FOI #15282

Torres Rojas, Genara

From: Andrea Bernstein [mailto:abernstein@wnyc.org]
Sent: Wednesday, September 03, 2014 12:41 PM
To: Duffy, Daniel
Cc: Valens, Chris
Subject: FOIL REQUEST

September 3, 2014

Daniel Duffy
FOI Administrator
Port Authority of New York and New Jersey
225 Park Avenue South
New York, NY 10003

Dear Mr. Duffy,

Under the Freedom of Information Law of the State of New York and the Open Public Records Act of the State of New Jersey, I hereby request any and all records of bills submitted, and records of payments made to outside attorneys for Port Authority staff, past or present, as the result of lane closures of the George Washington Bridge in September 2013 from July 1, 2014 through the present date.

I request the records whether they exist in paper or electronic form, in "written or printed book, document, drawing, map, plan, photograph, microfilm, data processed or imaged processed document, information stored or maintained electronically or by sound recording or in a similar device, or any copy thereof, that has been made, generated, maintained, received in the course of transacting official business and kept on file."

There is nothing in this request "would constitute an unwarranted invasion of personal privacy or an individual or individuals." Indeed, similar records have already been deemed releasable under OPRA, and have been released, by the New Jersey Attorney General's office. Information that would reveal personal information about the employee represented was redacted by the AG, and I expect that you would redact it too. However, that does not mean that the entire record is exempt from release, as the NJ AG has determined.

Moreover, as there is a substantial sum of tollpayer and/or taxpayer dollars involved, release of these records is a matter of public record and interest.

This request is made pursuant to the resolution by the Board of Commissioners of the Port Authority of New York and New Jersey approved on 3/29/2012 and the Port Authority by-laws, which state that the Port Authority shall abide by a freedom of information code consistent with the freedom of information laws of New York and New Jersey.

As I am a journalist and working on deadline, I would prefer that you release any records in electronic form in the most timely manner possible.

Moreover, if any portion of the documents releasable under this request shall be redacted, you must supply reasons under the Port Authority code and/or FOIL for the specific redaction.

Sincerely

Andrea Bernstein (by electronic signature)

Andrea Bernstein, Senior Editor, Politics & Policy

W N Y C New York Public Radio

☎ *+1 646 829 4457 (office)*
☎ *+1 917 653 0014 (cell)*
160 Varick Street, New York, 10013

abernstein@wnyc.org

@AndreaWNYC

THE PORT AUTHORITY OF NY & NJ

FOI Administrator

September 8, 2014

Ms. Andrea Bernstein
WNYC New York Public Radio
160 Varick Street
New York, NY 10013

Re: Freedom of Information Reference No. 15282

Dear Ms. Bernstein:

This is in response to your September 3, 2014 request, which has been processed under the Port Authority's Freedom of Information Code (the "Code", copy attached) for copies of "any and all records of bills submitted, and records of payments made to outside attorneys for Port Authority staff, past or present, as the result of lane closures of the George Washington Bridge in September 2013 from July 1, 2014 through the present date."

Material responsive to your request and available under the Code can be found on the Port Authority's website at http://www.panynj.gov/corporate-information/foi/15282-O.pdf. Paper copies of the available records are available upon request.

Certain portions of the material responsive to your request are exempt from disclosure pursuant to exemption (1) of the Code.

Please refer to the above FOI reference number in any future correspondence relating to your request.

Very truly yours,

Daniel D. Duffy
FOI Administrator

Attachment

225 Park Avenue South, 17th FL
New York, NY 10003
T: 212 435 3642 F: 212 435 7555

PODVEY MEANOR CATENACCI HILDNER COCOZIELLO & CHATTMAN P.C

The Legal Center
One Riverfront Plaza - Suite 800
Newark, New Jersey 07102

(973) 623-1000

August 18, 2014
Bill Number 116729

Exemption (1)

PROFESSIONAL SERVICES

			Rate	Hours	
07/18/2014	DPC				
		Exemption (1)	330.00	0.40	132.00
07/25/2014	DPC		330.00	0.30	99.00
				0.70	231.00

TIMEKEEPER RECAP

Timekeeper	Hours	Rate	Total
Damian P. Conforti	0.70	$330.00	$231.00

Total Due	231.00
Previous Balance	$131.50

PAYMENTS

08/04/2014	Payment Received - Thank You	-131.50
	Less 20% Port Authority Discount Of Services Rendered	-46.20
	TOTAL BALANCE DUE	$184.80

SZAFERMAN LAKIND TRUE COUNSEL®

Szaferman, Lakind, Blumstein & Blader, P.C.
Quakerbridge Executive Center
101 Grovers Mill Rd, Suite 200
Lawrenceville, NJ 08648

Tel: 609-275-0400
Fax: 609-275-4511
www.szaferman.com

August 01, 2014

Invoice# 188354 DSS

Billing through 07/31/2014

PROFESSIONAL SERVICES

07/21/2014 DSS	1.40	hrs.	$400.00	$560.00
Exemption (1)				
07/22/2014 DSS	0.60	hrs.	$400.00	$240.00
07/23/2014 DSS	1.70	hrs.	$400.00	$680.00
				$1,480.00

Billing Summary

Total professional services	$1,480.00
Professional courtesy discount	$296.00 CR
Total of new charges for this invoice	**$1,184.00**
Total balance now due	$1,184.00

Make checks payable to SZAFERMAN LAKIND. Please indicate client & invoice number on your check.

