NEW YORK, NEW YORK 10007

TEL: (212) 808-8100
FAX: (212) 808-8108
www.kflaw.com

Statement #107222
July 31, 2014
14192

PERSONAL AND CONFIDENTIAL

Exemption (1)

FOR PROFESSIONAL SERVICES RENDERED from July 1, 2014, through July 31, 2014	$ 8,562.50
COURTESY DISCOUNT (20% of July, 2014 Fees) . . .	($ 1,712.50)
BALANCE DUE	**$ 6,850.00**

KOSTELANETZ & FINK, LLP

TIME ENTERED (Billable, NonBillable, WIP Adj)

For Matters

From: Trans: 07/01/2014 & System: 01/01/1900 12:00:00 AM
Thru: Trans: 07/31/2014 & System: 09/03/2014 11:59:59 PM

Report ID: TTE$
Processed: 09/03/2014 4:15:34 PM

Client/Matter ID/Name Date	Tmkpr	Type	Billable / Rate Type / Code	Hold/ Print	Seq #	Original Hours/ Units	Original Rate	Original Amount	Adjmt Amount	Net Hours/ Units	Net Rate	Net Amount
07/03/2014					756902	1.80	685.00	1,233.00		1.80	685.00	1,233.00
07/07/2014					756910	0.10	685.00	68.50		0.10	685.00	68.50
07/09/2014		Exemption (1)			756919	5.00	685.00	3,425.00		5.00	685.00	3,425.00
07/10/2014					756926	5.60	685.00	3,836.00		5.60	685.00	3,836.00
07/31/2014					761191					0.00	0.00	-1,712.50
**Total				Billable Time		12.50		8,562.50		12.50		8,562.50
				WIP/Time								-1,712.50

Report Totals — **Matter Count: 1**

Billable Time	**12.50**	**8,562.50**	**12.50**	**8,562.50**
WIP/Time				**-1,712.50**
Billable Time Total	**12.50**	**8,562.50**	**12.50**	**6,850.00**

HELLRING LINDEMAN GOLDSTEIN & SIEGAL LLP

COUNSELLORS AT LAW

BERNARD HELLRING (1916-1991)
JOEL D. SIEGAL Δ
JONATHAN L. GOLDSTEIN Δ
MICHAEL EDELSON
MARGARET DEE HELLRING Δ
CHARLES ORANSKY Δ
RICHARD B. HONIG Δ
RICHARD K. COPLON Δ
ROBERT S. RAYMAR Δ
STEPHEN L. DREYFUSS Δ
PATRICIA A. STAIANO
JOHN A. ADLER Δ
JUDAH I. ELSTEIN Δ
BRUCE S. ETTERMAN Δ
MATTHEW E. MOLOSHOK Δ
DAVID N. NARCISO Δ
ROBERT B. ROSEN Δ
SHERYL E. KOOMER
RONNIE F. LIEBOWITZ
LISA P. PARKER
CHRISTY L. SAALFELD Δ
JOSEPH H. TRINGALI Δ

ΔNJ & NY

ONE GATEWAY CENTER
NEWARK, NEW JERSEY 07102-5386
(973) 621-9020

FAX (973) 621-7406

www.hlgslaw.com

OF COUNSEL
DAVID LANDAU

PHILIP LINDEMAN II (1925-2011)
RICHARD D. SHAPIRO (1944-2011)

July 1, 2014

PERSONAL & CONFIDENTIAL

Exemption (1)

To Professional Services Rendered for the period from May 1, 2014 through June 30, 2014 for legal services rendered

Exemption (1)

Allocation of Time:

Joseph H. Tringali	2.50 hours x $390 = ...	$975.00
Less: Agreed upon 20% legal fee reduction		195.00
		$780.00

Actual Out-of-Pocket Disbursements:

Telephone	7.00	
Postage	0.48	
Federal Express	16.83	24.31

Total Amount Due At This Time $804.31

Hellring Lindeman Goldstein & Siegal LLP
Counsellors At Law
One Gateway Center
Newark, NJ 07102-5386
T: +1.973.621.9020 | F: +1.973.621.7406

Matter #:

Re: Exemption (1)

Date: July 1, 2014
Invoice #: 621418
Tax ID: Exemption (1/4)