ZUCKERMAN SPAEDER LLP
1185 Avenue of the Americas 31st Floor, NEW YORK, NY 10036-2603
212.704.9600 212.704.4256 fax www.zuckerman.com

July 17, 2014

Invoice:294965

Exemption (1)

STATEMENT

For professional services rendered as set forth in the attached itemization and expenses incurred through June 30, 2014.

By Margaret Lynaugh
4.25 hours at $550.00 per hour $ 2,337.50

TOTAL FEES	$ 2,337.50
Less Professional Courtesy	$ -467.50
TOTAL FEES	$ 1,870.00
TOTAL EXPENSES	$ 0.00
TOTAL FEES AND EXPENSES THIS INVOICE	$ 1,870.00

Please Submit Remittance to:

Zuckerman Spaeder LLP
1800 M Street, N.W.
Washington, DC 20036

(202) 778-1800

Exemption (1)

Please include invoice number in description
Fax number for remittance advice: (202) 822-8106

Invoice No: 294965
Invoice Total: $1,870.00

PLEASE RETURN THIS PAGE WITH PAYMENT

Margaret Lynaugh

06/06/14	3.00
06/07/14	1.25

Exemption (1)

GT GreenbergTraurig

Invoice No : 3699209

Bill Date : July 16, 2014

INVOICE

Exemption (1)

Legal Services through June 30, 2014:

	$	9,435.50
Discount per agreed upon blended rate of $490/hr(41.32%):	$	(3,898.50)
Total Fees:	$	5,537.00

Expenses:

Photocopy Charges	579.45		
Total Expenses:		$	579.45
Current Invoice:		**$**	**6,116.45**

* * * * *

GB:LV

GT GreenbergTraurig

Invoice No.: 3699209

Exemption (1)

Summary of Fees (Standard Rates)

Timekeeper	Hours	Rate	Amount
Geoffrey Berman	11.30	835.00	9,435.50
Totals:	11.30		$ 9,435.50

* * * * *

Summary of Fees (Discounted Rates)

Timekeeper	Hours	Rate	Amount
Geoffrey Berman	11.30	490.00	5,537.00
Totals:	11.30		$ 5,537.00

GB-LV

Description of Professional Services Rendered:

DATE	TIMEKEEPER	DESCRIPTION	HOURS
06/02/14	Geoffrey Berman	Exemption (1)	2.60
06/03/14	Geoffrey Berman		2.10
06/20/14	Geoffrey Berman		1.70
06/30/14	Geoffrey Berman		4.90
		Total Time:	11.30

Exemption (1)

Description of Expenses Billed:

DATE	DESCRIPTION			AMOUNT
06/27/14	Copy Charges; 3863 Pages		$	579.45
		Total Expenses:	$	579.45

GT GreenbergTraurig

Invoice No.: 3699209

Exemption (1)

GB:LV

MORRISON | FOERSTER

P.O. BOX 742335
LOS ANGELES
CALIFORNIA 90074-2335

TELEPHONE: 415.268.7000
FACSIMILE: 415.268.7522

WWW.MOFO.COM

MORRISON & FOERSTER LLP

NEW YORK, SAN FRANCISCO,
LOS ANGELES, PALO ALTO,
SAN DIEGO, WASHINGTON D.C.,
DENVER, NORTHERN VIRGINIA,
SACRAMENTO

TOKYO, BEIJING, SHANGHAI,
HONG KONG, SINGAPORE

LONDON, BRUSSELS, BERLIN

Invoice Number: 5346164
Invoice Date: June 30, 2014

Exemption (1)

For Professional Services Rendered through May 31, 2014

	U.S.Dollars
Original Fees	4,205.00
Fee Discount Value	-841.00
Current Fees Due	3,364.00
Total This Invoice	**3,364.00**

MORRISON | FOERSTER

Invoice Number: 5346164
Invoice Date: June 30, 2014

Time Detail

Date	Services	Timekeeper	Hours	Value
28-Apr-2014		Chan, David	0.75	168.00
30-Apr-2014	Exemption (1)	Chan, David	1.25	280.00
01-May-2014		Tepfer, Cameron Andrew	0.50	166.00
02-May-2014		Chan, David	3.50	784.00
02-May-2014		Tepfer, Cameron Andrew	4.25	1,411.00
05-May-2014		Gerschwer, Lawrence	0.75	555.00
		Total Fees		3,364.00

MORRISON | FOERSTER

Invoice Number: 5346164
Invoice Date: June 30, 2014

Exemption (1)

Timekeeper Summary

No.	Name	Hours	Standard Rate	Standard Value	Discount Rate	Discount Value
13542	Gerschwer, Lawrence	0.75	925.00	693.75	740.00	555.00
17318	Tepfer, Cameron Andrew	4.75	415.00	1,971.25	332.00	1,577.00
10941	Chan, David	5.50	280.00	1,540.00	224.00	1,232.00
	TOTAL	**11.00**		**4,205.00**		**3,364.00**

Total This Invoice **USD** **3,364.00**

MORRISON | FOERSTER

Invoice Number: 5346164
Invoice Date: June 30, 2014

Exemption (1)

For your convenience, we have listed below previous invoices on this matter which our records show as outstanding and the total balance due on this account. If you have already submitted payment, we appreciate your promptness. If your records are not in agreement, or if we can provide additional assistance, please call our Billing Department at (415)-268-2594 or (866)-314-5320.

Date	Invoice Number	Original Invoice Amount	Payments Applied	Amount Outstanding
30-Jun-14	5346164	USD 3,364.00	USD 0.00	USD 3,364.00