Date	Description	Atty	Hrs	
Professional Time				
05/01/2014		JHT	0.30	
05/02/2014		JHT	0.20	
/14/2014	Exemption (1)	JHT	0.40	
05/15/2014		JHT	0.50	
05/21/2014		JHT	0.30	
06/09/2014		JHT	0.30	
06/27/2014		JHT	0.50	
	Total Professional Time		**2.50**	**$975.00**
	20% legal fee reduction			**-195.00**
	Total Professional Time			**$780.00**

Attorney Summary

JHT	Joseph H. Tringali	2.50	390.00	975.00

Actual Out-of-Pocket Disbursements

Telephone	$7.00
Postage	$0.48
FedEx	$16.83

Hellring Lindeman Goldstein & Siegal LLP
Counsellors At Law
One Gateway Center
Newark, NJ 07102-5386
T: +1.973.621.9020 | F: +1.973.621.7406

Matter #:

Re: Exemption (1)

Date: July 1, 2014
Invoice #: 621418
Tax ID: Exemption (1/4)

Date	Description	Atty	Hrs	
	Exemption (1)	Total Out-of-Pocket Disbursements		24.31
		Invoice Total		$804.31

GT GreenbergTraurig

Invoice No.: 3723649
File No. :
Bill Date : August 26, 2014

Exemption (1)

INVOICE

Re:

Exemption (1)

Legal Services through July 31, 2014:

	$	55,527.50
Discount per agreed upon blended rate of $490/hr (41.32%):	$	(22,942.50)
Total Fees:	$	32,585.00
Current Invoice:	**$**	**32,585.00**
Previous Balance (see attached statement):	$	6,116.45
Total Amount Due:	**$**	**38,701.45**

* * * * *

GB:CAV
Tax ID:

Exemption (1/4)

GT GreenbergTraurig

Invoice No.: 3723649
File No.

Summary of Fees (Standard Rates)

Timekeeper	Hours	Rate		Amount
Geoffrey Berman	66.50	835.00		55,527.50
Totals:	66.50	835.00	$	55,527.50

Summary of Fees (Discounted Rates)

Timekeeper	Hours	Rate		Amount
Geoffrey Berman	66.50	490.00		32,585.00
Totals:	66.50	490.00	$	32,585.00

* * * * *

GB:CAW
Tax ID: Exemption (1/4)

GT GreenbergTraurig

Invoice No.: 3723649
File No. :

FOR YOUR CONVENIENCE,
WIRING INSTRUCTIONS FOR GT FIRM ACCOUNT
FOR FEES & COSTS ARE AS FOLLOWS:

TO:
ABA #:
CREDIT TO: Exemption (1)
ACCOUNT #:

PLEASE
REFERENCE:

Wire fees may be assessed by your bank.
*** If paying more than one invoice, please reference all invoice numbers in wiring instructions.**

FOR CREDIT CARD PAYMENTS:
www.gtlawbilling.com

GB:CAV'
Tax ID: Exemption (1/4)

GT GreenbergTraurig

Invoice No.: 3723640
File No. :

Account Statement

Date	Invoice #		Fees Due		Expenses Due		Other Due		Total Due
07/16/14	3699209		5,537.00		579.45		0.00		6,116.45
	Totals:	$	5,537.00	$	579.45	$	0.00	$	6,116.45

GB:CAV
Tax ID:

Exemption (1/4)

Invoice No.: 3723649

Matter No.:

Description of Professional Services Rendered:

DATE	TIMEKEEPER	DESCRIPTION	HOURS
07/01/14	Geoffrey Berman		5.60
07/03/14	Geoffrey Berman		5.20
07/04/14	Geoffrey Berman		3.20
07/07/14	Geoffrey Berman		5.80
07/08/14	Geoffrey Berman	Exemption (1)	3.80
07/09/14	Geoffrey Berman		4.20
07/10/14	Geoffrey Berman		5.30
07/15/14	Geoffrey Berman		6.10
07/16/14	Geoffrey Berman		4.20
07/17/14	Geoffrey Berman		5.60
07/18/14	Geoffrey Berman		5.80
07/21/14	Geoffrey Berman		3.20
07/22/14	Geoffrey Berman		4.10
07/23/14	Geoffrey Berman		4.40
		Total Time:	66.50

Re: Exemption (1)

Matter No.:

Description of Expenses Billed:

DATE	DESCRIPTION		AMOUNT
	Total Expenses:	$	0.00

GT GreenbergTraurig

Invoice No.: 3741834
File No. :
Bill Date : September 19, 2014

Exemption (1)

INVOICE

Re: Exemption (1)

Legal Services through August 31, 2014:

		$	3,924.50
Discount per agreed upon blended rate of $490/hr.(41.32%):		$	(1,621.50)
Total Fees:		$	2,303.00
Expenses:			
Photocopy Charges	109.80		
Total Expenses:		$	109.80
Current Invoice:		**$**	**2,412.80**
Previous Balance (see attached statement):		$	38,701.45
Total Amount Due:		**$**	**41,114.25**

* * * * *

GB:SB
Tax ID: Exemption (1/4)

GT GreenbergTraurig

Invoice No.: 3741834
File No. :

Summary of Fees (Standard Rates)

Timekeeper	Hours	Rate		Amount
Geoffrey Berman	4.70	835.00		3,924.50
Totals:	4.70	835.00	$	3,924.50

Summary of Fees (Discounted Rates)

Timekeeper	Hours	Rate		Amount
Geoffrey Berman	4.70	490.00		2,303.00
Totals:	4.70	490.00	$	2,303.00

* * * * *

GB:SB
Tax ID: Exemption (1/4)

GT GreenbergTraurig

Invoice No.: 3741834
File No. :

Account Statement

Date	Invoice #	Fees Due	Expenses Due	Other Due	Total Due
07/16/14	3699209	5,537.00	579.45	0.00	6,116.45
08/26/14	3723649	32,585.00	0.00	0.00	32,585.00
	Totals:	$ 38,122.00	$ 579.45	$ 0.00	$ 38,701.45

GB:SB
Tax ID: Exemption (1/4)

Invoice No.: 3741834

Matter No.:

Description of Professional Services Rendered:

DATE	TIMEKEEPER	DESCRIPTION	HOURS
08/11/14	Geoffrey Berman	Exemption (1)	2.30
08/12/14	Geoffrey Berman		2.40
		Total Time:	4.70

Re: Exemption (1)

Matter No.:

Description of Expenses Billed:

DATE	DESCRIPTION			AMOUNT
08/01/14	Copy; 732 Page(s) by 016310		$	109.80
		Total Expenses:	$	109.80

GT GreenbergTraurig

Invoice No.: 3755458
File No. :
Bill Date : October 8, 2014

Exemption (1)

INVOICE

Re: Exemption (1)

Legal Services through September 30, 2014:

	Total Fees:	$	22,981.00
Expenses:			
Information and Research	974.35		
	Total Expenses:	$	974.35
	Current Invoice:	**$**	**23,955.35**
	Previous Balance (see attached statement):	$	2,412.80
	Total Amount Due:	**$**	**26,368.15**

Total discount per agreed upon blended rate of $490 for legal services through September 30, 2014: 31.93%.

* * * * *

GB:SB
Tax ID: Exemption (1/4)

Summary of Fees (Standard Rates)

Timekeeper	Hours	Rate		Amount
Geoffrey Berman	2.30	835.00		1,920.50
Eric Wong	44.60	415.00		18,509.00
Totals:	46.90	435.60	$	20,429.50

Summary of Fees (Discounted Rates)

Timekeeper	Hours	Rate		Amount
Geoffrey Berman	2.30	490.00		1,127.00
Eric Wong	44.60	490.00		21,854.00
Totals:	46.90	490.00	$	22,981.00

* * * * *

GB:SB
Tax ID: Exemption (1/4)

GT GreenbergTraurig

GT GreenbergTraurig

Invoice No.: 3755458
File No. :

TO:
ABA #:
CREDIT TO:
ACCOUNT #:

Exemption (1)

PLEASE
REFERENCI

Wire fees may be assessed by your bank.

*** If paying more than one invoice, please reference all invoice numbers in wiring instructions.**

FOR CREDIT CARD PAYMENTS:
www.gtlawbilling.com

GB:SB
Tax ID:

Exemption (1/4)

GT GreenbergTraurig

Invoice No.: 3755458
File No. :

Account Statement

Date	Invoice #	Fees Due	Expenses Due	Other Due	Total Due
09/19/14	3741834	2,303.00	109.80	0.00	2,412.80
	Totals:	$ 2,303.00	$ 109.80	$ 0.00	$ 2,412.80

GB:SB
Tax ID: Exemption (1/4)

Invoice No.: 3755458

Matter No.: 151131.010100

Description of Professional Services Rendered:

DATE	TIMEKEEPER	DESCRIPTION	HOURS
09/09/14	Eric Wong		1.20
09/12/14	Eric Wong	Exemption (1)	2.30
09/15/14	Eric Wong		4.20
09/16/14	Eric Wong		5.80
09/22/14	Eric Wong		7.30
09/23/14	Eric Wong		9.80
09/24/14	Eric Wong		9.90
09/26/14	Eric Wong		4.10
09/30/14	Geoffrey Berman		2.30
		Total Time:	46.90

Re: Exemption (1)

Matter No.:

Description of Expenses Billed:

DATE	DESCRIPTION			AMOUNT
09/12/14	WestlawNext Research by WONG,ERIC.		$	286.01
09/15/14	WestlawNext Research by WONG,ERIC.		$	286.01
09/16/14	WestlawNext Research by WONG,ERIC.		$	402.33
		Total Expenses:	$	974.35

Disbursement Card

Filter
Disb ID 43436806

Disbursement Details

Client	151131	Exemption (1)	
Matter	010100		
Entry Empl	4688	Fernandez, Annie	
Auth Empl			
Disb Empl	EDX	Wong, Eric	
Billed Empl	EDX	Wong, Eric	
Disb Office	24	New Jersey	
Office	24	New Jersey	Session
Dept	0500	Litigation	Source Tran Type
Profit Center	GT	Greenberg Traurig - General	Disb Type Code
Project			Reference
			Date
Std Amt	$286.01	Currency Code USD	Post Date
Base Amt	$286.01	Base Qty 0.000000	Hold Date
Tobill Amt	$286.01		Latest Period
Billed Amt	$286.01	Bill Qty 0.000000	Bill Date
			Prebill Num
			Bill Num

Dis

WII

Narrative
WestlawNext Research by WONG,ERIC.

Disbursement Card

Filter
Disb ID 43455674

Disbursement Details

Client	151131	Exemption (1)	
Matter	010100		
Entry Empl	4688	Fernandez, Annie	
Auth Empl			
Disb Empl	EDX	Wong, Eric	
Billed Empl	EDX	Wong, Eric	
Disb Office	24	New Jersey	
Office	24	New Jersey	
Dept	0500	Litigation	
Profit Center	GT	Greenberg Traurig - General	
Project			

Std Amt	$286.01	Currency Code	USD
Base Amt	$286.01	Base Qty	0.000000
Tobill Amt	$286.01		
Billed Amt	$286.01	Bill Qty	0.000000

Dis

WII

Session
Source Tran Type
Disb Type Code
Reference
Date
Post Date
Hold Date
Latest Period
Bill Date
Prebill Num
Bill Num

Narrative
WestlawNext Research by WONG,ERIC.

Disbursement Card

Filter
Disb ID 43455675

Disbursement Details

Client	151131	Exemption (1)	
Matter	010100		
Entry Empl	4688	Fernandez, Annie	
Auth Empl			
Disb Empl	EDX	Wong, Eric	
Billed Empl	EDX	Wong, Eric	
Disb Office	24	New Jersey	
Office	24	New Jersey	Session
Dept	0500	Litigation	Source Tran Type
Profit Center	GT	Greenberg Traurig - General	Disb Type Code
Project			Reference
			Date
Std Amt	$402.33	Currency Code USD	Post Date
Base Amt	$402.33	Base Qty 0.000000	Hold Date
Tobill Amt	$402.33		Latest Period
Billed Amt	$402.33	Bill Qty 0.000000	Bill Date
			Prebill Num
			Bill Num

Dis

WII

Narrative
WestlawNext Research by WONG,ERIC.

Record of Payments

Firm	Total
Chamlin Rosen Uliano & Witherington	$7,052
Friedman Kaplan Seiler & Adelman LLP	$51,378
Greenberg Traurig LLP	$128,130
Hellring Lindeman Goldstein & Siegal LLP	$22,538
Javerbaum Wurgaft Hicks Kahn Wikstrom & Sinins	$44,190
Kobre & Kim LLP	$20,971
Kostelanetz & Fink, LLP	$16,038
McKenna, DuPont, Higgins and Stone, P.C.	$1,512
Mintz & Gold LLP	$25,632
Morrison & Foerster LLP	$90,636
Podvey Meanor Catenacci Hildne Cocoziello & Chattman PC	$18,435
Richards, Kibbe & Orbe LLP	$19,547
Stark & Stark Attorney at Law	$15,160
Szaferman, Lakind, Blumstein & Bladder, PC	$1,184
Walder Hayden, PA	$5,386
Zuckerman Spaeder LLP	$7,115
Total	**$474,903**